HOUSING PRESSURE, RESIDENTIAL DISPLACEMENT AND INDUSTRY CITY

Working group convened by Council Member Carlos Menchaca
July 24, 2019
AGENDA

- Welcome, introductions, goals for today
- **Pairs: your housing story**
- Gentrification, Displacement and Sunset Park Housing Conditions
- **Breakout: Neighborhood Needs**
- Tools to Address Housing Needs and Industry City’s role
- **Breakout groups: Sunset Park housing strategies**
- **Group discussion: Housing Priorities**
GOALS FOR TODAY

1. Understand Sunset Park’s housing trends and concerns
2. Understand existing strategies and tools to address housing concerns
3. Discuss the role of IC and the City in housing concerns
4. Identify priority needs and actions to address housing risk in Sunset Park, regardless of rezoning Industry City
BREAKOUT #1

Tell your housing story to a partner
GENTRIFICATION AND DISPLACEMENT IN SUNSET PARK
WHAT DOES THE 197-A PLAN HAVE TO SAY ABOUT HOUSING?
HOUSING IN THE 197-A PLAN

2007
“Population growth in CD7 over the past ten years has far exceeded the pace of residential development and placed a premium on existing housing… Fears of gentrification and displacement grow as residents squeezed out of high-rent neighborhoods elsewhere in New York City and higher income households pursuing homeownership opportunities seek housing in the area. Affordability is currently seen as the most pressing housing issue”
NOT MUCH HAS CHANGED.
197-A PLAN: HOUSING RECOMMENDATIONS

A. Preserve and maintain existing affordable housing in the waterfront study area.

B. Maximize as-of-right development opportunities in the waterfront study area.

C. Explore additional development opportunities and resources in other parts of Community District 7, balancing the need for affordable housing with the need to preserve neighborhood character and view corridors.

D. Increase government support for affordable housing preservation and development in Community District 7.
IS GENTRIFICATION HAPPENING IN SUNSET PARK? WHAT ABOUT DISPLACEMENT?

WILL MORE OF THESE THINGS HAPPEN WITH A REZONING OF IC THAN WITHOUT IT?
WHAT IS GENTRIFICATION? WHAT IS DISPLACEMENT?

**Gentrification**

The transition of an area and its population to a state of greater economic value

*Often associated with new people and new real estate investment*

**Direct displacement**

Direct removal of residents via building demolition etc.

**Indirect displacement**

Residents relocating from an area due to “changing socioeconomic conditions” (harassment, rent increase, etc.)
WHAT IS GENTRIFICATION? WHAT IS DISPLACEMENT?

Gentrification
The transition of an area and its population to greater economic value
Often associated with new people and new real estate investment

‘Indirect displacement’ is generally the most common and insidious housing impact facing gentrifying neighborhoods

Direct displacement
Direct removal of residents via building demolition, etc.

Indirect displacement
Residents relocating from an area due to “changing socioeconomic conditions” (harassment, rent increase, etc.)
IS GENTRIFICATION HAPPENING IN SUNSET PARK? WHAT ABOUT DISPLACEMENT?

WILL MORE OF THESE THINGS HAPPEN WITH A REZONING OF IC THAN WITHOUT IT?
MEASURING DISPLACEMENT IS REALLY HARD

Gentrification, Displacement, and the Role of Public Investment
Miriam Zuk, Ariel H. Bierbaum, Karen Chapple, Karolina Gorska, and Anastasia Loukaitou-Sideris


Why It’s So Hard to Measure Residential Displacement
ERIC JAFFE  AUG 13, 2015
But wait, I heard that New York City requires an analysis of indirect residential displacement through the environmental review process!

So we should know what impact IC will have if the Environmental Impact Statement comes out right?
1. **ENVIRONMENTAL REVIEW**

   a) Applicant must conduct an analysis of anticipated environmental impacts
   
   b) NYC provides a detailed scope and methodology for this review *(City Environmental Quality Review Technical Manual)*

   c) Before ULURP, the applicant is preparing an Environmental Impact Statement, which describes the findings of the environmental analysis

   d) When an application is Certified, ULURP beings, and the Draft Environmental Impact Statement (EIS) is made public

   e) If the project is expected to have "significant impact" in any area, the applicant must provide "mitigations" for those specific impacts
322. Indirect Displacement

322.1. Indirect Residential Displacement

The objective of the indirect residential displacement analysis is to determine whether the project may either introduce a trend or accelerate a trend of changing socioeconomic conditions that may potentially displace a vulnerable population to the extent that the socioeconomics of the neighborhood would change. Generally, an indirect residential displacement analysis is performed in cases in which the potential impact may be experienced by renters living in units unprotected by rent control, rent stabilization, or other government regulations, or whose incomes or poverty status indicate that they may not support housing increases. Examples of projects where a detailed assessment was conducted include the Williamsburg Land Use and Waterfront Plan, which can be found at [http://nyc.gov/html/dcp/pdf/greenpointwill/gw_feis_ch_03.pdf](http://nyc.gov/html/dcp/pdf/greenpointwill/gw_feis_ch_03.pdf), and the 125th Street Zoning, which can be found at [http://nyc.gov/html/dcp/pdf/env_review/125th/125th.pdf](http://nyc.gov/html/dcp/pdf/env_review/125th/125th.pdf)

In all cases, the potential for indirect displacement depends not only on the characteristics of the study area, but on the characteristics of the proposed project. Usually, the characteristics of the proposed project are known—the objective of the preliminary assessment, then, is to identify information about conditions in the study area so that the effect of the change in the proposed project relative to expected future conditions in the study area can be assessed. At this stage, an analysis of data at the study area level is generally adequate, not necessarily detailed census tract-level descriptions. Although the characteristics of the population and housing may vary depending on the proposed project, information about these characteristics typically include the following:
Unfortunately, the methodology is deeply flawed
THE ENVIRONMENTAL IMPACT STATEMENT WILL NOT HELP US UNDERSTAND DISPLACEMENT

Understanding the CEQR methodology—even before seeing the EIS—we can know that the Industry City EIS will indicate that there will be no significant impact on indirect displacement from the proposed rezoning.

If we want to understand or address housing, we can’t rely on the Environmental Review process
ARE THERE OTHER WAYS TO UNDERSTAND RESIDENTIAL DISPLACEMENT RISK?
### Displacement and Gentrification Census Tract Typologies

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Typology (Tract Income Level)</th>
<th>Typology Criteria</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td><strong>Not Losing Low-Income Households (Low Income)</strong></td>
<td>Pop in 2000-500&lt;br&gt;Low Income Tract in 2016&lt;br&gt;Not classified as At Risk or Ongoing Gentrification or Displacement</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>At Risk of Gentrification (Low Income)</strong></td>
<td>Pop in 2016 &gt; 500&lt;br&gt;Low Income Tract in 2016&lt;br&gt;Vulnerable in 2016 (Defined in Appendix)&lt;br&gt;“Not market” from 2000 to 2016&lt;br&gt;Not currently undergoing displacement or ongoing gentrification</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Ongoing Displacement of Low-Income Households (Low Income)</strong></td>
<td>Pop in 2000 &gt; 500&lt;br&gt;Low Income Tract in 2016&lt;br&gt;Loss of LI households 2000-2016 (absolute loss)&lt;br&gt;Few signs of gentrification occurring</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Ongoing Gentrification (Low Income)</strong></td>
<td>Pop in 2000 or 2016 &gt; 500&lt;br&gt;Low Income Tract in 2016&lt;br&gt;Gentrified in 1990-2000 or 2000-2016 (Defined in Appendix)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Advanced Gentrification (Moderate to High Income)</strong></td>
<td>Pop in 2000 or 2016 &gt; 500&lt;br&gt;Moderate to High Income Tract in 2016&lt;br&gt;Gentrified in 1990-2000 or 2000-2016 (Defined in Appendix)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Stable Exclusion (Moderate to High Income)</strong></td>
<td>Pop in 2000-500&lt;br&gt;Moderate to High Income Tract in 2016&lt;br&gt;Not classified as Ongoing Exclusion</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Ongoing Exclusion (Moderate to High Income)</strong></td>
<td>Pop in 2000 &gt; 500&lt;br&gt;Moderate to High Income Tract in 2016&lt;br&gt;Loss of LI households 2000-2016 (absolute loss)&lt;br&gt;LI migration rate (percent of all migration to tract that was LI) in 2016 &lt; in 2000</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Super Gentrification or Exclusion (Very High Income)</strong></td>
<td>Pop in 2000 &gt; 500&lt;br&gt;Median household income &gt; 200% of regional median in 2016&lt;br&gt;Indicators of Gentrification or Exclusion</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
SUNSET PARK HOUSING CONDITIONS AND CONCERNS
2-family homes
No rent regulation
SUNSET PARK HOUSING TYPOLOGIES

2- and 3- family homes
No rent regulation
6+ unit multifamily
25 apartments
Project Based Section 8
(Subsidized by Federal Government, Housing and Urban Development (HUD))
Rent Stabilization

- New York State law. Creates rent increase limits and offers tenants the right to renew their lease. Much more common than rent control.

Rent control

- New York State law. Creates rent increase limits and offers tenants the right to renew their lease.

Subsidies can help fund housing construction (one time cost) or help pay the rent over time.

Sources of subsidy:

- Federal $ (HUD)
- State $ (HCR, 421-a)
- City $ (HPD, etc.)
## SUNSET PARK POPULATION AND HOUSING STATS*

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Indicator</th>
<th>Geography</th>
<th>Year</th>
<th>Value</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Population</td>
<td>CB7</td>
<td>2017</td>
<td>144,332</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Percent Foreign-born</td>
<td>CB7</td>
<td>2016</td>
<td>55.8%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Total Housing units</td>
<td>CB7</td>
<td>2017</td>
<td>46,064</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Percent of Households Renting</td>
<td>CB7</td>
<td>2017</td>
<td>70.1%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Units in 1-4 Family Homes</td>
<td>CB7</td>
<td>2017</td>
<td>22,000</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Percent Market Rate Units (not rent regulated)</td>
<td>CB7</td>
<td>2017</td>
<td>63.9%</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Source: NYU Furman Center, Neighborhood Data Profiles except Percent Foreign-born (U.S. Census Bureau American Community Survey 2012-2016)

* It is generally understood that communities with high immigrant populations tend to be undercounted by the U.S. Census Bureau.
63.9% of Sunset Park’s homes and apartments are privately owned and—because they are in buildings with fewer than 6 units—not subject to rent regulation laws.
## CB7 HOUSING VULNERABILITIES AND RISKS

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Indicator</th>
<th>Geography</th>
<th>Year</th>
<th>Value</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Serious Housing Code Violations (per 1,000 units)</td>
<td>CB7</td>
<td>2018</td>
<td>191.2*</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Percent Change in Price per sf Residential Sales</td>
<td>CB7</td>
<td>2016-2018</td>
<td>34.4%**</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Percent Change in Median Asking Rent</td>
<td>CB7</td>
<td>2010-2018</td>
<td>42%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Number of At-Risk HUD Subsidized Units</td>
<td>CB7</td>
<td>2019-2023</td>
<td>525 **</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Percent of Renter Households Crowded</td>
<td>CB7</td>
<td>2017</td>
<td>14.9%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Percent of Households with Rent Burden (&gt;30$ gross income)</td>
<td>CB7</td>
<td>2017</td>
<td>56.0%</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Indicator</th>
<th>Geography</th>
<th>Year</th>
<th>Value</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Housing Vacancy Rate</td>
<td>CB7</td>
<td>2017</td>
<td>2.4%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Housing Vacancy Rate</td>
<td>BK/NYC</td>
<td>2017</td>
<td>3.4% / 3.5%</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

* Sunset Park is in Top 10 of all Community Districts for this indicator
** Sunset Park is in Top 20 of all Community Districts for this indicator

Source: All data points from Association for Neighborhood and Housing Development, 2019 except Median Asking Rent (streeteasy.com) and Housing Vacancy Rates and Percent Change Median Asking Rent (Furman Center)
RENTS FOR ALL KINDS OF APARTMENTS IN CB7 HAVE BEEN GOING UP SINCE 2005

Median Rent by Unit Type, 2009 - 2017 (CB7)

Source: NYU Furman Center, Neighborhood Data Profiles
RENTS HAVE BEEN TRENDING UPWARD IN SUNSET PARK AND BROOKLYN GENERALLY SINCE 2010

Median Asking Rent Jan 2010 - Apr 2019, Sunset Park & Brooklyn

Rent data source: Streeteasy.com
WHAT HOUSING PRESSURES DO SUNSET PARK RESIDENTS FACE?

- Rising rents
- Difficulty relocating in the neighborhood
- Landlord harassment/neglect and poor housing conditions
- Eviction
- Property tax increase
- Others?
BREAKOUT #2

Discuss and identify priority housing concerns/needs in Sunset Park. Is displacement the main concern? If so, who is at risk of displacement? Why?
SUNSET PARK HOUSING AND INDUSTRY CITY
## Industry City Jobs and Housing

### Industry City Existing and Proposed

**Self reported data**

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th>Year</th>
<th>Value</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Jobs on Site</td>
<td>2013</td>
<td>1,900</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Actual on site jobs</td>
<td>2019</td>
<td>7,500</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Percent of employees who live in SP</td>
<td>2017</td>
<td>10%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Percent of employees who live in Southwest BK</td>
<td>2017</td>
<td>35%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Projected jobs on site with rezoning</td>
<td>2018</td>
<td>13,000</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Proposed housing units with rezoning</td>
<td></td>
<td>0</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

**Source:** Industry City self reporting and Industry City’s website sunsetparkopportunity.com

### Sunset Park Jobs

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Total jobs in ‘greater Sunset Park area’</th>
<th>Year</th>
<th>Number</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>2015</td>
<td>39,000</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

**Source:** Office of New York State Comptroller, 2016
HAS INDUSTRY CITY MADE SUNSET PARK’S RENTS INCREASE FASTER THAN THEY WOULD HAVE OTHERWISE?
Analysis

Using market rate housing rent data in Sunset Park and Brooklyn since 2010, have rents in Sunset Park increased faster than in Brooklyn since Industry City announced their development plans in 2015?

This is just one of many ways you could attempt to answer this question.
Methodology

1. Obtain monthly median market rate rent price data from streeteasy.com for 2010-2019 for Sunset Park and Brooklyn
2. Graph this data using Microsoft Excel and have the program create trend lines for these data sets and provide the equation that describes the trend line.
3. Assume that if there is an impact from Industry City on local housing prices, it would likely begin after their announcement of their $1B redevelopment plans in early 2015.
4. Compare the trends for 2010-2019 with trends for 2010-2015 and 2015-2019 to understand if there are differences in the direction and pace of changing rents before and after Industry City announced redevelopment plans.
A NOTE ABOUT UNDERSTANDING THIS ANALYSIS.

This is an example of an equation that describes how data is trending over time:

\[ Y = 2.76X + 2332.3 \]

\[ R^2 = 0.37 \]

FOCUS ON THE X AND THE R²

The number before the X tells us if the data is trending up or down (positive or negative) and how fast it is trending (a bigger number means “faster”)

The R² value is telling us how CONFIDENT we can be that this equation is a good fit for the data. If the R² value is below .4, we can’t be very confident. If it’s over .7, we can be quite confident.

This is just one of many ways you could attempt to answer this question! Find others! Share them.
Median Asking Rent Jan 2010 - Apr 2019
Sunset Park & Brooklyn

Rent data source: Streeteasy.com
We can be somewhat confident that Sunset Park’s median asking rent is growing faster than BK generally between 2010 and 2019.

Rent data source: Streeteasy.com
Jan 2015: Industry City announces their $1Billion redevelopment plans

Rent data source: Streeteasy.com
Median Asking Rent Jan 2010 - Jan 2015
Sunset Park & Brooklyn

y = 7.5762x + 2197.9
R² = 0.615

y = 8.7396x + 1344.9
R² = 0.6363

Source: Streeteasy.com
We can be quite confident that Sunset Park’s asking rents grew about 15% faster than Brooklyn’s in this period.
Median Asking Rent Jan 2015 - Apr 2019
Sunset Park & Brooklyn

- $0
- $500
- $1,000
- $1,500
- $2,000
- $2,500
- $3,000

y = -0.7335x + 2573.6
R² = 0.0315

y = 2.1175x + 1941.4
R² = 0.149

Source: Streeteasy.com
y = -0.7335x + 2573.6
$R^2 = 0.0315$

y = 2.1175x + 1941.4
$R^2 = 0.149$

Not confident that while BK’s rent was declining, Sunset Park’s rents were rising

Source: Streeteasy.com
Since 2010, Sunset Park has experienced faster market rent increases than the borough overall.

With this data, we can’t confidently state that Sunset Park’s rent increases have been faster after Industry City’s development announcement is faster than before.
SO, INDUSTRY CITY HAS HAD NO IMPACT ON HOUSING?

Not necessarily! This particular data analysis just doesn’t support the claim.

Housing trends are very complex and impacted by lots of variables.
And we know Industry City is used for marketing housing in Sunset Park.
We asked the working group: Do you believe the proposed rezoning will have housing impacts? Why or why not?
Do you believe that the proposed private, commercial rezoning on the waterfront will have impacts on housing affordability in Sunset Park?

9 responses

- Yes: 8 (88.9%)
- Not sure: 1 (11.1%)
- No: 0 (0%)
WORKING GROUP RESPONSES--
“YES BECAUSE:

- It’s already happening: advocates have seen “increase in services for tenant counseling, displacement, organizing, harassment, evictions, and basic tenant rights”
- “I think it’s evident in the way realtors market the neighborhood currently”
- “Real estate speculation/gentrification has been happening in SP for a long time now...However, I do think IC's presence exacerbates the issue”
- “Development...will attract people who work at Industry City to live nearby”
- “More high skilled jobs means more high skilled middle/upper class residents who will look for places to live in affordable Sunset Park”
- “Property developers will double down on trying to purchase buildings to flip here.”
- “Increases in property value/property taxes = higher rents”
SO, HAS INDUSTRY CITY MADE SUNSET PARK’S RENTS INCREASE FASTER THAN THEY WOULD HAVE OTHERWISE?

It’s complicated. But real estate brokers see IC as an amenity, and a lot of Sunset Park residents feel strongly that it has.
EXISTING TOOLS THAT ADDRESS HOUSING RISK AND VULNERABILITY
Note:

People use the term “affordable housing” a lot. They often don’t define what they mean.

Let’s be specific. “Affordable” generally refers to

1. **Income restricted housing** (you can only rent the apartment if your income is the right level. Income level restrictions become very important)

2. **Rent regulated housing** (rents cannot be raised dramatically overnight, making it easier for tenants to manage increases and reducing the incentive for landlord harassment. Enforcement of these regulations are the critical issue.)
THREE APPROACHES TO ADDRESSING HOUSING PRESSURE

1. Build more housing (usually a mix of affordable and market rate)

2. Protect existing “affordable” housing (this could be rent regulated, subsidized, or ‘naturally’ affordable in some other way.)

3. Advocate for and protect tenants (know your rights, legal support, etc.)
## REVIEW OF 197-A PLAN HOUSING STRATEGIES

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Build More Housing</th>
<th>Protect Existing Housing</th>
<th>Advocate for Tenants</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Maximize as-of-right development opportunities in the waterfront study area.</td>
<td>Preserve and maintain existing affordable housing in the waterfront study area.</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Explore additional development opportunities and resources in other parts of Community District 7</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Increase government support for affordable housing preservation and development in Community District 7</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
INSTITUTIONS THAT CAN SUPPORT HOUSING CONSTRUCTION AND ADVOCACY

- State
- Local
- Private
NYS TENANT PROTECTION ACT: MAJOR WIN FOR TENANTS
NYS 2019 Tenant Protection Act

PROTECTS TENANTS FROM UNDUE RENT INCREASES

• Major Capital Improvement/Individual Apartment Improvement reform
• Preferential rent reform
• 30 day rent increase requirements (even market rate units)
PROTECTS TENANTS FROM HARASSMENT

- High-rent deregulation reform
- Bans tenant blacklists
- Unlawful eviction is now a crime, punishable by up to $10,000
PROTECTS TENANTS IN HOUSING COURT

• Gives more time to find a lawyer, fix lease violation, pay back rent
• Judges can push back an eviction 12 months
Outreach and education are needed!
MANDATORY INCLUSIONARY HOUSING

• Became law in 2017

• Requires all residential rezonings to include a percentage of income-restricted housing

• Relies on private developers to provide permanently income-restricted housing

• This program has been the subject of significant critique that the income levels for the income-restricted housing do not reflect the actual needs of New Yorkers facing housing instability
LOCALIZED COMMITMENTS

• Often through neighborhood wide rezonings

• City of New York negotiates specific suite of commitments as part of neighborhood plan

• New online Commitments Tracker creates greater opportunities for transparency and accountability
EXAMPLES OF CITY AGENCY COMMITMENTS

- **Commit to developing affordable housing**
  - Commit to developing public land in the community district/surrounding area with 100% affordable housing – HPD
  - Funding for local mission-driven developers to build affordable housing – HPD
  - Basement legalization pilot program – HPD

- **Anti-displacement legal services**
  - Push to get Right to Counsel (Universal Access to Counsel) included in local zip codes before 2022 - HRA
  - Expand anti-displacement legal services in general – HRA

- **Funding for anti-displacement organizing**
  - Partners in Preservation – HPD

- **Anti-displacement policies**
  - Certificate of No Harassment – HPD
  - Neighborhood Pillars program - HPD
## REVIEW OF CITY STRATEGIES AND TOOLS

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Build More Housing</th>
<th>Protect Existing Housing</th>
<th>Advocate for Tenants</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Commit to developing <strong>public land</strong> in the community district/surrounding area with 100% affordable housing</td>
<td><strong>Certificate of No Harassment</strong>&lt;br&gt;Requires building owners to prove that they have not harassed or pressured tenants, and subtenants alike, to vacate in order to carry out intended changes to the property. If a landlord/owner is found to have harassed occupants of the building, they will not be able to request those building permits for 5 years.</td>
<td><strong>Right to Counsel</strong>&lt;br&gt;Helps tenant gain free access to legal assistance with housing cases, to combat harassment and wrongful eviction from their homes. Legislation passed in 2017 requiring full representation for any tenant facing eviction whose household income does not exceed 200 percent of the federal poverty guideline. Availability is limited by zip code.</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

**Funding** for local mission-driven developers to build affordable housing<br><br>**Neighborhood Pillars program**<br>The $275 million public-private fund program launched in late 2018 with a plan to finance acquisition of approximately 1,000 homes annually, totaling 7,500 homes over the next 8 years -- locking in long term affordability.<br><br>**Funding for anti-displacement organizing**
Private Actors
TECH COMPANIES TAKE RESPONSIBILITY FOR HOUSING PRESSURE

Google Pledges to Invest $1 Billion to Ease Bay Area Housing Crisis
June 18, 2019

Microsoft Pledges $500 Million for Affordable Housing in Seattle Area
Jan. 16, 2019
HOUSING SUNSET PARK

Land Use

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Goals</th>
<th>Objectives</th>
<th>Timeline</th>
<th>Actions</th>
<th>Agency or Private Entity</th>
<th>Funding Type / Sources</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Preservation</td>
<td>Acquisition of existing housing units to preserve affordability</td>
<td>Short to medium term</td>
<td>Approach current owners</td>
<td>NYC Housing Preservation &amp; Development (HPD), NYC Housing Development Corporation (HDC)</td>
<td>HPD Fillars, NYC Acquisition Fund</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>New Production</td>
<td>Production of new housing units</td>
<td>Short to medium term</td>
<td>Add capacity for residential density where contextually appropriate</td>
<td>Dept. of City Planning (DOP), NYC HDO, NYC HPD, Private Developers</td>
<td>Tax Exempt Bonds, Qualified Opportunity Fund, Private Capital, Tax Exemptions and or Abatements</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Housing Program Design</td>
<td>Design a housing program to address community need</td>
<td>Medium to long term</td>
<td>Work with state and local agencies to develop housing programs that target neighborhood income demographics</td>
<td>DHCR, HPD, HDC</td>
<td>N/A - Policy design</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Expanding and Strengthening Tenant Protections</td>
<td>Just Cause Eviction Legislation</td>
<td>Short to medium term</td>
<td>State Senate and local government support for Good Cause Eviction proposal</td>
<td>State &amp; Local Government, Elated Officials, NY City Council</td>
<td>N/A - Legislative action</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Rent Stabilization enforcement</td>
<td>Short to medium term</td>
<td>Renewal of rent stabilization laws with amendments expanding tenant protections</td>
<td>State &amp; Local Government &amp; Elected Officials</td>
<td>N/A - Legislative action</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Tenant Rights Advocacy</td>
<td>Short to medium term</td>
<td>City and State funding for local non-for profit organizations in affected neighborhoods</td>
<td>HPD &amp; Department of Housing and Community Renewal (DHCR)</td>
<td>HPD Partners in Preservation Pilot Program</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Creation of a local restricted unit database</td>
<td>Short to medium term</td>
<td>Establish a research and data team to track rent-restricted units</td>
<td>DHCR, HPD, Brooklyn Community Board 7</td>
<td>Brooklyn Borough President, City Council</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Nourit Sassenet Park 197-A Plan</td>
<td>Realization plan with community goals</td>
<td>Long term</td>
<td>Community Stakeholder outreach, Assess</td>
<td>NY City Council, City Planning Commission (CPC), NYC DCP, Brooklyn Community Board 7</td>
<td>N/A</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Financing Programs

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Goals</th>
<th>Objectives</th>
<th>Timeline</th>
<th>Actions</th>
<th>Agency or Private Entity</th>
<th>Funding Type</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Qualified Opportunity Fund</td>
<td>Establish a fund to attract investment in Brooklyn Community Board</td>
<td>Medium to long term</td>
<td>Designate a fund manager. Outline fund objectives.</td>
<td>Internal Revenue Service (IRS), fund manager, investors</td>
<td>Private investment</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Transfer of Development Rights</td>
<td>Acquire and warehouse development capacity</td>
<td>Medium to long term</td>
<td>Purchase development rights from underused sites, to be redirected to development areas approved by the community</td>
<td>DCP, HPD, NY City Council</td>
<td>HPD, EDC</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
INDUSTRY CITY’S ROLE
Working group survey

What should we expect from industry city?
WHAT SHOULD WE EXPECT?

“At the very least *acknowledge* their part in displacement of community residents while profiting from their investments”

“I think it’s important for them to *recognize* that while they’re not necessarily the cause of displacement they’re contributing to it. “
WHAT SHOULD WE EXPECT?

“Funding”

“Investment fund”

“Contributions to funds to mitigate displacement…and build new housing”
WHAT SHOULD WE EXPECT?

“I think we should expect that it's not their number one priority to examine and mitigate displacement”
Working group survey

What would Industry City have to provide to address your concerns about its housing impact?
“Do something with less impact”
“Recognize their impact”
“Funding”
“Investment fund”
“Honestly, I don’t know that there is any avoiding increases in housing prices.”

- “Support for living wage jobs that promote workers’ rights and ownership”
- “Give-back in the form of affordable manufacturing space”
BREAK OUT GROUP 3


2. Identify 2-3 tactics under each of the three approaches to addressing housing pressure. Discuss which you think are most relevant to Sunset Park. (Be specific! If your answer is “protect low income renters,” how? With funding? How much funding? Where does the funding go?)
APPROACHES TO ADDRESSING HOUSING PRESSURE

1. Build more housing
2. Protect existing “affordable” housing
3. Advocate for and protect tenants
SHARE OUT

Review needs identified earlier
Share top 2-3 actions/tools
GROUP DISCUSSION

If there is a rezoning, what are the priority neighborhood housing needs a rezoning should address?

What are the principle actions that should be taken? What tools should we use?