THE NEW YORK CITY COUNCIL'S RESPONSE TO THE FISCAL 2020 PRELIMINARY BUDGET AND FISCAL 2019 PRELIMINARY MAYOR'S MANAGEMENT REPORT

As required under Sections 247(b) and 12(e) of the New York City Charter

Hon. Corey Johnson
Speaker

Hon. Daniel Dromm
Chair, Committee on Finance

Hon. Vanessa Gibson
Chair, Subcommittee on Capital Budget

Latonia R. McKinney
Director, Finance Division

April 9, 2019

Legal Unit

Rebecca Chasan, Senior Counsel
Noah Brick, Assistant Counsel
Stephanie Ruiz, Assistant Counsel

Revenue and Economics Unit

Raymond Majewski, Deputy Director, Chief Economist
Emre Edev, Assistant Director
Paul Sturm, Supervising Economist
Hector German, Financial Analyst
William Kyeremateng, Senior Economist
Kira McDonald, Economist
Nashia Roman, Economist
Kendall Stephenson, Senior Economist
Davis Winslow, Senior Economist

Budget Unit

Regina Poreda Ryan, Deputy Director
Nathan Toth, Deputy Director
Crilhien Francisco, Unit Head
Chima Obichere, Unit Head
John Russell, Unit Head
Dohini Sompura, Unit Head
Eisha Wright, Unit Head
Aliya Ali, Principal Financial Analyst
Sebastian Bacchi, Financial Analyst
John Basile, Financial Analyst
Chelsea Baytemur, Financial Analyst
Monika Bujak, Financial Analyst
Peter Butler, Financial Analyst
Julia Haramis, Financial Analyst
Sarah Gastelum, Principal Financial Analyst
Zachary Harris, Financial Analyst
Lauren Hunt, Financial Analyst
Daniel Kroop, Financial Analyst
Kaitlyn O'Hagan, Senior Financial Analyst
Monica Pepple, Financial Analyst
Michele Peregrin, Financial Analyst
Frank Sarno, Financial Analyst
Masis Sarkissian, Financial Analyst
Jonathan Seltzer, Senior Financial Analyst
Nevin Singh, Financial Analyst
Ana Maria Camel Vega, Financial Analyst
Andrew Wilber, Financial Analyst
Luke Zangerle, Financial Analyst

Discretionary Funding and Data Support Unit

Paul Scimone, Deputy Director
James Reyes, Principal Financial Analyst
Savanna Chou, Financial Analyst
Steven Williams, Financial Analyst
Raymond Furlong, Financial Analyst

Administrative Support Unit

Nicole Anderson, Senior Administrative Coordinator
Maria Pagan, Senior Administrative Coordinator
Lattina Brown, Administrative Assistant
Courtneigh Summerrise, Administrative Assistant

Interns

Jasper Diaz
Florentine Kabore
Tiana Robinson
Alana Webster

Table of Contents

Executive Summary

The New York City Council is pleased to release its response to the Mayor's Fiscal 2020 Preliminary Budget and the Fiscal 2019 Preliminary Mayor's Management Report. On February 7, 2019, Mayor de Blasio released a $92.2 billion proposed budget for Fiscal 2020, beginning the annual back and forth process between the Mayor and the Council that ultimately results in a budget for the ensuing fiscal year.

On March 6, 2019, the Council's Committee on Finance and the Subcommittee on Capital Budget held the first hearing on the Fiscal 2020 Preliminary Financial Plan. This oversight was reinforced by 31 additional committees throughout the month of March, with the leaders of 55 agencies and offices testifying before the Council about their budgets and agency performances. The information the Council learned by hearing from and questioning the representatives of the individual agencies and gathering feedback from the advocates and members of the public informed the proposals contained in this response.

Last year, in the first Preliminary Budget Response released under the leadership of Speaker Corey Johnson, the Council presented bold, transformative proposals for new programs – such as Fair Fares to provide reduced-price Metrocards to New Yorkers living below the poverty line. This year, the Council's response focuses on stabilizing the City's strategic investments and safeguarding the budget for the future.

One key example that embodies this principle is the call for the Administration to support wage equity and human services providers. The success of many of Mayor de Blasio's signature initiatives rely on the success of the community-based organizations and human services providers that provide the key services to implement these initiatives on the ground. However, in the cases of Universal Pre-K, 3K For All, EarlyLearn, and the Turning the Tide homeless plan, to name a few, the initiatives were financed with significant public investment, but the unfortunate reality is that they were also financed by underpaying thousands of mostly women of color, not-for-profit workers. These workers are routinely being paid thousands of dollars less than their similarly credentialed and situated counterparts. Without pay parity in these titles and fields, the long-term sustainability of these programs is uncertain at best.

For Fiscal 2020, Mayor de Blasio released a more conservative Preliminary Budget relative to prior fiscal years. Planned spending is expanding at a modest rate, and there are relatively few major new initiatives. The Council recognizes and echoes the Administration's concerns about a possible economic slow-down on the horizon. As a result, the Council presents a balanced financial plan supported by nearly $1 billion in identified savings. Those savings are directed towards spending that will shore up and support existing programs and ensure the services the City is providing are sustainable in the long-term, while at the same time protecting New Yorkers in need and making prudent investments. Moreover, the City must maintain a strong fiscal position going forward by taking advantage of the present economic expansion to bolster the City's reserves by $250 million to prepare for future uncertainty.

One significant area where an investment this year would secure the budget in the future is with respect to the census. With the 2020 Decennial Census taking place next year, the City needs to make a commitment of resources today to ensure a full count to protect federal funding and the apportionment of seats in Albany and Washington D.C. for the next decade.

And, lastly, to provide continuity of the vital services on which our constituents rely, the Administration must commit to supporting the services included in the Fiscal 2019 Adopted Budget agreement, but which it funded for Fiscal 2019 only. These so-called "one-shots" total $158 million and include money for adult literacy programs, the addition of 5,000 Summer Youth Employment slots, programming for 14 New York City Housing Authority-managed senior centers, and Summer SONYC.

Some of the highlights of this year's response to the Preliminary Budget include:

- **Wage Equity and Human Services Providers**. In order to sustain the current system of contracting out so many of our social services and to ensure pay parity for the human services workforce, the Council urges the Administration to add $106 million to increase human services providers' indirect cost rates, $89 million to increase day care worker salaries, $5 million to support Assistant District Attorneys, and $15 million to increase wages for indigent defense attorneys.
- **Fair Student Funding.** The Administration should add $200 million in Fair Student Funding to raise the floor to a minimum of 93 percent for all schools and an average level of funding of 95 percent.
- **Social Workers.** The need for social workers for vulnerable student and youth populations is well-documented. The Administration should add 110 social workers in high-need schools, baseline 69 Bridge the Gap social workers, and provide one social worker in every Department of Homeless Services hotel shelter that houses families with children.
- **Census.** In addition to a portion of the $20 million in State funding that will be allocated to the City for census operations, the Administration should include an additional $40 million to ensure an accurate census count.
- **Fair Futures.** The Administration should invest $10 million in Fair Futures, a first-in-the-nation, long-term, comprehensive support system for foster youth, from middle school through age 26.
- **COMPASS.** The Council calls on the Administration to redesign and expand the COMPASS elementary program by improving and offering new programs, refreshing existing models, and expanding the number of slots from roughly 47,000 to 100,000.
- **New York City Housing Authority's Long-Term Capital Need.** The New York City Housing Authority has a $32 billion capital need to bring its infrastructure into a state of good repair. Between existing funding and plans for new funding streams, there still remains $8 billion worth of work that must be addressed. The Administration must craft a long-term plan to tackle this shortfall. In addition, funding for additional headcount to expedite the capital repairs that are funded should be included.

At the same time that the City is spending, it is crucial to ensure that information about that spending is made public and that the Council has the necessary information in order to conduct budget oversight. The Administration should approach a redesign of the budget structure and reporting with the same progressive spirit that it has applied to innovating government programs. To that end, the Council renews its annual call for the Administration to include additional units of appropriation. However, new units of appropriation will not solve the problem of being unable to clearly track multi-agency initiatives or offices. For programs such as ThriveNYC, Universal Pre-K, and the Office to End Domestic and Gender-Based Violence, the Administration must commit to supplemental reporting with each financial plan and consistent budget labeling to show all relevant budgetary information for these wide-ranging programs. In addition, the Council calls on the Administration to provide additional reporting on particularly opaque parts of the budget, such as Department of Homeless Services shelter spending and NYC Ferry, which is operated by the Economic Development Corporation.

These structural reforms are also needed on the capital side of the budget. The Preliminary Ten-Year Capital Strategy presented by the Administration was not comprehensive and failed to live up to its own guiding principles of 1) maintaining New York City's financial responsibility; 2) promoting forward-looking, holistic capital planning that anticipates neighborhood needs of tomorrow; 3) advancing a more equitable City through capital investment; and 4) considering community perspectives in capital planning and decision-making. The Council calls on the Administration to present a Ten-Year Capital Strategy that makes clear connections between the City's planned investments and the guiding principles of the capital program, as well as an appropriate level of planned spending in the second half of the ten-year planning period.

As we look to build for tomorrow, the Administration must also create management controls that ensure all construction projects are fully compliant with the American for Disabilities Act (ADA), and maximize opportunities to improve accessibility within the capital program so that our City can one day be truly accessible to all.

The Council looks forward to the continuation of the Fiscal 2020 budget process with the release of the Executive Plan, and a productive relationship with the Administration to adopt a budget that we can be honored to present to the residents of the City of New York.

Fiscal 2020 Financial Plan

The Council's Financial Plan begins with the Administration's Fiscal 2020 Preliminary Budget, modifies it with new savings and efficiencies, adjusts for new needs, and focuses on priorities identified by the Council through its budget hearings. The Preliminary Budget totaled $92 billion in Fiscal 2019 and $92.2 billion in Fiscal 2020. The Council's Financial Plan increases the size of the budget by $276 million, or 0.3 percent, in Fiscal 2019, and adds $752 million, or 0.8 percent, in Fiscal 2020.[1]

February 2019 Financial Plan Summary
Dollars in Millions

	FY19	FY20	FY21	FY22	FY23	Average Annual Change
REVENUES						
Taxes	$60,681	$62,916	$64,768	$66,930	$68,895	3.2%
Miscellaneous Revenues	$7,633	$6,799	$6,772	$6,747	$6,735	(3.0%)
Unrestricted Intergovernmental Aid	$151					
Less: Intra-City and Disallowances	($2,063)	($1,809)	($1,811)	($1,809)	($1,807)	(3.1%)
Subtotal, City Funds	**$66,402**	**$67,906**	**$69,729**	**$71,868**	**$73,823**	**2.7%**
State Aid	$15,258	$15,390	$15,837	$16,305	$16,353	1.8%
Federal Aid	$8,471	$7,327	$7,205	$7,133	$7,120	(4.1%)
Other Categorical Grants	$1,198	$926	$868	$862	$862	(7.4%)
Capital Funds (IFA)	$690	$661	$662	$661	$661	(1.1%)
TOTAL REVENUES	**$92,019**	**$92,210**	**$94,301**	**$96,829**	**$98,819**	**1.8%**
EXPENDITURES						
Personal Services	$49,509	$51,727	$53,704	$54,684	$56,097	3.2%
Other Than Personal Services (OTPS)	$39,034	$36,851	$37,001	$37,291	$37,474	(1.0%)
Debt Service	$6,737	$7,345	$7,658	$8,337	$9,086	7.8%
General Reserve	$300	$1,000	$1,000	$1,000	$1,000	58.3%
Capital Stabilization Reserve		$250	$250	$250	$250	
Less: Intra-City	($2,154)	($1,794)	($1,796)	($1,794)	($1,792)	(4.2%)
Spending Before Adjustments	**$93,426**	**$95,379**	**$97,817**	**$99,768**	**$102,115**	**2.2%**
Surplus Roll Adjustment (Net)	($1,407)	($3,169)				
TOTAL EXPENDITURES	**$92,019**	**$92,210**	**$97,817**	**$99,768**	**$102,115**	**2.7%**
Gap to be Closed	**-**	**-**	**($3,516)**	**($2,939)**	**($3,296)**	

Source: OMB February 2019 Financial Plan for Fiscal Years 2019-2023

Council's Financial Plan Overview

The Council's response shows a plan for both Fiscal 2019 and Fiscal 2020. Since funds are rolled over from one fiscal year to the next, the two years are included together to show a balanced budget for both years. As indicated in the table below, new resources and efficiencies amount to $568 million in Fiscal 2019. This sum is then rolled over to Fiscal 2020, and the $1.5 billion in new budgeted expenses

[1] The change in size of budget is due to a change in revenue resulting from a difference in tax forecasts and a net re-estimate of other revenues including State budget impacts.

is entirely paid for by the new resources and efficiencies from both years. The plan has $187 million remaining at the end of Fiscal 2020 which could be rolled into Fiscal 2021 or put to other uses.

The following table shows the Council's revisions to both the revenue and expense sides of the budget.

Council Response Financial Plan
Dollars in Millions

	FY19	FY20
Gap as of Preliminary Budget Financial Plan	**$0**	**$0**
RESOURCES (+) adds resources		
Council Tax Revenue Forecast	$221	$698
General Reserve Takedown	$300	
Re-estimates, Efficiencies, and Other Savings	$200	$772
State Budget Impact		($210)
Actuarial Adjustment	($153)	($153)
SUBTOTAL	**$568**	**$1,107**
USE of FUNDS (+) uses resources		
Preliminary Budget Response Proposals		
Increase Fair Student Funding		$200
Census 2020 Campaign		$40
Compass Redesign & Expansion		$90
Support Human Services Providers		$106
Expand Reserves		$250
Current Council Initiatives and One-Shots		$437
Other Preliminary Budget Response Proposals		$366
SUBTOTAL	**$0**	**$1,489**
TOTAL: Resources and Use of Funds	**$568**	**($382)**
Offset by increase of FY19 Prepayments to FY20	($568)	$568
Surplus in Council Preliminary Budget Response	**$0**	**$187**

The Council's Financial Plan consists of two components: resources and use of funds.

Resources. These come from the Council's tax revenue forecast and a set of re-estimates, efficiencies, and other savings and are offset by actions that need to be accounted for in the Executive Financial Plan.

- **Council's Tax Revenue Forecast.** The Finance Division's tax revenue forecast is above the Office of Management and Budget's (OMB) forecast from the Preliminary Plan by $221 million in Fiscal 2019 and $698 million in Fiscal 2020. The $221 million in Fiscal 2019 is rolled over to cover the cost of some of the expenses proposed for Fiscal 2020.
- **General Reserve Takedown.** The Council believes the $300 million currently in the Fiscal 2019 general reserve will not be needed this year and that those funds can safely be rolled to Fiscal 2020.

- **Re-estimates, Efficiencies, and Other Savings.** Every year the Administration recognizes substantial savings from over-budgeting and underspending as well as programmatic savings that do not effect core services, most of which is rolled into the next fiscal year's budget. The Council has identified potential savings of $200 million in Fiscal 2019 and $772 million in Fiscal 2020.

- **State Budget Impact.** The Fiscal 2019-2020 New York State Enacted Budget includes a number of risks to New York City and its budget. New York City is expected to receive a $210 million cut in State aid for Fiscal 2020 compared to the Preliminary Budget. The Finance Division continues to analyze the impact of the enacted State budget.

- **Actuarial Adjustment.** A calculation error at the Office of the Actuary resulted in a need to increase contributions to one of the City's pension systems. Due to this error, the City has not been making required contributions for 2,900 workers who were former State employees who took City jobs and opted to transfer their retirement savings into the New York City Employees' Retirement System (NYCERS). At the time of writing it is unclear how long the City has failed to account for these workers, however the Council estimates an additional need of $153 million in both Fiscal 2019 and 2020 to account for this error.[2]

Use of Funds. These reflect the new budget items developed in line with the Council's priorities. They are discussed at length throughout this document.

Re-estimates, Agency Efficiencies, and Other Savings

With the release of the Preliminary Budget, the Mayor announced that a Program to Eliminate the Gap (PEG) would be implemented in the Executive Budget to find an additional $750 million in savings in Fiscal 2019 and Fiscal 2020 combined. The Council has conducted a similar exercise, and has identified $972 million in savings over the two years. These savings are identified below in three parts: agency efficiencies, miscellaneous revenue, and expense budget re-estimates.

Implement Agency Efficiencies

Having conducted a thorough review of the Fiscal 2020 Preliminary Budget, the City Council has identified a number of areas in which efficiencies can be implemented and where the Fiscal 2020 budget can be revised downwards without having an impact on the quality or extent of services. The Council has identified $347 million in such efficiencies and right-sizing in Fiscal 2020 that should be reallocated to Council priorities that would better serve New Yorkers.

- **Expand the Hiring Freeze.** The Council commends the Administration's efforts to temper the expansion of personal services (PS) spending through hiring freezes and vacancy reductions in recent fiscal years. However, there remain approximately 870 vacancies in several agencies that should be frozen for Fiscal 2020, or eliminated entirely. A new hiring freeze would result in salary and fringe savings of approximately $84 million in Fiscal 2020. This would include freezing approximately 215 vacant positions at the Department of Finance (DOF), 200 vacant traffic enforcement agent positions and the New York Police Department (NYPD), 187 vacant school safety agents positions at the NYPD, and 70 vacant positions at the Department of Small Business Services (SBS), among others. The Council asserts that the majority of these positions

[2] Goldenberg, Sally, "Pension calculation error will cost city hundreds of millions over 4 years," POLITICO Pro, news article (April 3, 2019), https://subscriber.politicopro.com/states/new-york/albany/story/2019/04/03/pension-calculation-error-will-cost-city-hundreds-of-millions-over-4-years-950025

would otherwise likely remain vacant in Fiscal 2020 due to capacity constraints. A breakdown of the specific positions that the Council is proposing for an expanded hiring freeze are found in the table below.

Fiscal 2020 Hiring Freeze

Agency	FY20 Hiring Freeze	Budget Area
DOF	215	Agency-wide
NYPD	187	School Safety
NYPD	200	Traffic Enforcement
SBS	70	Agency-wide
DCAS	50	Asset Management Division
DoITT	40	Administration
DSNY	32	Agency-wide
DCP	10	Agency-wide
DCA	24	Agency-wide/Adjudications
FISA	14	Agency-wide
OPA	14	Agency-wide
CCHR	7	CD Law Enforcement Program
DVA	4	Central Administration
LPC	3	Agency-wide
OATA	4	Agency-wide
TOTAL	**874**	

- **Align the ThriveNYC Budget to Historical Spending.** The Council calls for the Administration to reduce the ThriveNYC initiative's $250 million Fiscal 2020 Preliminary Budget by $50 million to align the spending plan with Fiscal 2018 actual spending and Fiscal 2019 anticipated spending. Since its introduction, ThriveNYC has not drawn down on all of the budgetary resources allocated. Actual spending on the program was $43.9 million in Fiscal 2016, $125 million in Fiscal 2017, and $175 million in Fiscal 2018. The year-to-date spending for Fiscal 2019 was not yet available when the Committee on Finance held its March 26, 2019 hearing on ThriveNYC's budget. However, at the hearing it was revealed that some components of ThriveNYC are not yet operational. For example, the Public Health Diversion Centers budgeted for $9.5 million in Fiscal 2019, a $500,000 increase from Fiscal 2018, are not yet in use. In addition, the Mental Health First aid programs budget was increased from $5.3 million to $6.3 million in Fiscal 2019, even though spending was only at 68 percent in Fiscal 2018. Similarly, both NYC Safe and Mental Health Service Corps funding was also underspent in Fiscal 2018, but these programs saw funding increases in Fiscal 2019.
- **Reduce Day-to-Day Energy Use.** Through the Demand Response and Load Management programs, the Department of Citywide Administrative Services (DCAS) works with agencies to lower their energy consumption on a day-to-day basis. These programs help to control the growth of the Heat, Light and Power budget, which stands at $725.3 million for Fiscal 2020. DCAS should greatly intensify the program and set a five percent reduction target to lower energy spending. Savings would total $35 million in Fiscal 2020.
- **Reduce PS Spending on School Support Organizations.** Spending on Department of Education (DOE) borough offices (formerly known as field support centers) has more than doubled since Fiscal 2014 to $285.9 million in Fiscal 2020. Spending in this area should be reduced by ten

percent or $28.6 million. The reduction should target "additional gross pay" earnings and savings from eliminating vacant, non-pedagogical staff positions. Savings could also be found in pedagogical staff positions by reallocating these positions to school-based settings.

- **Reduce DOE's Central Administration PS Spending.** DOE's Central Administration PS spending has increased by over 33 percent since Fiscal 2014. A ten percent reduction across the board would save $22.2 million in Fiscal 2020. Savings could be achieved by eliminating non-essential non-pedagogical positions.
- **Reduce DOE's Professional Development Spending.** The total budget for professional development (PD) contracts is $133.7 million in Fiscal 2020. This does not include spending on per session or per diem for staff receiving this PD outside of normal work hours, or spending on substitute teachers for staff who attend PD during classroom time. While the Fiscal 2020 Preliminary Budget proposes some savings from PD, the DOE could find additional savings of $20 million in Fiscal 2020 by ensuring PD sessions are scheduled during staff's dedicated PD time and further eliminating duplicative PD contracts.
- **Reduce Uniform Overtime.** The Fiscal 2020 Citywide Uniformed Overtime Budget totals over $1 billion. The Administration should strictly enforce the caps that are currently in place and implement additional stringent measures to reduce uniform overtime spending by five percent, or $50 million annually.
- **Reduce Administration for Children's Services State Detention Placements.** The New York State Office of Children and Family Services (OCFS) provides residential services for adjudicated juvenile delinquents and offenders who cannot be placed in City facilities. The Fiscal 2020 Preliminary Budget includes $124 million for placements, with the City funding 90 percent of the total, or $111 million. However, the Administration for Children's Services (ACS) transferred only 51 youth to OCFS facilities in 2016, the last year for which data is publicly available. This very high cost per youth admitted should be reduced by at least 15 percent to achieve $16.7 million in savings.
- **Reduce Spending on Citywide Data Processing Contracts.** The Fiscal 2020 Preliminary Budget includes approximately $310 million for data processing contracts. The Council calls on the Department of Information Technology and Telecommunications (DoITT) to work with City agencies to reduce this spending across the board by five percent by renegotiating and consolidating contracts, resulting in savings of $15 million.
- **Expedite the Replacement of Correction Officers with Youth Development Specialists.** Since the Department of Correction (DOC) transferred all 16- and 17-year-olds to the Horizon juvenile justice facility, correction officers have been deployed to Horizon for escort and security purposes. Per the existing Raise the Age implementation plan, these correction officers will be replaced with youth development specialists from ACS. Expediting the replacement of Horizon's approximately 330 correction officers with youth development specialists by six months will save DOC about $8 million.
- **Reduce the Mayor's Office of Media and Entertainment Film Incentive Fund.** The Fiscal 2020 Preliminary Budget for the Mayor's Office of Media and Entertainment (MOME) Film Incentive Program totals approximately $16 million. However, since Fiscal 2013, average actual expenditures have totaled around $9 million. Furthermore, TV and movie production companies have access to a $420 million film tax credit program through New York State, a far

larger pool of resources than that provided by the City. The Council calls on the Administration to reduce the budget of the MOME Film Incentive Program by $5 million to reflect actual costs.

- **Reduce the City Fleet.** DCAS plans to reduce the size of the citywide fleet by 1,000 vehicles over a two-year period and require City employees to make greater use of the City's car share program and alternative methods of transportation. The Council calls upon the Administration to expand this initiative to eliminate another 1,000 vehicles from the fleet over the next two years in order to save $5 million on vehicle purchases, fuel, parts and maintenance.
- **Expand Vertical Case Handling.** The City's Judgment and Claims budget for Fiscal 2020 is $712.6 million. In an effort to more aggressively defend the City from lawsuits, the Law Department has implemented vertical case handling and added staff. Vertical case handling allows the same lawyers to work on every stage of a case, as opposed to horizontal case handling, in which lawyers work on certain stages of a larger volume of cases. The Administration should expand vertical case handling to reduce judgment and claims and other payouts from lost litigation and settlements to find savings of $4.5 million.
- **Reduce Overtime Spending for the Organics Collection Program.** In Fiscal 2019, the Department of Sanitation (DSNY) included $9.65 million for organics collection overtime. As an alternative to partially funding the organics program via overtime, as well as to reduce costs, the Administration should include $7.36 million in DSNY's Fiscal 2020 Budget to hire 115 sanitation personnel, which would reduce costs by $2.2 million, as overtime is more costly in the short term.
- **Re-bid the DSNY Salt Contracts.** Regionally, salt prices range between $52 to $70 dollars per ton. Currently, DSNY has several contracts with an average cost per ton of $62.50. Since DSNY utilizes a large amount of salt during the snow season – an average of 375,000 tons per fiscal year – DSNY should re-bid for a lower price. If DSNY re-bid and achieved a $1.25 reduction per ton, DSNY would achieve $500,000 in savings in Fiscal 2020.

Recognize Additional Revenue

The Council identified several areas in the Fiscal 2020 Preliminary Plan where the Administration has underestimated expected revenue. In addition, the Council calls on the Administration to implement operational changes and the rationalization of fee structures to ensure that debts to the City are paid and that the City receives a reasonable price for services rendered. Through these proposals, the Council expects the City to generate an additional $322 million in revenue across Fiscal 2019 and Fiscal 2020.

- **Recognize Federal and State Revenue for the Department of Social Services.** Since Fiscal 2019 Adoption, the Department of Social Services (DSS) has recognized an additional $175 million in State and federal funding for fringe benefits, Medicaid reimbursements, and other reimbursement settlements for Fiscal 2019 only. The Council calls on the Administration to recognize $80 million in additional such reimbursements in Fiscal 2020.
- **DOF Parking Violation Fines Collection Re-estimate.** Actual year-to-date revenue from parking violation fines collections are outpacing current projections. A re-estimate of additional parking violation revenue of $59 million in Fiscal 2019 and Fiscal 2020 combined would align budgeted revenue with prior year actuals.

- **Recognize Additional Revenue from 421(a) Tax Exemption Fees.** Budgeted revenue from 421(a) Tax Exemption Fees is substantially lower than actuals in recent years. The Administration should increase projected 421(a) Tax Exemption Fees by $15 million in Fiscal 2019 and $30 million in Fiscal 2020.

- **Require the Economic Development Corporation to Remit Additional Funding to the City's General Fund.** The Council calls upon the Administration to require New York City Economic Development Corporation (EDC) to remit a greater amount to the City's General Fund. EDC collects revenue from the issuance of permits, the charge for service of energy cost-savings fees, the sale of assets, and rental income from a number of sources. Some of this revenue is returned to the City. According to the Independent Budget Office (IBO), since 2015 EDC has earned an average of $276 million annually in gross operating revenue while related expenses have averaged about $107 million. EDC testified at the Council's Preliminary Budget hearing that it would increase its payments to the City by $30 million in Fiscal 2020. The Council believes EDC should increase its payments to the City by an additional $10 million to $40 million in Fiscal 2020.

- **Recognize Federal and State Revenue for ACS.** Since the adoption of the Fiscal 2019 budget, ACS has recognized an additional $38 million in current-year State and federal funding for fringe benefits and reimbursement settlements. In previous years, higher levels of such reimbursements were recognized. The Council calls on the Administration to recognize additional reimbursements of $30 million in federal and State funding in Fiscal 2020 in the Executive Plan.

- **Recognize Additional Speed Camera Revenue.** In March 2019, the State approved the renewal and expansion of the speed camera program which has been operating in the City since 2014. There are now speed camera systems deployed in 140 school zones from 6 a.m. until 10 p.m. Under the expanded authorization, the City may put cameras in up to 750 zones. For Fiscal 2020, by extending current contracts, the City should be able to bring 300 additional cameras online in the next year, funding for which is in the capital plan. In Fiscal 2018, the program generated $52 million in revenue. Given the timing of installation and set-up, Council Finance estimates the expansion could generate $30 million in Fiscal 2020.

- **Increase Environmental Control Board Fines Collection.** The Office of Administrative Trials and Hearings (OATH) currently has little involvement in the collection of administrative fines for the violations it adjudicates. While the agency staffs a penalty processing unit at its facilities, this unit does not pursue those who do not pay fines owed to the City. Unpaid fines are referred to DOF for collection, but this referral is made only 60 days after a hearing date has passed. No collection efforts are made during that 60-day period. OATH's penalty processing unit should begin taking steps to collect unpaid administrative fines during this 60-day period before collections responsibility is transferred to DOF. If OATH does not wish to play a role in collecting administrative fines in order to remain a neutral arbiter of administrative law, OATH's penalty processing unit should be transferred to DOF. The Council expects that such efforts would result in additional revenue generation of $25 million annually.

- **Recognize Additional Department of Buildings Fees Revenue.** The Department of Buildings (DOB) generates revenue from the collection of several fees, including elevator inspection fees, building permit fees, electrical inspection fees, and licenses for tradespeople fees. Fiscal 2020 budgeted revenues from the collection of these fees is below actual revenue generation in recent fiscal years and should be revised upwards by $5.8 million.

- **Recognize Additional Parks Concessions and Tree Restitution Revenue.** The Department of Parks and Recreation's (DPR) budgeted revenue from the sale of concessions and from tree restitution is lower than actual revenue in recent fiscal years. The Administration should recognize an additional $2.5 million from park concessions and an additional $1 million from tree restitution in Fiscal 2020.
- **Convert Multiple Dwelling Registration Flat Fee to a Per Unit Fee.** Property owners of residential buildings are required by law to register annually with the Department of Housing Preservation and Development (HPD) if the property is a multiple dwelling (3+ residential units), or a private dwelling (1-2 residential units) where neither the owner nor the owner's immediate family resides. The fee for registration is $13 per building, which is billed directly by DOF. The City collects about $1.6 million in multiple dwelling registration fees annually, on average. Converting the flat fee to a $2 per unit fee would increase the revenue collected by HPD by $2.4 million annually (assuming a 90 percent collection rate).
- **Increase Revenue from Consumer Protection Law Penalties.** The Council urges the Administration to increase the penalty range for violations of the Consumer Protection Law. The Commissioner of the Department of Consumer Affairs (DCA) testified at the Fiscal 2020 Preliminary Budget hearing that penalties for violations of the Consumer Protection Law have not changed since 1969, while inflation has increased over 600 percent during this time. A 50 percent increase in the penalty schedule for the Consumer Protection Law would generate additional revenue of $1 million.
- **Increase DPR's Marina Dockage Rate.** DPR collects revenue from concession contracts for the World's Fair Marina, the Sheepshead Bay Marina, and the 79th Street Boat Basin. The 79th Street Boat Basin has over 700 boats on the waitlist to obtain docking permits. The current rate for a six-month docking permit from DPR ranges from $75 to $120 per linear foot and has not been changed since 2012. Many privately-owned marinas, as well as boat basins affiliated with park trusts, charge between $180 and $295 per linear foot for a similar permit and services. The Council recommends that the Administration gradually increase the marina dockage rate by 25 percent. This fee increase is projected to generate additional revenue of $600,000 annually, with a potential for additional revenue from an increase of rates for services such as cleaning, winter dry storage, and towing at city marinas.

Recognize Underspending

During the course of each fiscal year, the Administration typically recognizes significant budget accruals in the current and upcoming fiscal year. Both the November 2019 and Fiscal 2020 Preliminary Financial Plans recognized accruals in Fiscal 2019 and Fiscal 2020. However, the Council estimates that additional accruals of at least $302 million remain to be recognized in Fiscal 2019 and Fiscal 2020.

- **Re-estimating Interest Costs on the City's Debt Service.** The Finance Division projects that debt service costs related to the City's general obligation (GO) variable rate demand bonds (VRDBs) will be lower than what is projected in the Fiscal 2020 Preliminary Financial Plan. The Finance Division expects that OMB will realize savings of $20 million for Fiscal 2019 and $80 million for Fiscal 2020 by lowering its interest rate assumptions. Re-estimates of these interest rates are a routine source of savings for OMB over the course of the fiscal year. OMB has already lowered its interest rate assumptions for Fiscal 2019, achieving $96 million in savings since the Fiscal 2019 Adopted Budget. OMB has yet to lower its assumptions for Fiscal 2020. OMB recognized over $218 million in debt service savings from VRDBs in Fiscal 2018.

- **Recognize Additional Year-End PS Accruals Savings.** The Administration has recognized some underspending and savings from PS accruals in Fiscal 2019 through hiring delays, attrition, and the inability to fill budgeted positions within the fiscal year. However, as of January 2019, the City has a full-time City-funded vacant headcount of 3,273, many of which are in agencies that have recognized few if any PS accruals in their Fiscal 2019 budgets. These include DSS, SBS, the Law Department, and DOF. The Council estimates that PS accruals will total at least $70 million in Fiscal 2019.
- **Right-size the Human Resources Administration's Public Assistance Savings.** The Human Resources Administration's (HRA) other than personal services (OTPS) Public Assistance $2.3 billion budget is based on caseload projections that are nearly three years old. Cash Assistance caseloads have declined yearly since Fiscal 2016. The OTPS Public Assistance budget does not reflect this. The Council projects City-funded spending on OTPS Public Assistance will be $46 million lower than budgeted in Fiscal 2019 and $50 million lower than budgeted in Fiscal 2020.
- **Right-size DOC Holiday Pay.** Over the past five fiscal years, DOC has spent less than half of its $29 million budget for holiday pay. The Council recommends a reduction of $10 million in Fiscal 2020 and in the outyears to better reflect historical spending.
- **Other Re-estimates.** The Council anticipates underspending in a number of other areas equal to approximately $25.5 million, of which $7.8 million is expected in Fiscal 2019 and $17.7 million is expected in Fiscal 2020. This $25.5 million encompasses the following proposals.
    - Savings of $5 million in Fiscal 2019 from OTPS accruals at the Board of Elections (BOE).
    - Savings of $5 million in Fiscal 2020 from Emergency Communications Transformation Program (ECTP) Maintenance budget savings within DoITT.
    - Savings of $5 million in Fiscal 2020 in the NYCWiN budget within DoITT.
    - Savings of $3 million in Fiscal 2020 from the Department of Environmental Protection's (DEP) Glycerol budget.
    - Savings of $2.5 million in Fiscal 2020 from the right-sizing of the Department of Youth and Community Development's (DYCD) Program Services PS budget.
    - Savings of $1.5 million in Fiscal 2019 from OTPS accruals at the Department for the Aging (DFTA).
    - Savings of $1.3 million in Fiscal 2020 from DOE's Extended Use Fee Waiver Pilot re-estimates.
    - Savings of $1.2 million in Fiscal 2020 from the right-sizing of DOC's food budget.
    - Savings of $750,000 in Fiscal 2020 from administrative re-estimates at the Department of Probation (DOP).
    - Savings of $200,000 in Fiscal 2020 from DOC's administrative OTPS re-estimates.

Expand the Citywide Savings Program

The Council calls for a more aggressive Citywide Savings Program with higher savings targets in the Fiscal 2020 Executive Budget and all future Citywide Savings Programs. Since adoption of the Fiscal 2019 budget, OMB has recognized $3.2 billion in savings between Fiscal 2019 and 2023, with an additional $750 million expected from the PEG expected to be implemented in the Fiscal 2020 Executive Plan. This represents a reduction of just over one percent of City funding over the five fiscal years, and is lower than the savings that the Council has found conducting its own exercise. City agencies should be required to reexamine work assignments, implement spending controls, and search for more efficient means of delivering services in order to grow the Fiscal 2020 PEG to at least $1.5 billion. Non-essential and ineffective programs should also be slated for elimination.

While the structure of the Citywide Savings Program has been improving in recent years, with re-occurring budget reductions comprising an increasing share of the plan, a major share of the plan continues to consist of re-estimates that would have occurred without any operational intervention, most notably debt service payment re-estimates. By setting higher savings targets, agencies would be compelled to seek more concrete savings that require making better and more efficient use of existing resources.

Moreover, the Council has little say in how budget reductions that result from the Citywide Savings Program are re-appropriated. Currently, OMB recognizes savings and simultaneously re-appropriates them in each financial plan. As called for by the Speaker at the Preliminary Budget hearing on March 27, 2019, at which OMB testified, a more collaborative process should be developed with the Council to determine which savings are booked, as well as how they are redistributed. This process should take a longer-term view that identifies savings much earlier in the budget process to ensure that agencies are generating as much savings as they can without reducing the extent or efficacy of the critically important social services that the City provides.

Budget Risks

Since the release of the Preliminary Plan, the Council has identified several major risks to the plan. This includes two major actions that have occurred that have direct financial impacts on the City's budget: the adoption of the New York State budget and a mistake in accounting for pension contribution needs. These are not accounted for in the Mayor's Preliminary Plan, and the Council's response accounts for these risks as part of its revised Financial Plan.

In addition, the Council has identified a number of agency programmatic risks where the current funding levels result in an expected budgetary shortfall. The Council believes that these risks need to be addressed by the Mayor, either through repurposing current agency funds or other programmatic changes.

State Budget Impact

The Fiscal 2019-2020 State Enacted Budget includes several budgetary actions that detrimentally impact the City. The State Budget imposes approximately $210 million in funding cuts for New York City, primarily impacting services for low-income New Yorkers and children. The following budget deficits are yet to be reflected in the City's proposed Fiscal 2020 budget, and it is imperative that the City include funding in the Executive Budget so that City services are not adversely effected.

Temporary Assistance to Needy Families Funding

The State Enacted Budget creates a ten percent local share for New York City for the Family Assistance portion of the Temporary Assistance to Needy Families (TANF) block grant, which equates to a loss of $125 million in State TANF funding. This funding stream primarily supports Cash Assistance, a mandated program, and homeless shelters. DSS now has the difficult task of identifying programmatic funding shifts in order to fill this budget gap.

Public Health Program Reductions

The State Enacted Budget eliminates $59 million in health services funding for families and children, including services designed to prevent the spread of communicable diseases. This funding specifically supports newborn home-visiting clinics that treat sexually transmitted diseases, HIV, and tuberculosis; responses to communicable diseases such as Legionnaires, West Nile, and Zika; and tests of updated vaccines for diseases like Measles and Hepatitis A. These are core services provided by the Department of Health and Mental Hygiene (DOHMH) and, despite State cuts, funding cannot be reduced in the Fiscal 2020 Budget.

The School Aid Shortfall

The State Enacted Budget reflects a total increase of $373 million in school aid to the City, including a $331 million increase in foundation aid, for a total of $11.2 billion. However, a shortfall of $25.6 million still exists when comparing anticipated State aid in DOE's Financial Plan.

Consumer Directed Personal Assistance Program

The Council also has serious concerns over State policy changes to the Consumer Directed Personal Assistance Program (CDPAP). CDPAP, a State-wide Medicaid program, allows people to choose their own in-home care and provider. CDPAP primarily assists people with disabilities and the elderly who rely on alternative home-based services and personal care. The Council strongly opposes the State Enacted Budget's reorganization of the fiscal intermediary system, which facilitates the provision of nursing services. While the reorganization is estimated to save the State an estimated $75 million in Medicaid reimbursement, it will likely cause many fiscal intermediaries to close their doors. The Council welcomes the efforts of the New York State Senate working group that will be established to mitigate this harm, and prevent the unnecessary placement of people with disabilities and the elderly into institutional settings.

Actuarial Adjustment

As highlighted by the State Comptroller and the Financial Control Board in their analyses of the Fiscal 2020 Preliminary Financial Plan, a calculation error at the Office of the Actuary has resulted in the immediate need for increased contributions to one of the City's pension funds. Unfortunately, the City has not been making annual contributions for 2,900 workers who were former State employees who took City jobs and opted to transfer their retirement savings into NYCERS. The total cost to correct the error is expected to be $223 million per year between Fiscal 2019 and Fiscal 2022.

In addition to this unexpected cost, the Office of the Actuary anticipates an increase in contributions due to potential changes in the actuarial assumptions and methodologies used to calculate pension contributions. These changes will likely be recommended in the final report of an audit performed by an outside actuarial consultant, Bolton Partners. In anticipation of this report and its recommendations, expected in May, the City previously added pension reserves totaling $100 million annually in Fiscal 2019 and 2020 and $400 million annually in Fiscal 2021 and 2022. This reserve will offset the impact of any changes, which the State Comptroller expects to total just $30 million annually.

If the above estimates are accurate, there will be a surplus reserve of $70 million in both Fiscal 2019 and Fiscal 2020. Applying this remaining reserve to the total cost of the calculation error, the City will still face an increase in contributions to the pension system of $153 million annually in Fiscal 2019 and Fiscal 2020.

Agency Budget Risks

The Council has also identified several programmatic risks that will need to be resolved before the adoption of the Fiscal 2020 budget. These risks include shortfalls in agency funding identified through budget oversight, preliminary budget hearings, testimony from City agencies, and other stakeholders. While estimates of these shortfalls are noted, the Council expects the Administration to address these agency budget risks through realignment and right-sizing of program budgets and other measures to ensure that these programs are made whole in the budget process.

Department of Education

The Fiscal 2020 Budget does not adequately project planned spending, which could potentially impact core operations for DOE. In particular, DOE's budget is underfunded for Carter cases, charter schools, pupil transportation, and school facilities, resulting in a budget deficit of $652 million across Fiscal 2019 and Fiscal 2020.

- **Carter Cases.** Actual spending on Carter Cases was $463 million in Fiscal 2018, which is $167 million higher than currently budgeted for Fiscal 2019 and $153 million higher than currently budgeted for Fiscal 2020. In addition, DOE has been authorized to hire 25 additional staff to handle Carter Cases, but these positions and associated costs are not yet reflected in DOE's budget. The Council expects the Administration to address the $182.4 million needed for reimbursements related to Carter Cases and $4.6 million for associated headcount in the Fiscal 2020 Executive Budget.
- **Charter School Enrollment.** Based on IBO's charter school enrollment projections and DOE's history of under-budgeting for charter school costs, there may be a shortfall in funding for charter school tuition. The Council expects the Administration to address the $103 million needed for costs related to charter school enrollment in the Fiscal 2020 Executive Budget.
- **Pupil Transportation.** Contracts covering approximately 83 percent of school bus routes expired on June 30, 2018. The rest of the school bus routes are covered by contracts that expire on June 30, 2019. DOE is currently using 30-day emergency contract extensions to continue these services while they negotiate new contracts with existing pupil transportation vendors. These emergency contracts are putting upward pressure on the price of routes, as some bus vendors have stopped working with DOE and their routes have had to be assigned to other vendors at a higher cost. Despite this increase in spending, the budget for pupil transportation contracts in Fiscal 2019 is currently $60.7 million less than actual spending on pupil transportation contracts in Fiscal 2018, which was $1.31 billion. Similarly, the Fiscal 2020 budget for pupil transportation contracts is $60.3 million lower than actual spending last fiscal year. The fiscal impact of the new pupil transportation contracts DOE is working to negotiate is unclear. The DOE has also issued a request for proposals (RFP) for a new school bus Global Positioning System (GPS), including bus routing and an app for parents. The cost of these new services is not reflected in the budget, and the GPS system is legislatively required to be in place by the start of the 2019-2020 school year. Finally, there is an ongoing restructuring of the Office of Pupil Transportation (OPT), which could include converting part-time staff to full-time staff, and hiring additional staff where needed. However, the budget does not reflect additional spending on OPT staff. The Council expects the Administration to address the $154 million needed for costs related to pupil transportation in the Fiscal 2020 Executive Budget.

- **School Facilities.** The Fiscal 2020 Preliminary Budget does not reflect the cost of the DOE's contract with New York City School Support Services (NYCSSS), which provides custodial staff in schools. The current NYCSSS budget for Fiscal 2019 is $649.3 million, while the budget for Fiscal 2020 is $45.1 million. The Council expects the Fiscal 2020 Executive Budget to transfer funding within the School Facilities budget to the NYCSSS line, because the Fiscal 2020 Preliminary Budget does not currently reflect the custodial services restructuring. However, even accounting for this budget realignment, the Fiscal 2020 School Facilities budget is still $163.2 million less than the Fiscal 2019 budget. Moreover, DOE believes the Fiscal 2019 budget for the NYCSSS contract is inadequate, and an additional $22.7 million will be needed to support the current year contract, for a total cost of $672 million. The Council expects the Administration to address the $208.5 million needed for costs related to school support services in the Fiscal 2020 Executive Budget.

Mayor's Office of Criminal Justice

The Fiscal 2020 Preliminary Budget does not adequately project planned spending for indigent defense attorneys and the current caseload for abuse and neglect cases, which could potentially impact core operations for the Mayor's Office of Criminal Justice (MOCJ). Currently there is a $30 million shortfall.

- **Right-Size the 18-B Assigned Counsel Budget.** Historically, the budget and spending for assigned counsel has been aligned. However, in Fiscal 2015, the Administration entered into a contract with Legal Aid Society and the alternate providers for conflict cases in hopes of saving the City money, thus reducing the budget by approximately $55 million. The 18-B Program providers' actual spending has not decreased and remains at $75 million annually, requiring $20 million provided through one-shot funding each year to the 18-B providers for reimbursement. The Council expects the Administration to address the $20 million needed for costs related to 18-B assigned counsel in the Fiscal 2020 Executive Budget.
- **Right-Size Article 10 Abuse and Neglect Cases Contracts.** The current budget for the public defense providers' Article 10 abuse and neglect contracts is $32.1 million across the four family court providers. This is not sufficient to address rising caseloads. MOCJ has provided an additional $8.7 million in one-shot funding to the providers to address this issue, but the amount remains inadequate. The Fiscal 2020 Executive Budget should baseline funding of $10 million to account for the trending increase in Article 10 cases and ensure reasonable caseload management and quality service, and prevent attrition among the providers.

Department of Citywide Administrative Services

Local Law 2 of 2016 stipulates that up to $19.8 million be allocated annually to finance the Non-Public School Security Guards Program. This funding has consistently been added in the Executive Budget on a one-time basis and is not yet reflected in the Fiscal 2020 budget.

- **Private School Security Reimbursement.** The Fiscal 2020 Budget does not adequately project planned spending, which could potentially impact program operations. The Fiscal 2019 budget includes $14 million for private school security reimbursement, which is $5 million less than the amount that can legally be spent on this program, despite the fact that several participating schools have noted that they do not receive sufficient funding to meet their security needs. The Council expects the Administration to address the $19.8 million needed for costs related to private school security in the Fiscal 2020 Executive Budget.

Department for the Aging

The Fiscal 2020 Preliminary Budget does not adequately project the $12 million in necessary spending for senior center model budgets and sufficient resources to adequately address case management and homecare waitlists.

- **Phase 1 of Senior Center Model Budgets.** The Council calls on the Administration to add $10 million in baselined funding for model contracting one fiscal year early, from Fiscal 2021 to Fiscal 2020. Senior centers have expressed the need for this funding now, as it impacts these centers' ability to provide more robust services. This essential funding supports staff and programming at senior centers and has already made a measurable impact. In addition, the Administration should review funding shortfalls among the 38 centers excluded from the first tranche of model budgeting.
- **Eliminate Case Management and Homecare Waitlist.** Currently, DFTA reports a waitlist of 1,000 seniors for case management services. While the Fiscal 2020 State Executive Budget will provide DFTA with approximately $3.9 million to assist with eliminating waitlists, the need is greater than such funding can support. Additionally, there is a waitlist of 100 seniors for homecare services. It is important to note that clients cannot move onto the homecare waitlist without first being assessed by a case manager. To address the growing population of seniors, $1 million would eliminate the case management waitlist, and an additional $1 million would clear the homecare waitlist to meet the demand for these essential services for New York's vulnerable elderly population.

Economic and Revenue Forecast

The Finance Division forecasts continued growth in the U.S. and New York City economy, but at a decelerating pace through 2023. Both the national and local economies remain at or near full employment so slower growth can only be expected. There is, however, some concern over the sharply reduced estimated payments to the City's personal income tax (PIT) this year. While this reduction is believed to be the transitory effects of a bad year on Wall Street and a one-year adjustment to the federal income tax changes, there is uncertainty moving forward.

The Finance Division's tax revenue forecast is above OMB's forecast by $221 million in Fiscal 2019 and $698 million in Fiscal 2020.

National Economy

The economy grew slower than it originally appeared in the final months of 2018. Gross domestic product (GDP) expanded at an annual pace of 2.2 percent in the fourth quarter, compared to an initial estimate of 2.6 percent.[3] Consumer spending, the primary engine of the economy, slowed from 3.5 percent growth in the third quarter to a still solid growth rate of 2.8 percent in the fourth quarter. Recent data from the Commerce Department, however, showed that consumer spending grew just 0.1

[3] U.S. Bureau of Economic Analysis, "Gross Domestic Product, 4th quarter and annual 2018 (third estimate); Corporate Profits, 4th quarter and annual 2018," news release (March 28, 2019), https://www.bea.gov/news/2019/gross-domestic-product-4th-quarter-and-annual-2018-third-estimate-corporate-profits-4th

percent in January 2019, flagging what could be a slowdown in growth in the first quarter.[4] Adjusted pretax corporate profits also fell in the fourth quarter – the first decline in roughly two years.

Following growth of 2.2 percent in 2017 and 2.9 percent in 2018, real GDP is expected to grow by 2.1 percent in 2019 before decelerating to 1.6 percent by 2023.[5] With the slowdown in GDP, employment will also slowdown. This will initially stabilize the unemployment rate, and then result in an upward drift in the unemployment rate beginning early 2020.

The Federal Reserve is no longer split over whether or not to raise interest rates this year. Minutes from the latest meeting of the Federal Open Market Commission noted that global concerns are weighing on the central bank's decision. Federal Reserve Chair Jerome Powell indicated one primary concern for the reason to leave rates unchanged: growth in the economies of China and Europe has lessened "substantially."[6] Powell also noted that the central bank will wind down the reduction of its U.S. Treasury securities holdings later this spring and conclude in September – a move that indicates the U.S. economy may be slowing down.

Forecast of Selected National Economic Indicators, CY2018-2023 (Yr/Yr)

Calendar Years	2018	2019	2020	2021	2022	2023
Real GDP %	2.9	2.4	2.1	1.8	1.7	1.6
Unemployment Rate %	3.9	3.6	3.6	3.8	4.0	4.2
Consumer Prices %	2.4	2.0	2.1	2.3	2.4	2.4

Source: *IHS Markit, March 2019.*

City Economy

New York City's economy added more jobs last year than previously reported. New York State Department of Labor upwardly re-benchmarked the City's payroll employment, moving from samples to population counts. Private sector employment growth in 2018 was upwardly revised to 83,000 or 2.1 percent, from 73,800 or 1.9 percent. While job growth slowed for the fourth straight year due to a diminishing labor pool, the re-benchmarking illustrates a more gradual deceleration. Most sectors followed this pattern of a very slight deceleration, such as business services. Finance and insurance exhibited healthy job growth in 2018, after shedding its payroll the previous year. Health care and social assistance continued to accelerate its dynamic job growth. On the other hand, the lower-paying leisure and hospitality sector saw payroll growth sharply weaken, while retail suffered job loss. The re-benchmarked numbers will undoubtedly impact the Executive Budget forecast by both the Finance Division and OMB.

The City's unemployment rate is at a low 4.2 percent as of February 2019. It had however, been 4.0 percent from July through December. Its labor force participation rate is at a historical high of 60.9 percent, as the City continues to attract young people from the rest of the country and abroad. Average wage growth is expected to be weaker in 2019 than previously estimated. The New York State Comptroller reported that the lucrative bonuses in the City's securities industry were slashed by 14

[4] U.S. Bureau of Economic Analysis, "Personal Income, February 2019; Personal Outlays, January 2019," news release (March 29, 2019). https://www.bea.gov/news/2019/personal-income-february-2019-personal-outlays-january-2019

[5] IHS Markit, "Executive Summary: US Economic Outlook," March 2019.

[6] Federal Open Market Committee, "Transcript of Chair Powell's Press Conference Opening Remarks," (March 20, 2019). https://www.federalreserve.gov/mediacenter/files/FOMCpresconf20190320.pdf

percent in 2018. With the securities industry comprising around 20 percent of total private sector wages, this is bound to drive down previous estimates of private sector wage growth.

In the Preliminary Budget forecast, the Finance Division expected private sector employment to grow by 1.6 percent in 2019 and significantly decelerate to 0.8 percent by 2023. OMB forecasted total employment growth at only 1.2 percent in 2019, weakening to 1.0 percent by 2023. The re-benchmarking of the employment numbers will likely upwardly revise both forecasts for the Executive Budget – at least for 2019 and 2020. The Finance Division projected private sector wage growth of 2.9 percent in 2019, softening to 2.6 percent by 2023. OMB expected 2.7 percent in 2019, slowing to 2.3 percent by 2023. Both forecasts for 2019 are likely to be downwardly revised in the Executive Budget, due to the sharp fall in bonuses.

Forecast of Selected New York City Economic Indicators, CY2018-2023 (Yr/Yr)

Calendar Years	2018	2019	2020	2021	2022	2023
Private Sector Employment Growth %	1.9	1.6	1.2	0.9	0.9	0.8
Unemployment Rate % *	4.1	3.8	3.9	4.0	4.1	4.3
Labor Force Participation Rate % *	58.5	59.3	59.9	60.2	60.5	60.8
Private Sector Average Wage %	3.3	2.9	2.7	2.5	2.6	2.6

***Source**: New York City Council Finance Division, February 2019 and *IHS Markit, March 2019.*

Tax Revenues

In the Preliminary Budget, the Finance Division forecasted tax revenue growth of three percent in Fiscal 2019. The drivers of growth are the property tax, sales tax, the business corporation tax (BCT), and the two real property transaction taxes. A substantial revenue decline is projected in PIT estimated payments, as well as a reduction in the unincorporated business tax (UBT). Collections are projected to grow 4.5 percent in 2020, and then moderate to 3.9 percent growth from Fiscal 2021 through Fiscal 2023.

Property tax collections are expected to maintain strong growth throughout the Financial Plan, with revenues forecasted to grow 6.7 percent in both Fiscal 2019 and Fiscal 2020. The Finance Division's forecast for Fiscal 2019 is similar to that of OMB's forecast, with minor differences due to updated projections for certain components of the property tax reserve. Growth is expected to slow in subsequent years, reaching 4.3 percent by Fiscal 2023. This is due to rising interest rates and the loss of valuable federal income tax deductions for state and local taxes (SALT).

PIT collections in Fiscal 2019 are showing a year-to-date decline of 8.8 percent.[7] This is despite continued job gains and increasing wage pressures. Estimated payments in December 2018 and January 2019 combined were $326 million, or 31 percent, lower than what OMB projected in its November 2018 forecast. The disappointing collections were likely a result of the unexpected fall in equity prices towards the end of 2018, as well as capital gains being cashed-in a year earlier, to avoid the cap on SALT deductions. PIT collections are also facing the additional challenge from the significant drop in Wall Street bonuses. This is a major contributor to the withholdings' weak 1.6 percent year-to-date growth. The Finance Division and OMB are hoping that tax extensions posted in April, will provide needed revenues to soften the projected decline this year.

Collections from the two business taxes have been going in opposite directions. The BCT has finally returned to strong growth in Fiscal 2019, climbing 17.9 percent year-to-date. The huge tax

[7] Year-to-date collections are as of March 2019 for PIT, and February 2019 for all other taxes.

prepayments from Fiscal 2015 have finally run down, and collections are now reflecting the strong corporate profits, made larger by the corporate tax rate cut. The UBT, on the other hand, is showing reduced revenues in Fiscal 2019. UBT collections from the previous year were boosted by federal tax law changes from the Tax Cuts and Jobs Act of 2017 (TCJA) and the Emergency Economic Stabilization Act of 2008.[8] The decline in Fiscal 2019 is a return to normal levels of growth.

Sales tax revenues have been growing by 5.1 percent in Fiscal 2019 year-to-date, buoyed by strong consumer confidence, increased personal income, the City's low unemployment rate, and thriving tourism. Collections were supported by a strong holiday shopping season, with retail sales surpassing recent years. Collections, nevertheless, are expected to moderate in subsequent years, reflecting slower growth in employment and flagging consumer confidence.

The real estate transaction taxes – real property transfer (RPTT) and mortgage recording (MRT) – are experiencing a rebound in Fiscal 2019 after two years of declining revenues, with both expected to achieve double-digit growth. This trend reversal largely follows strengthening in the commercial real estate market. The forecast for subsequent years expects relatively flat growth. Headwinds, such as softening in the luxury condo market, and continued effects from federal tax law changes, may soften revenues from residential transactions. The Finance Division's major departure from OMB's forecast in the outyears stems from OMB's expectation of double-digit declines in MRT revenues from commercial transactions in Fiscal 2020, which this forecast is less pessimistic about.

The Finance Division's forecast for the Preliminary Budget found $221 million in additional tax revenues in Fiscal 2019 compared to OMB. It also expected $698 million more in collections in Fiscal 2020. The lion's share of the higher estimates come from the property tax and the property-related taxes.

New York City Council Finance Division - Tax Revenue Difference From OMB

$ millions	FY19	FY20	FY21	FY22	FY23
Real Property	$113	$329	$682	$1,129	$1,612
Personal Income	(41)	(12)	93	174	283
Business Corporate	(69)	57	98	108	122
Unincorporated	(4)	(143)	(175)	(112)	(53)
Sales	11	(31)	(5)	6	48
Commercial Rent	1	36	55	58	61
Real Property Transfer	11	76	67	37	9
Mortgage Recording	68	258	248	230	206
Utility	10	3	(3)	(15)	(22)
Hotels	20	25	60	77	98
All Others	0	0	0	0	0
Audits	100	100	100	100	100
Total Taxes	**$221**	**$698**	**$1,221**	**$1,792**	**$2,465**

Source: *New York City Council Finance Division, NYC Office of Management and Budget, Preliminary Budget Fiscal 2020*

[8] See the Finance Division's report on the Fiscal 2019 Economic and Revenue Forecast, May 24, 2018 (Executive Budget) for how the two federal tax changes boosted the City's unincorporated business tax temporally.

Forecast Risks

The Finance Division's forecast contains appreciable downside risks. The biggest risk would come from further weakening of the global economy. Last January, the International Monetary Fund (IMF) lowered its projections of global growth for the second straight time, to 3.5 percent in 2019 and 3.6 percent in 2020, representing a 0.2 and 0.1 percentage point decline from its October forecast. IMF Managing Director Christine Lagarde warned "[a]fter two years of solid expansion, the world economy is growing more slowly than expected and risks are rising."[9] Feeding into the global challenges are the current trade tensions and tariffs. The trade standoff with China alone is showing negative ramifications both in developing economies and export-dependent European economies such as Germany, with its sharp slump in manufacturing. Increased global weakness would impact New York City both indirectly through the U.S. economy and directly through its dependence on Wall Street's international reach. Finally, on March 22, 2019, the yield on the ten-year Treasury fell below that of the three-month bill. There is a consistent historical track record that when this occurs a recession follows within two years. While the ten-year bond has subsequently resumed its higher yield than the three-month bill, the two yields remain threateningly close.

City tax revenues are facing significant risks from the TCJA's cap on state and local taxes. The sharp reduction in estimated payments in December 2018 and January 2019 may be a harbinger of a shrinking of the City's tax base, as taxpayers locate outside of the City and real properties lose their market value.

There are some upside revenue risks as well. The TCJA's steep cut in the corporate tax rate has triggered a spree of stock share buy-backs. The Congressional Budget Office has forecasted strong growth in capital gains based partially on the increasing value of shares. This in turn would mean a rebound in estimated payments going forward.

Promote Budget Accountability

Units of Appropriation and Transparency

According to the New York City Charter, each unit of appropriation (U/A) is permitted to encompass only "the amount requested…for a particular program, purpose, activity or institution." Although U/As are intended to provide highly descriptive information in order to ensure the Council's and the public's understanding of agency spending and performance, the Fiscal 2020 Preliminary Budget prepared by the Administration falls short of this level of transparency. Across the agencies, the U/As included in the expense budget are overly broad and wide-ranging, violating the Charter's requirements and limiting the Council's ability to set and maintain budget priorities. Creating more focused U/As aligned with agency programs would give the Council greater ability to conduct better and more thorough oversight of agencies, and allow the budget to be adopted on a program basis. Narrower U/As would also clearly demonstrate the Mayor's priorities and permit the Council to exercise its existing legal authority to adjust program funding levels as it sees fit. Lack of proper alignment of agency programmatic functions in U/As, as currently exists, creates a clouded representation of the City's priorities.

---

[9] Kihara, L and S. Aloisi, "IMF fears trade war and weak Europe could trigger sharp global slowdown," News from the 2019 World Economic Forum, Reuters, (January 21, 2019), https://www.reuters.com/article/us-davos-meeting-imf/imf-fears-trade-war-and-weak-europe-could-trigger-sharp-global-slowdown-idUSKCN1PF19S

As part of its Charter-mandated responsibility to adopt the budget, the Council is also tasked with approving significant midyear changes to the expense budget through the budget modification process. The use of overly broad U/As allows the Administration to conduct an end-run around this process and move money between programs without Council input or authorization. If each U/A represented the amount for a particular program, as the Charter requires, then agencies would work with the Council through the budget modification process in order to shift money appropriated for one program to another program. However, since all or nearly all of many agencies' programs are contained in one or a small number of U/As, agency heads can transfer money between programs without the required oversight.

For years, the Council has called upon OMB to overhaul of the City's expense budget structure to create and reorganize the U/As in the budget to correspond to actual programs. Most recently, as part of the Fiscal 2019 budget negotiations, OMB did create a few new U/As. However, the Administration included only a handful of the more than 120 new U/As that the Council had suggested. OMB explained that the planning and work required to add more U/As into the budget would take approximately a year, but despite that amount of time passing, OMB has failed to update or increase the U/As in the Fiscal 2020 Preliminary Budget.

More than a decade ago, at the request of the Council, OMB began producing the Budget Function Analysis (BFA) for 15 City agencies, which provides details on the expense budget by major functional areas. The BFA is a supplementary report released with the Preliminary, Executive, and Adopted Budgets, that provides headcount, expenditures, and appropriations by functional area for both personal services and other than personal services. The 15 agencies for which OMB prepares BFA's comprise a total of $30.8 million, or 33.4 percent, of the City's Fiscal 2020 Preliminary Budget of $92.2 billion.

FY20 Preliminary Budgets by BFA Agency

Agency	FY20 Amount
Administration for Children's Services	$2,672,175
Department for the Aging	355,628
Department of Correction	1,407,539
Department of Environmental Protection	1,316,713
Department of Finance	311,796
Department of Health And Mental Hygiene	1,697,075
Department of Homeless Services	2,106,000
Department of Parks and Recreation	542,819
Department of Sanitation	1,771,757
Department of Small Business Services	173,994
Department of Social Services	10,164,254
Department of Transportation	1,010,890
Department of Youth & Community Development	755,162
Housing Preservation and Development	946,960
New York City Police Department	5,601,394
TOTAL	**$30,834,156**

Dollars in Thousands

While the BFA provides a more programmatic view of each agency's budget, it still fails to provide the actual number of positions, number of budgeted and actual contracts, and actual spending by funding source for each functional area. In addition, since the Fiscal 2016 Adopted Budget, the BFA no longer provides full agency costs, as it omits pensions, fringe benefits, and debt service. Furthermore, over time, the BFA has not captured all the functional and operational changes introduced by the participating agencies. If operational changes are not mirrored in the BFA, the report's usefulness is limited. The BFA provides a good starting point for an overhaul of the City's expense budget and the Council again urges OMB to add U/As to match all the program areas for the 15 agencies included in the BFA report.

The Council has also identified non-programmatic budgets for further U/A transparency. For a list of the Council's suggestions for new U/As, please refer to Appendix A. Additionally, the Council's Finance

Division has already sent OMB a list of high priority requests for new U/As for the Department of Homeless Services (DHS) and NYPD.

While adding more U/As would help to show how specific programs that are wholly encompassed within a single agency are resourced, this is not enough. The Council and the public also need to clearly see how services funded through multiple agencies and program areas are budgeted. The Administration has implemented a host of innovative and new programs that are multi-agency collaborations, such as Pre-K for All, the Rat Mitigation Initiative, and ThriveNYC. In order to present a clear and complete view of the size and cost of such initiatives, OMB must carefully and consistently label all budgetary components of any major initiative. Moreover, OMB should produce and publish supplemental reports to accompany each financial plan to show all relevant budgetary information for these wide-ranging programs.

In addition to multi-agency programs, there are some City offices that are not accurately or clearly reflected in the City's Budget. Offices within this category include the newly renamed Office to End Gender Based Violence (EndGVB), the Center for Economic Opportunity, and the Mayor's Office of Criminal Justice. OMB should isolate all funding and headcount allocated to City's offices, and provide supplemental budget reports to show all City funding, contractual spending, and personnel allocated to each. A report for EndGVB, for example, would identify all the resources budgeted in HRA and EndGVB, and would list all domestic and gender-based violence related services funded anywhere in the City's budget.

In addition to calling for additional U/As, the Council calls upon the Administration for additional budget reporting for DHS, which has a budget of over $2 billion, and NYC Ferry, which currently lacks budget transparency.

Department of Homeless Services Monitor's Report

As part of the Fiscal 2019 Adopted Budget, the Administration agreed to provide the Council with a Monitor's Report from DSS. The purpose of this report is to provide consistent spending, outcome, and shelter portfolio data for the ongoing year. It will also allow the Council to understand proposed changes to the budget and budget modifications along with the performance and outputs of some selected homeless prevention programs. It was agreed that the Monitor's Report would be provided to the Council within two weeks of the release of each Financial Plan, starting with the November 2018 Financial Plan. The data provided to Council thus far has not been consistent with the agreement that was made, and the Council expects compliance with the agreement by the Fiscal 2019 Executive Plan.

NYC Ferry Budget Reporting

NYC Ferry is a major commuter network launched by the City through its non-City partner, NYCEDC. Because NYCEDC is not a City agency, and because of its unique financial relationship with the City, NYCEDC has been able to finance NYC Ferry without being subject to even a basic level of public scrutiny. Specifically, the Administration includes ferry costs, revenues and capital spending within overly broad budget codes within its budget, creating a lack of transparency on the City's ferry activity. Given the growing role that the NYC Ferry has begun to play in the City's transportation network, and the very significant and long-term public expenditure required to support the system, it is incumbent upon the Administration to provide a comprehensive budget and performance report for NYC Ferry with each financial plan. The Council and the public should have access to budget information for all of NYCEDC's capital spending on barges, gangways, and ferry landings at the project level. NYCEDC should also be required to present to the Council their internal budget for the ferry systems and release a capital plan that provides greater and clearer details on how the ferry system is being funded.

Create a Revenue Forecast Reserve

OMB should create an explicit reserve for its tax revenue forecast. Currently, the City's Charter entrusts the Mayor to set the revenue forecast for all revenues except the City's property tax. To minimize the risk of revenues coming in too low to balance the budget, OMB tends to under forecast the revenues. This practice is referred to as conservative budgeting.

The process for OMB's conservative budgeting is twofold. First, it underestimates revenues. Second, it includes in-budget reserves "to provide for uncontrollable increases in expenditures as well as shortfalls in revenue."[10] While both functions work unison to achieve the same purpose, the latter adds a level of transparency. The general public and monitors can clearly track the general reserve in the City's budget and make determinations about its adequacy relative to the size of the budget and future risks. However, it is unclear how conservative OMB's revenue forecast is, and if that level of caution remains adequately stable through time.

As such, the Council is not calling on OMB to move away from its conservative budgeting practice, but rather to bring clarity to the process. OMB's tax revenue forecast should reflect the office's best estimate of expected tax revenues for the upcoming fiscal year, and then include an offset in a forecast reserve to account for any shortfalls in revenue collections. This move towards greater transparency would allow outside fiscal monitors to better gauge both the accuracy of OMB's forecasts, and also track how well the office is doing at setting aside reserves for potential shortfalls.

Improve Contract Budget Transparency

The Council calls on the Administration to include the sources of funds (City, State, and federal) that support the City's Contract Budget. OMB should provide reporting on contract funding sources broken down by agency and by contract category. With planned contract spending for Fiscal 2020 at almost $16 billion, more budget transparency is required to monitor the outsourcing of City operations and service provision.

Additionally, OMB should provide a general accounting for the contracts that make up the Contractual General Services object code. For Fiscal 2020, $985.6 million is housed under Contractual General Services, with funding likely to increase. Details for the type of contracts included in this budget are limited. There are 53 different categories in the contract budget. Many of the contracts included in the Contractual General Services category better align with other existing categories and should be reassigned accordingly. New categories should also be considered in order to more accurately identify general services contracts.

Reconcile the Year-End Modified Budget with Actual Spending

Currently, there is no detailed reconciliation of changes between the year-end modified budget and actual spending. The variance between these figures can be quite significant for certain agencies and parts of the budget, yet the lack of a detailed reconciliation prevents the Council from determining what specifically has been over- or under-budgeted. OMB should produce such a reconciliation based on the model of the Detail Initiative Funding Report.

[10] February 2019 Financial Plan Detail, Fiscal Years 2019–2023, page 53, available at: https://www1.nyc.gov/assets/omb/downloads/pdf/tech2-19.pdf.

Improve the Mayor's Management Report

The Council supports the Administration's continued work in improving the clarity and usefulness of the Mayor's Management Report (MMR) and Preliminary Mayor's Management Report (PMMR), documents that are critical to tracking and evaluating the City government's operational performance. However, after conducting a thorough review of the structure and content of the Fiscal 2019 PMMR through the hearings held by the Council throughout March, the Council has identified several areas for improvement. Specific recommendations are included in the Council's Committee hearing reports on the Preliminary Budget and several broad recommendations are listed below by agency:

General MMR/PMMR Structure

- **Improve the Link between Indicators and the City Budget.** As consistent advocates for performance budgeting, the Council renews its call to make stronger connections between operational performance and the resources allocated to carry out these operations. In particular, the Council strongly recommends including capital funding data for all projects or initiatives related to indicators in the in the MMR/PMMR. For example, DCAS makes significant capital investments in the pursuit of the City's energy efficiency goals, yet financial information regarding these investments is not included in DCAS' section of the MMR/PMMR.
- **Include Clear Targets for all Indicators.** Performance targets should be attached to all MMR/PMMR indicators where applicable and each target should make sense in the context of the indicator to which it is tied. All targets should be reviewed and updated annually and additional clarification should be provided in all cases where the justification for selecting a specific target is not eminently clear. There are numerous examples of agencies consistently outperforming targets in the MMR/PMMR, which seemingly violates the rationale for adopting targets in the first place.

Citywide Performance Indicators

- **Develop Standard Measures of Capital Project Implementation Efficiency and Effectiveness.** In order to estimate the expediency and efficiency of each agency's capital program, the Administration should develop a set of universal measures to be included in the MMR/PMMR. These might include cost per square foot of new construction, time from design to completion, cost of design versus cost of construction, and number of days job sites are idle.
- **Include the Progress of 80x50.** 80x50 is an ambitious project that strives to reduce New York City's greenhouse gas emissions by at least 80 percent by 2050, relative to 2005 levels. Towards that goal, the City has committed to a number of subprograms to aid in the progress of the larger 80x50 target, such as One City, Built to Last, NYC Clean Fleet, and Zero Waste. A section should be added to the MMR/PMMR that tracks the progress of 80x50, as well as all subprograms tied to the 80x50 goal.
- **Include a Section on the Implementation of the Citywide Savings Initiatives in the Citywide Savings Program.** The Council recommends including a section in the MMR/PMMR that tracks realized savings from the Citywide Savings Initiatives included in the Citywide Savings Program. These initiatives are designed to create lasting, programmatic savings across multiple agencies. The initiatives are not necessarily tied to agencies' budgets and are therefore difficult to monitor. The Council supports these efforts and requests the ability to easily monitor their implementation through the MMR/PMMR.

Individual Agency Indicators

ACS

- **DOE Residential Care and Cost.** ACS should add a performance indicator on the number of students served annually in DOE residential care with the approximate cost per child.
- **Child Welfare Investigations for Children in Foster Care.** ACS should report the actual number of investigations with credible evidence in addition to the indicator which tracks "children maltreated during family foster care placement per 100,000 care days."

DFTA

- **Senior Subsidized Employment Program.** Currently there are no performance measures for the Senior Employment program area, though there used to be. The last MMR with this data was the 2010 MMR. It used performance measures indicating the number of seniors trained for unsubsidized employments and the number of senior trainees placed in unsubsidized employment.

DOE

- **Pupil Transportation.** There is currently no data in the MMR/PMMR on the number of students who use DOE's pupil transportation services including yellow bus or metro cards for public transportation.
- **School Food.** DOE should expand data for the average cost of breakfast and lunch and include information to evaluate the Breakfast in Classrooms program.
- **Class Size.** The MMR/PMMR reports only the average class size per grade and does not account for measures such as the number of classes with 30 students or more, pupil-teacher ratio, and the average class size in overcrowded schools.
- **Pre-K and 3-K.** The MMR/PMMR currently shows only the total enrollment in Pre-K by district and does not distinguish the enrollment for each age group. Additionally, there is no enrollment data for 3-K. The MMR/PMMR should include an indicator for the number of students by setting.
- **Carter Cases.** The MMR/PMMR should provide performance measures on the number or Carter cases, the number of students enrolled in private schools, the length of time to resolve suits, and the cost of attending these schools.
- **Equity and Excellence Programs.** Indicators should be created to track the implementation and outcomes of Equity and Excellence Programs, including high school graduation rates, college readiness, standards aligned with Common Core, and second grade literacy rates.

Housing New York

- **Total Units Started and Completed under Supportive Housing Program.** The City has a plan to create 15,000 new units of supportive housing over the next 15 years, however information pertaining to the progress of these production targets is not currently provided in the MMR/PMMR or through required reporting.

DHS

- **Commercial Hotels.** The City spends approximately $32 million per month, or $384 million per year, to house homeless families in hotels, yet this information is not readily accessible or tracked. The

MMR/PMMR should include a section that tracks this overall spending, as well as the number of units being used and the average cost of renting a hotel room per night.

- **Expand Goal 2a - Include a breakdown by housing type in reporting of shelter exits and rehousing information.** Currently, the only breakdown given in the MMR/PMMR is subsidized and unsubsidized exits. It is unknown what programs subsidized exits are comprised of or the types of unsubsidized exits. This makes it impossible to do an efficacy comparison amongst the types of exits. This information is not regularly and publically available from other DHS reporting.
- **Expand Goal 2b - Include Counts of Actual People When Reporting Shelter Exits and Rehousing Information.** Currently, this is reported on the MMR/PMMR as a percentage and the actual underlying numbers are not provided. This makes it very hard to determine the actual significance of this data as it could represent a small number of actual clients. This information is not regularly and publically available from other DHS reporting.
- **Expand Goal 2b - Include information on individuals who exit shelter and return to the DHS system after a year, including the reason why they return.** Currently, the MMR/PMMR only provides data for individuals who return within a year. Longer periods of time should be tracked to more effectively assess the amount of churn in the shelter system and causes of return should be tracked to better assess and address what the driving factors are that contribute to this. This information is not regularly and publically available from other DHS reporting.
- **Shelter Information.** The MMR/PMMR should include a count of shelters by shelter type, broken out by boroughs, with bed/capacity information and actual population housed. Currently, this information is not listed in the MMR/PMMR, or regularly available in one clear, consolidated place through reporting provided to the Council or posted on the DHS website.

HRA

- **Rental Assistance Programs.** Rental assistance programs are one of the City's most important strategies to reduce and prevent homelessness, yet the MMR/PMMR includes no indicators of the performance of these programs. The MMR/PMMR should report the number of people who use rental assistance to move out of shelter and the number of people who were able to use rental assistance to remain in their homes. There should be an additional indicator created to report the number of people deemed eligible for rental assistance, but cannot find permanent housing with their allotted voucher amount.
- **Medicaid Homecare Services.** An indicator should be included to provide a count of the Medicaid-eligible clients who apply for homecare services and are denied, care outcomes, cost avoidance, and types of quality of service.
- **Supplemental Nutrition Assistance Program (SNAP).** The MMR/PMMR should include a metric for the number of days it takes SNAP users to exhaust their monthly benefits. Data on how quickly benefits are spent will help to determine the true emergency food needs that SNAP is not covering in the City.
- **Employment Services.** The MMR/PMMR should include an indicator for employment services broken out by employment program. Currently, all programs are grouped together, which does not permit comparison between programs or comprehensive assessment of individual program performance.

- **Emergency Food Assistance Program (EFAP).** Currently there are no performance metrics on the EFAP network in the MMR/PMMR and the reports on HRA's website have not been updated since 2016. It is important to measure the efficacy and monitor the performance of the EFAP system and its network of food assistance organizations across the City.

NYPD

- **Traffic Fatalities.** The MMR/PMMR currently groups bicyclists and passengers in the same indicator. This indicator should be split into two. Creating a separate indicator for bicyclists and passengers would create better perspective on transportation safety throughout the City.
- **Collision Investigation Squad.** The MMR/PMMR should include an indicator for investigations completed by the Collision Investigation Squad. This indicator would support the Vision Zero initiative and provide clarity to the NYPD's work with traffic investigation.

School Construction Authority (SCA)

- **New School Seats and Schools.** In the DOE/SCA Five-Year Capital Plan, capacity projects are disaggregated by grade level served: Pre-K, elementary/middle school, and middle/high school. The MMR/PMMR indicator that reports new school seats created should be similarly disaggregated.
- **Square Footage of School Space Created.** The MMR/PMMR currently includes indicators reporting on the cost per square foot of new schools constructed. The report should also include the total square footage of school space created annually.

Taxi and Limousine Commission (TLC)

- **Active Accessible For-Hire Vehicles (FHVs).** The MMR/PMMR currently reports on the number of active accessible yellow and green taxis, but does not report on the number of FHVs. FHVs encompass the largest share of TLC licensed vehicles, and should have a separate indicator.

<u>New Sections</u>

- **Judgements and Claims Budget.** Judgement and Claims payouts have averaged $722.5 million over the past five fiscal years. In order to better understand and manage this growth, the Council recommends including a section in the MMR/PMMR that breaks out the Judgement and Claims budget and expenditures based on which agency cases were filed against, and whether cases were defended by the Law Department or settled by the Comptroller or other entity.

Support Wage Equity and Human Services Providers

Wage Equity

Promoting wage equity across the public sector workforce, including contract workers, is essential to creating a fair and more stable New York City with quality public services. To advance progressive values and improve essential government programs, the Council calls on the Administration to re-evaluate public sector wages across the board and plan to correct disparities.

New York City's budget supports a workforce of more than 388,000 direct employees and thousands more indirect employees. The Council's review of pay equity has shown that leaving in place the effects of cost-cutting or out-sourcing decisions made long ago and failing to review pay across the wide range of the workforce has created substantial pay gaps for many workers. Wage disparities exist across agencies, even between similarly credentialed and experienced staff, and between and across the City and contract workforces. The Administration should examine the wage rates of all public sector employee groups to ensure that salaries are based on the work performed and the skills and experience required. The Administration should consider all components of pay, including benefits and overtime, as well as work schedules and demands. While the Council commends Mayor de Blasio for making great strides in raising wages across the board and settling union contracts, the pay equity issues not fixed through labor negotiations or contract right-sizing must be addressed.

Many of the City's current human services contracts have varied wages for the same type of positions. When compared to direct City employees, human services contract workers almost always earn less for the same work. Wage disparities among certain employee groups are particularly egregious, including early childhood education providers, public sector lawyers, nurses, and emergency medical technicians, all of whom provide essential services on behalf of the City. These City workers educate our children, provide medical services, and represent low-income residents in the judicial system. Furthermore, much of the workforce in these service areas are women of color, and pay inequities perpetuate existing gender and racial pay gaps.

There is no doubt that achieving pay parity for all categories of workers has a substantial financial cost. Accordingly, the Council is calling on the Administration to map out a plan and create a fund to achieve pay parity over the course of this Financial Plan.

Establish Pay Parity Across the Early Childhood Education System

The Council calls upon the Administration to add $89 million to address wage inequities within the City's early childhood education workforce. The Administration has financed its signature initiative, Pre-K for All, not only with a significant public investment, but also by paying the thousands of CBO teachers far less than their DOE counterparts. The Administration's effort to expand Universal Pre-K has relied on community-based organization (CBO) providers to serve about 60 percent of the 70,000 Pre-K students.

However, persistent pay disparities between teachers employed by DOE and similarly qualified teachers employed in community-based EarlyLearn and Pre-K centers have impacted the overall stability of the early childhood care and education system. Moreover it has unfairly penalized the diverse staff dedicated to teaching New York City's youngest children. Certified group teachers with a master's degree employed by CBOs have a starting salary that is $17,000 less than similarly-qualified teachers employed by DOE ($48,000 at CBOs compared to $65,000 at DOE). After ten years of service, this gap widens to around $36,000 ($48,000 at CBOs, with no increase despite longevity, compared to $84,000 at DOE). The disparities for teachers with a bachelor's degree are similar.

Additionally, it is not just CBO teachers whose wages are depressed. The day care center directors, administrators, cooks, and janitors who keep community-based centers safe and operational also earn less than their DOE counterparts. With EarlyLearn contracts moving from ACS to DOE in Fiscal 2020, and the City on the verge of establishing a comprehensive birth-through-12th grade education system, now is the time to correct the issue of pay inequity.

Therefore, it is imperative that the Administration take the first step towards pay parity for all early childhood education staff by assessing current contracts and the wage deficit between CBO teachers and DOE teachers. After such assessment, additional funding should be added to DOE's budget for current EarlyLearn provider current contracts, as well as for the upcoming EarlyLearn RFP.

Close the School Nurse Salary Gap

The Council calls on the Administration to eliminate the wage gap among school nurses. School nurses who work for DOHMH make $12,000 less than school nurses who work for DOE. The average salary for a DOHMH nurse is $54,573, in comparison to the $66,635 DOE nurses make. There are 780 school nurses who work for DOHMH.

Increase Emergency Medical Services Staff Pay Rates

Another workforce with exceptionally low wage rates is the emergency medical service (EMS) staff of the Fire Department (FDNY). The FDNY's emergency medical technicians (EMT) and paramedics not only earn less than their counterparts in other large U.S. cities and less than other health care workers, but also earn substantially less than firefighters. EMT salaries are approximately $40,000 lower than the average salary of a firefighter. The starting salary for an FDNY EMT is just $35,254, and only $48,237 for a paramedic. While a first-year firefighter makes $46,066, after five years of service, the salary grows to $85,292. The difference in firefighter salary and those of EMTs and paramedics grows to 68 and 31 percent, respectively, after five years. The pay disparity inside the FDNY leads to higher attrition rates among EMTs and paramedics. As the Administration plans to establish a diverse, fair, and talented FDNY it should reset wage rates for its workers.

Provide Pay Parity for District Attorneys

The Assistant District Attorneys (ADAs) who work for the five District Attorneys' offices are paid less than other government lawyers. The wage gap between ADAs and lawyers employed by the City's Law Department is striking insofar as the work is so similar. The Council pushed for a budget increase in Fiscal 2019 to bring ADA salaries up to Law Department salaries and the Adopted Budget included $5 million for pay parity. Unfortunately, OMB restricted the use of these additional funds to supplement wage increases only for the least experienced ADAs. Accordingly, 975 ADAs with up to five years of service had wage increases. While these increases were well-deserved, the budget agreement that the Council signed off on last year was intended to cover all ADAs. The Council calls on the Administration to continue to support salary increases for more experienced ADAs in the Fiscal 2020 budget by including $5 million, which in turn will eliminate the wage disparity between the ADAs and the attorneys at the Law Department.

Provide Pay Parity for Public Defense Providers

In addition to ADAs, the Administration should also provide $15 million for indigent defense and other non-profit legal service contracts at rates sufficient to close the gap with the attorneys at the Law Department. There are approximately 1,500 public service lawyers working for City contractors whose pay rates have not been reset to match government pay rates. Contracting out a government service should not be done to save money by paying unfair wages. The low salaries paid to public sector lawyers contribute to high turnover rates and a loss of expertise. Increasing the salaries of these attorneys would address issues of high attrition and allow attorneys to live and participate in the communities where they work.

Support Human Service Providers

In addition to wage equity, addressing deficiencies in the City's human services contracts will further promote equity across the City. Human services vendors and their employees are a vital arm of the City's government, and many City agencies rely on their non-profit partners to deliver their core public services. Because of the essential services delivered by human services providers, the Council calls upon the Administration to add $106 million to increase the reimbursement rate for indirect costs. This funding would increase the indirect rate to an average of 12 percent, up from ten percent. By further increasing the indirect rate, non-profits will be better situated to cover organizational administrative costs.

Despite recent investments by the Administration to adequately fund human services contracts, the contract rates paid to human services providers remain too low. A ten percent indirect rate does not adequately cover organizational administrative costs. Shortchanging our non-profit providers has negative consequences on service delivery and service quality. City agencies such as the DHS, DFTA, and DYCD, contract out almost all of their programs to non-profit human services providers. These providers deliver some of the most essential public services to New Yorkers including foster homes, homeless shelters, after-school programs, and social adult day care, among others. Contracted non-profit providers work with approximately 2.5 million New Yorkers each year and a many of these workers are women of color.

Safeguard Our Future

The priorities supported by the City's budget are dependent on the financial resources available to the City. Therefore, the City should safeguard the future of vital programs by ensuring that resources exist in future budgets to continue those investments. As noted by the Mayor in his presentation of the Fiscal 2020 Preliminary Budget, a possible economic slowdown is increasingly likely in the near future. While the Administration has taken steps to improve the City's ability to respond to a down turn, including adding $225 million in reserves in the Fiscal 2019 Adopted Budget, the Council believes more can and should be done to safeguard future budgets.

The Administration should continue to bolster the City's fiscal reserves to prepare for the inevitable rainy day. A strategy to preserve the more than $7 billion in annual federal funding the City receives should also be implemented. An accurate 2020 census count will ensure that result as well as representation of City priorities in both Washington D.C. and Albany. Finally, the City should explore the creation of a public bank, which would allow the City to leverage its resources in order to improve economic stability of underserved communities.

Expand Reserves

The Council calls on the Administration to add $250 million in reserves, strengthening the City's fiscal position and increasing its ability to weather future shocks. The City ended Fiscal 2018 with approximately $9.1 billion, or 10.3 percent, of adjusted expenditures in reserve. Adding $250 million to reserves now is another step in the right direction. The current U.S. economic expansion is reaching its tenth year and the economy is clearly slowing. In March 2019 the U.S. Treasury yield curve inverted for the first time since 2007, indicating an increased risk of an economic recession.

In the last great economic recession, revenue from the City's PIT fell from $8.2 billion in Fiscal 2008 to roughly $5.5 billion in Fiscal 2009, a decrease of nearly 33 percent. The MRT decreased by over 53 percent during the same period. Although the Council's economists are not forecasting an economic recession during the Financial Plan, given the revenue losses in the last recession, it is prudent for the City to continue to strengthen its fiscal position.

The City's credit rating increased to Aa1 from Aa2 by Moody's Investor Services last month. The upgrade is attributable to the City's ongoing strong financial management, including its level of reserves. Consequently, not only would higher reserves help the City manage the next economic downturn, but it could also yield a higher bond rating and lower debt service costs to the City.

Launch a Census 2020 Campaign

When the 2020 Bicentennial Census takes place next year the City should to make a commitment of resources to ensure a full population count to protect federal funding and the apportionment of seats in Albany and Washington D.C. The Council calls on the Administration to provide $40 million to maximize participation in the count.

The Fiscal 2020 Budget should allocate $20 million to a direct outreach effort conducted by a large mix of CBOs. CBOs should partner with the City's many Minority and Women-Owned Business Enterprises (MWBEs) that have deep and varied community connections. The Council also recommends that the Administration collaborate with the State to establish a single grant-making process for the City and State funding. With another $20 million investment, the Administration should also bolster its direct staff deployed to Census 2020 and launch a city-wide advertising campaign that includes social media, Metropolitan Transit Authority (MTA) advertisements, newspapers, TV campaign, radio, and targeted mailings.

Study the Creation of a Public Bank

The Council calls upon the Administration to study and issue a report on the creation of a public bank to be owned and operated by New York City. Currently, the City relies upon third-party commercial banks for its banking needs, yet many of these banks fail to adequately serve certain populations, such as low-income communities. As a result, these communities are often forced to access higher cost alternative financial services, further draining communities of wealth.

A public bank, owned by the City and funded with taxpayer money, would provide a transparent alternative to the third-party private banks. Many New Yorkers would benefit from a public bank, which could focus on the values and needs of local communities and provide them with resources for greater fiscal stability. Not only would a public bank provide banking services to those who do not currently have access, a public bank could provide affordable loans to consumers and businesses who are poorly served by main-stream banking solutions. Additionally, the City itself could increase the badly-needed supply of affordable housing, by loaning funds to not-for-profit developers. A public bank would expand low-cost financial service, spurring economic growth in some of the City's most underserved communities, and strengthening the City's overall economy in the process.

At a minimum, a thorough study would include an evaluation of existing public banks and best practices, an evaluation of the City's current relationships with private banks, and the legal and financial feasibility of establishing a New York City municipal bank, including the funds needed to capitalize the bank and methods for achieving that capitalization.

Invest In Our Schools

The New York City school system is the largest in the country, serving over 1.1 million students. As the student population grows and the programs offered by schools diversify, additional resources, for both operational and capital expenses, are imperative to meet the need. The school system also has deficiencies to correct and greater support would allow all our public schools to meet basic standards. Increased resources for Fair Student Funding, Teacher's Choice, mental health services, specialized classrooms, after school programs, and inclusive curriculums would add to the depth of services already provided by DOE.

Addressing school capital needs is also an integral part of serving our current and future students. The DOE's capital budget must identify seat need not just across five years, but across ten years, to facilitate a more realistic capital planning strategy. In addition, rectifying school accessibility issues and increasing investments in essential school components, such as bathrooms and air-conditioning in large assembly spaces including auditoriums and cafeterias, will make New York City schools an inclusive environment for all students.

Additional educational funding is not limited to Kindergarten through 12th grade classrooms, but also includes higher education. The City University of New York (CUNY) has established a rich and diverse system of research institutes focusing on specific populations that reflects our City's demographics, such as Puerto Rican studies and the Dominican Institute, but has yet to establish a learning center focusing on African-Americans. Now is the time for CUNY to build upon its current research portfolio and establish an African-American research project.

Increase Fair Student Funding

The Council calls on DOE to bring all public schools up to 100 percent of their Fair Student Funding (FSF) entitlements over the next four years. FSF is the single most important funding stream supporting New York City public schools, comprising two-thirds of a school's budget on average. In the current year, approximately $9.9 billion supports allocations to schools through the FSF formula. FSF is unrestricted, giving school principals the flexibility to decide how much to spend on instruction, support services, administrative functions, and enrichment programs. Principals use their discretion to create a unique school program that meets the needs of each student body. FSF is a formula developed by DOE to allocate school budget resources based on student attributes, student achievement, and school programs. The formula sets a per student cost and adjusts it by a set of standard weights.

Unfortunately, since its introduction in 2007, DOE has not adequately funded FSF, leaving most schools underfunded according to the formula. This year, all schools received a minimum of 90 percent of their FSF entitlements, with an average of 93 percent. These long-term funding deficits have left schools unable to properly support the academic needs of students or offer robust educational programs. DOE has recognized the importance of FSF in choosing to provide community schools and newly opening schools 100 percent of their FSF entitlements. All schools should receive the same treatment.

This year, DOE is short approximately $756 million to fully fund schools through FSF. DOE should dedicate $200 million in the Fiscal 2020 Executive Budget to raise the FSF floor to 93 percent and the FSF average to 95 percent. The Financial Plan should schedule further increases in Fiscal 2021 and the outyears so all schools receive 100 percent by Fiscal 2023.

A fully-funded FSF formula will enable schools to provide a complete range of essential educational programs, such as additional teachers to lower class size, licensed social workers and guidance counselors, support for homeless students, and enrichment programs in the arts and sciences.

Add School Social Workers

The Council calls on DOE to dedicate $13.75 million to hire an additional 110 social workers for high-need schools. There are more than 700 schools that do not have a full-time social worker on staff. Even at schools that do have social workers and guidance counselors, the ratio of these support staff to students is often egregiously high. Dedicated funding for staff who can support the social-emotional needs of students will ensure schools with vulnerable populations have the resources they need to succeed. DOE should also lift the hiring freeze on guidance counselors and social workers to ensure these positions can be filled as expeditiously as possible, and that principals have the freedom to find the staff most suited to meet the needs of their school community.

This investment would build upon the $13.9 million for support for students in shelter that includes 69 Bridging the Gap social workers. The Council is also calling on the Administration to baseline this program, which has been successful in supporting schools with high portions of students in temporary housing. However, there are over 100 schools with more than 50 students in shelter that do not have a Bridging the Gap social worker and additional resources for social workers should be targeted to these schools.

Provide Mental Health Services to Students

The Council calls on DOE to provide direct mental health support to students through a mental health continuum as recommended by the Mayor's Leadership Team on School Climate and Discipline.[11] Developing a continuum of services in schools would give students with significant mental health needs access to direct mental health services and behavioral supports so they can remain in school. The Fiscal 2020 Executive Budget should reallocate $11 million in ThriveNYC funding currently budgeted in Central Administration to instead provide direct services to students through this mental health continuum.

Hire Title IX Coordinators for Schools

The Council calls on DOE to hire seven additional full-time Title IX coordinators for their borough offices. Title IX coordinators are key to supporting school environments that are free from sexual violence and discrimination and that welcome and support all students. Currently, the DOE has one Title IX coordinator serving the entire school system of 1.1 million students. Hiring additional Title IX coordinators will ensure a more appropriate staffing level for these crucial supports. The Fiscal 2020 Budget should include $856,800 for these positions.

Establish an Education Support Center at PATH

The Council calls on DOE to invest $500,000 to establish an Education Support Center at the DHS Prevention Assistance and Temporary Housing (PATH) intake center. This funding will allow every family who participates in the shelter intake process the opportunity to meet with a DOE staff member who can share information about school selection options and transportation, the shelter transfer process, early childhood education opportunities, and other school services. These staff members can also help prioritize and address cases in which there are significant barriers to school attendance and arrange interim transportation while school bus service is arranged. Furthermore, six additional staff

---

[11] The Mayor's Leadership Team on School Climate and Discipline. "Maintaining the Momentum: A Plan for Safety and Fairness in Schools." July 2016. Available at: https://www1.nyc.gov/assets/sclt/downloads/pdf/SCLT_Report_7-21-16.pdf

would allow staggered schedules to ensure no matter when families are at PATH they can speak to someone about their children's educational options and connect to appropriate educational services.

Ensure Busing Service for Students in Foster Care

The Council calls on DOE to hire a transportation coordinator for children in foster care. Federal law requires local school districts and child welfare agencies to collaborate to keep students in their original schools when they enter foster care or change placements, including providing transportation to their original school. However, students in foster care who do not meet general busing eligibility criteria must apply for busing through an emergency busing request form. Even when these requests are submitted, they are sometimes denied by DOE. In 2016, DOE hired a transportation coordinator for students in temporary housing to ensure these students were able to receive appropriate transportation to remain in their original schools. DOE should similarly hire a transportation coordinator for students in foster care. This coordinator can ensure that students in kindergarten through 6th grade in foster care receive bus service through an existing route or new route as appropriate. The number of additional routes that would be needed would be relatively small compared to the total number of school bus routes and could be accommodated within the budget for pupil transportation contracts. No student placed in foster care should be forced to transfer schools due to lack of transportation, and adding funding to DOE's budget for a transportation coordinator for students in foster care will ensure this doesn't happen. The Fiscal 2020 Executive Budget should include $90,000 for this position.

Support the LGBTQ-Inclusive Curriculum

The Council calls on DOE to dedicate $1 million to the LGBTQ-Inclusive Curriculum, following the Council's lead in allocating resources to this specific need. At the Council's urging, DOE has taken important steps to support LGBTQ students and staff by hiring an LGBTQ Liaison and providing funding to create and sustain student clubs, including Gay Straight Alliances (GSAs). Since Fiscal 2017, the Council has allocated discretionary funding to support non-profit organizations that provide materials, professional development, and classroom visits to schools to support LGBTQ-inclusive curriculum. The Council calls on the Administration to similarly invest in these vital supports.

Promote Diversity and Integration

The Council calls on the DOE to promote diversity and integration by expanding gifted and talented programs, funding additional test preparation for the Specialized High Schools Admissions Test (SHSAT), creating new City-specialized high schools, and funding district integration plans.

DOE recently offered 4,798 students admittance to one of the eight specialized high schools, only 11 percent of whom are black or Hispanic. While the Council advocates for changes to State law that would restore the City's control over admission to the specialized high schools, there are steps DOE can take in the meantime to ensure students have the opportunity to access advanced academic programs. DOE should work with communities to revamp and restore full gifted and talented programs in every school district. In addition, as long as SHSAT is the sole method by which admission to specialized high schools is determined, DOE should allocate $1 million to expand its test preparation programs to prepare as many students as possible to succeed on the exam.

In addition, DOE should create additional City-specialized high schools, separate from the eight test-based specialized high schools already in existence, to increase the number of students enrolled in accelerated college-preparatory high schools. These schools should receive the same additional funding specialized high schools do in the FSF formula, an extra weight of 0.25 per student. DOE should plan to create at least 30,000 City-specialized high school seats over the course of four years. Assuming DOE begins to open City-specialized high schools for the 2020-2021 school year, the Financial Plan should reflect increased funding for these schools in Fiscal 2021 and the outyears. In addition, DOE's Fiscal 2020 budget should allocate $200,000 to support planning for the first cohort of City-specialized high schools that would open for the 2020-2021 school year.

Finally, DOE should double its current investment of $2 million in district integration plans. This investment was announced following a successful pilot in School District 15 that was community-led and inclusive, and is expected to support plans in ten school districts. Funding additional district integration plans would expand the reach of this collaborative school integration planning process to the majority of districts.

Baseline Teacher's Choice

The Council calls on the Administration to baseline $20 million for Teacher's Choice. The Council has supported Teacher's Choice, which allows educators to purchase classroom supplies, for 20 years. Teachers often spend hundreds of dollars annually out of pocket to purchase materials such as general classroom supplies, library books, science manipulatives, and instructional computer software. Support for this essential program should come from the Administration, not year-over-year one-time funding by the Council, and should be baselined at the current funding level of $20 million, which provides each teacher with $250.

Redesign and Expand COMPASS for Elementary Students

The Council calls on the Administration to add $90 million to redesign and expand the COMPASS elementary program by improving and offering new programs, refreshing existing models, and expanding the number of slots from roughly 47,000 to 100,000. There are approximately 500,000 students in kindergarten through 5th grade enrolled in DOE schools. The DYCD COMPASS elementary afterschool program can accommodate only nine percent of this population. Although New York State has not set a minimum age at which children can be left unsupervised in the home, many parents face challenging decisions about their own work and school schedules when care is otherwise unavailable.

Part of the COMPASS redesign should be the introduction of a sliding scale fee based on family income, with low-income families still paying nothing. A modest fee would not only support program expansion but could also help diversify the mix of programs offered during afterschool hours. There are thousands of families who would gladly enroll their children in a school-based afterschool program if one were available. The current alternative for these families is market rate afterschool programs, home-based child care, or leaving children home unsupervised. This redesign is timely and should be folded into the forthcoming contracting process. The Administration should also ensure that the price per participant is raised in the new contract, as the current rates are too low to support the full costs of services. By providing slots for additional participants, redesigning COMPASS will not only ensure that more children receive rigorous afterschool programming, but will also increase economic development across the City and safeguard a continuum of services for the family unit and child alike.

Create an African-American Research Institute

The Council requests that the Administration support CUNY with a $500,000 allocation in Fiscal 2020 for the creation of an African-American Research Project. In CUNY, as in most institutions of higher education, the normal focus for instruction and research is the academic department and continuing education programs. At the same time, CUNY benefits greatly from the activities of centers, institutes, consortia, and special initiatives. Currently, CUNY has a total of 166 Institutes and Centers, including 42 Research Institutes and 124 Centers, none solely concentrated on African-American interdisciplinary topics.

Reimagine the School Capital Plan

On October 31, 2018, the Council outlined its vision for the DOE Fiscal 2020-2024 Five-Year Capital Plan in a letter to the Administration. The vision consisted of five major recommendations, discussed in detail below. The Council was disappointed none of these recommendations were implemented in the February 2019 Proposed Fiscal 2020-2024 DOE Five-Year Capital Plan. The Council calls on the Administration to seriously consider these recommendations and work with the Council to implement them.

Implement the recommendations of "Planning to Learn: The School Building Challenge"

- Formally identifying Pre-K seat need (including seats for three year olds);
- Improving the integrity of the K-12 identified seat need; and
- Projecting seat need on a rolling ten-year basis in addition to the identified seat need, which was historically only done through the final year of the Five-Year Capital Plan.

Implementing these recommendations would facilitate holistic school capital planning, one of the key goals of the Ten-Year Strategy. Historic underinvestment in school capacity has meant the City is constantly playing catch-up with seat need. This challenge is exacerbated by the addition of Universal Pre-K and 3-K to the public school system. The creation of a more accurate Ten-Year Capital Strategy is a bulwark against the City constantly lagging behind in school capacity.

In particular, the Council calls on the Administration to restore identified seat need to the Five-Year Capital Plan. The February 2019 Proposed DOE Capital Plan, like the November 2018 Proposed Plan, does not include an identified seat need. It also makes major changes to where seat need is funded compared to the November 2017 identified seat need without any explanation. For example, there are 3,961 less funded seats in District 24 than expected, based on the most recent identified seat need. The presentation of a Proposed Five-Year Capital Plan without identified seat need reflects an uncooperative and non-transparent approach by the Administration to funding new schools, particularly given the Council's extensive work on school planning.

Reset Baseline expectations for safe and supportive learning environments

Accessibility, physical education spaces, and air-conditioning are school essentials, not enhancements. The Five-Year Capital Plan should reflect this reality by formally assessing the need for these components across existing buildings, while identifying a strategy to prioritize and fund these projects. Historically, the City allocated a specific amount of funding to these program areas and simply funded as many projects as possible without clear goals or an assessment of overall need. This is inadequate planning for our schools, which are a key component of the City's infrastructure. Reforming the approach to funding these kinds of projects to reflect holistic capital planning would also facilitate the creation of a more accurate Ten-Year Capital Strategy, while formal plans for prioritization would help the school capital plan meet the Ten-Year Strategy's equity goals.

The Council calls on the Administration to add funding to the Five-Year Capital Plan for essential school components:

- $50 million for school bathroom renovations, to bring the total investment to $100 million;
- $240 million to provide all schools with security cameras;
- $175 million for cafeteria redesigns in an additional 300 schools; and
- dedicated funding for air-conditioning in the assembly spaces in schools such as cafeterias, kitchens, auditoriums, and gymnasiums that currently lack it.

In addition, while the Proposed Fiscal 2020-2024 Five-Year Capital Plan includes $750 million for technology, funding should be committed as quickly and efficiently as possible given the inadequate bandwidth in many schools. The Ten-Year Capital Strategy should reflect the investment in technology needed to ensure schools' technology infrastructure remains up-to-date in the long-term, and to increase schools' access to bandwidth in line with increases in demand.

Finally, the Council calls on the Administration to allocate $20 million to support the cost of the American's with Disability Act's (ADA) path of travel compliance for projects funded with discretionary capital. The SCA has recently begun complying with path of travel accessibility requirements for construction projects, which will increase the cost of projects funded by council members and borough presidents. Rather than reducing the scope of these projects to accommodate their current budgets, or returning to the sponsors to request additional funding, the Administration should dedicate funding to ensure these projects can be completed as intended while also meeting accessibility requirements.

Adopt a more rigorous focus on efficiency and innovation

While the Council expects the school capital plan to increase in size, there are competing demands on the City's capital budget and resources invested in education construction must be spent wisely. The portion of capital improvement projects completed on-time and within budget has been decreasing, which is a major concern given how expensive education capital projects already are. The SCA should find ways to increase efficiency, which aligns with the Ten-Year Strategy goal of maintaining New York City's financial responsibility.

Revise the presentation of the Five-Year Capital Plan and increase transparency

The Council has numerous recommendations for improving the presentation of the Five-Year Capital Plan. Most critically, the Council calls on the Administration to publish the Five-Year Capital Plan in a universal machine-readable format. In addition, SCA should work with DOE to provide school communities with better, real-time information about the Capital Plan and capital projects. Providing better information to the Council and school communities also facilitates the goal of the Ten-Year Capital Strategy to consider community perspectives in capital planning and decision-making.

Renew collaboration with the Council

The Administration and the Council should review the current capital project request process and identify improvements to ensure this is an insightful tool for highlighting otherwise overlooked areas of improvement. In addition, there may be opportunities for discretionary capital allocations to be more targeted and impactful with citywide coordination The Council and Administration should explore a mechanism to accomplish this.

Protect New Yorkers in Need

The Fiscal 2020 Preliminary Budget includes funding for services for New York City's most vulnerable populations including those suffering from mental illness or substance abuse, and individuals and families living in unstable housing or homeless shelters. Our City agencies try to provide appropriate services to seniors, foster youth, lower-skilled jobseekers, day laborers, immigrants, vulnerable tenants, and climate refugees, but the proposed budget is not adequate. City programs will undoubtedly increase the quality of life for many New Yorkers, but at their currently funded levels they will not reach all New Yorkers who need them. Additionally, City agencies are not adequately funded to administer their programs, which will significantly impact the efficacy of this Administration's major initiatives. With these needs in mind, the Council calls for additional investments in community supports and human services that will offer valuable services and reduce disparities for our City's neediest.

Increase the Supportive Housing Rate

The Council urges the Administration to add $20 million to the Fiscal 2020 Executive Budget for scattered site supportive housing. The current rate for the DOHMH units has been stagnant for years, ranging from $11,000 to $16,000 per unit. However, the fair market rent for a studio has continued to increase to its current rate of $18,708. The creation of NYC 15/15 has greatly assisted in the improvement of supportive housing, but the rate of the legacy programs needs to match the rate of NYC 15/15. The current rate for NYC 15/15 is $28,168 for a single adult. With $20 million, DOHMH can bring the 1,800 scattered site units up to the NYC 15/15 rate.

Support Fair Futures

Fair Futures would provide a first-in-the-nation, long-term, comprehensive support system for foster youth, from middle school through age 26. Based on a proven coaching model, the proposed investment has been shown to increase the high school graduation rate from 22 percent to 90 percent among participating foster youth, according to the Fair Futures coalition. In addition to better educational and work outcomes, New York's foster youth gain self-sufficiency by working with their long-term coach to meet the challenges of aging into adulthood.

Finally, Fair Futures would save the City money in criminal justice, health, and shelter costs that all too often result from an unsupported transition into adulthood for foster youth. The Council calls on the Administration to add $10 million to ACS' Fiscal 2020 Executive Budget to initially launch this transformational program, with a commitment to scale up to $50 million within three fiscal years. The funding would be used to amend foster care agency contracts to provide for the additional supports.

Invest in Bridge Programs

Bridge programs are the "on ramp" for lower-skilled jobseekers, providing access to education and training programs in a continuum that leads to quality jobs with family-supporting wages, and the Administration's Career Pathways report recommended that the City spend $60 million annually by 2020 on bridge programs. The Council urges the Administration to meet the full $60 million annual target and to add an additional $10 million in the Fiscal 2020 Executive Budget by supporting a range of programs funded through EDC, CUNY, DYCD, HRA, and SBS. The Council also calls upon the Administration to provide a comprehensive budget and operations report on all City-funded bridge programming with each Financial Plan.

Social Workers for Families with Children in Hotel Shelters

The Council calls upon the Administration to allocate $4.9 million in Fiscal 2020 for 57 social workers, one for each of the DHS contracted hotels that house families with children. Social workers provide vital support to homeless residents, such as case management and access to mental health services. Currently, social workers are only present in purpose-built shelters for families with children. Given that the average length of stay for families with children in shelter is over 400 days, homeless families residing in hotels also need the same support services provided at purpose-built shelters in order to transition out of shelters.

Expand the Office of the Tenant Advocate

The Fiscal 2020 Budget should include an additional $300,000 for three positions in the Office of the Tenant Advocate (OTA) within DOB. The current budget is $200,000, which supports two positions. As of December 2018, the average response time from the date on which an inquiry was received by the OTA to the date it took to respond was 5.3 days and the average response time for an inquiry that required an inspection was 5.9 days. The increase would allow OTA to take a more proactive approach to enforcement.

Create Overdose Prevention Centers

Based on the findings of the 2018 supervised injection facilities (SIF) study conducted by DOHMH, the Council urges the Administration to implement a two-year SIF pilot, potentially at a syringe exchange site. A SIF pilot would enable DOHMH to study the effects of such a facility on the rates of HIV and hepatitis C infection and drug overdose deaths in the City. The State has temporarily delayed the authorization of these overdose prevention centers, but the City should be fully prepared to initiate the programs when the State comes to a conclusion.

Expand the Source of Income Unit

The City Commission on Human Rights (CCHR) began investigating and responding to claims of source of income (SOI) discrimination in housing in January 2018. SOI discrimination undermines the City's housing voucher programs intended to help New Yorkers avoid or leave the shelter system. The Fiscal 2020 Preliminary Budget provides $370,000 and six positions for the SOI unit. The unit fields a team of three staff who can respond to SOI claims within an hour to immediately intervene and prevent discriminatory practices from denying housing to New Yorkers. The other three staff are attorneys who investigate persistent bad actors. Recognizing the prevalence of this discrimination, CCHR's dedicated SOI unit should be provided with $410,000 to fund personnel and equipment costs for an additional six positions.

Expand Child Care at CUNY

The mission of CUNY has always been to provide a first-rate and accessible education, regardless of background or income level. For many students, access to child care is a prerequisite to succeeding at CUNY. Seventeen percent of CUNY's degree-seeking students at community colleges and 11 percent of students at senior colleges are parents. CUNY offers child care services to approximately 1,500 student-parents at 16 centers, however, many of these programs have long waitlists. CUNY childcare is also available to CUNY staff and to community members whenever there is space available. To help more parent-students enroll and graduate from CUNY, the Council calls on the Administration to increase CUNY's $5.3 million child care budget by $1 million in Fiscal 2020 to expand or create new child care centers. The $1 million should be baselined and replace the $600,000 Council discretionary award included in the Fiscal 2019 Adopted Budget.

Create a Language Interpreter Bank

The Council calls for the Administration to allocate $2 million in the Fiscal 2020 Executive Budget to pilot a language interpreter bank. Language access is critical for New York City's diverse communities. Three out of every five New Yorkers are immigrants or children of immigrants, and nearly one in four New Yorkers have limited English proficiency. The Council supports the creation of a pilot worker-cooperative program in the form of a community interpreter bank to provide translation services, including sign language translation, which can be utilized by CBOs and City offices to provide language access services to New Yorkers.

Support the New York Immigrant Family Unity Project

The Council calls for the Administration to allocate and baseline $16.5 million in the Fiscal 2020 Executive Budget to support the New York Immigrant Family Unity Project (NYIFUP). To keep families together and communities strong, the City should provide counsel for all immigrants facing deportation who cannot afford a lawyer. Funding would cover intake and full legal representation of the expanded detained docket at Varick Street which is currently being covered by NYIFUP. This program would cover detained and non-detained people who are in removal proceedings.

In March 2019, the City Council increased funding for NYIFUP by $1.6 million, in addition to the $10 million allocated for Fiscal 2019 in recognition of the impact of the Trump Administration's lack of prioritization for initiating deportation for immigrants considered removable. This created backlogs, with more immigrants held in detention – many for over six months – while their legal case completion timelines are extended. The Fiscal 2020 Preliminary Budget includes $19.6 million for the Immigration Opportunity Initiative/Deportation Defense (IOI) program, however, it is not clear within the budget how much funding is allocated specifically for removal defense work.

Improve Senior Meals

One in seven seniors in New York City is food insecure, and one in four uses food stamps. DFTA's network of senior centers, and its home-delivered meals program, provide an essential nutrition safety net for New York's seniors. Unfortunately, DFTA's meal programs are significantly under-resourced, which reduces both the quantity and quality of food offered. DFTA's last across-the-board increase in food reimbursements was in 2014, when regular meals received twenty-five cents and kosher meals received fifty cents. Furthermore, DFTA's recent model contracting process made no adjustments to congregate or home-delivered meal rates. The City's reimbursement rate for senior meals is 20 percent below the national average.

The Council calls on the Administration to increase DFTA's budget by $11.7 million to add an average of $1 per meal in provider contracts, which would cost approximately $7.2 million for congregate meals at senior centers and $4.5 million for home-delivered meals. As DFTA and OMB continue their six-months delayed food system analysis, now is the time to correct historic underfunding for meals. Additional meals funding should also provide community-based providers the flexibility to provide urgently needed raises for kitchen staff, delivery drivers, kitchen inspections, and/or health and safety mandates.

Guarantee Air-Conditioning at Senior Centers

The Council calls on the Administration to create a dedicated new expense funding stream of $1 million at DFTA to ensure rapid completion of emergency repairs to cooling and heating systems at senior centers, which are usually not capital project eligible. Senior centers serve as cooling centers for seniors, and air condition repairs should be addressed prior to summer. This funding should assist senior centers located on New York City Housing Authority (NYCHA) developments and those that are City-owned or community-based organization owned.

Expand the Nurse Family Partnership

The Council calls on the administration to add $1 million to expand the Nurse-Family Partnership program. The current baselined funding is $4 million, and the increase would enable the Nurse-Family Partnership to sustain existing sites and grow in new communities. The Nurse-Family Partnership is an evidence-based community health program that has been proven to improve pregnancy outcomes, child health and development, and the economic self-sufficiency of families.

Prevent Deed Fraud and Foreclosure

The Fiscal 2020 Executive Budget should include an additional $1 million to fund legal representation for homeowners who cannot afford an attorney in foreclosure cases. According to the Office of Civil Justice's 2018 Annual Report, the percentage of New Yorkers represented by counsel in foreclosure proceedings fell from 53 percent to 48 percent between 2016 and 2017. Therefore, the budget for the Office of Civil Justice should include an additional $1 million in Fiscal 2019 to fund civil legal advice and representation for issues that include deed theft scams targeting homeowners at risk of foreclosure. This funding should also be reflected in the outyears.

Improve Client Services at Human Resources Administration

HRA's eligibility specialists help determine and verify client eligibility for public assistance, including Cash Assistance, Medicaid, emergency housing, and SNAP. Over the course of the last four years, HRA has reduced eligibility specialist headcount by approximately 400 positions, leading to a steady increase in client wait times. In order to decrease wait times, improve services administered, and improve clients' experience, the Council calls upon HRA to hire an additional 100 eligibility specialists at a cost of $6.3 million.

Support Climate Refugees

The Council calls upon the Administration to provide support to climate refugees that migrate to New York City due to sudden or gradual alterations in their natural environment related to at least one of three impacts of climate change: sea-level rise, extreme weather events, or drought and water scarcity. The City should utilize existing resources to develop a coordinated effort across DOE and the human services agencies, including HRA, DHS, DOHMH, and DFTA. This effort should include dedicated resources to provide case management services, benefits eligibility screening, and assistance with applications for public assistance or other support services.

Provide Diapers and Wipes at City Programs

Local Law 182 of 2018 requires operators of City-funded child care centers, homeless shelters, domestic violence shelters, Family Justice Centers, and DOE LYFE programs to offer diapers and baby wipes to clients. The Council calls upon Administration to closely monitor implementation of Local Law 182 to ensure that all covered organizations are in full compliance with the law so that all clients have easy access to a supply of diapers and baby wipes. Monitoring should ensure that providers have sufficient funding in place to purchase and restock supplies.

Baseline the Day Laborer Initiative

The Council calls on the Administration to create a dedicated new expense funding stream of $2 million to support the City's day laborers. Between 8,000 and 10,000 day laborers, most of whom are recently arrived immigrants, live and work in New York City. Funds should support the operation and development of day laborer centers that provide dignified physical space for day laborers to meet, referrals to jobs or support services, legal services to address issues such as wage theft, as well as workforce training and development.

Effective Budgeting for Better Governance

In order to ensure that City government works efficiently for all New Yorkers, it is imperative that essential City services are adequately funded. The City provides a broad range of services to meet the needs of New York City's diverse and ever developing population. However, the Fiscal 2020 Preliminary Budget does not adequately reflect the necessary funding levels for services related to civic engagement and election reform, community boards, parks and green spaces, and other needs accessed by all New Yorkers.

Introduce Ranked Choice Voting

The Council calls for the Administration to support and introduce ranked choice voting to avoid costly run offs and inspire voters to vote their preference, if ranked choice voting becomes legally authorized. Currently, in non-special citywide elections, if no candidate gets above 40 percent of the vote, an additional run-off election must be held between the two candidates with the largest number of votes. This most recently occurred in 2013 for the Democratic primary for the Office of Public Advocate, and cost the City $10.4 million. The Council advocates for the implementation of ranked choice voting in order to eliminate the need for costly and unnecessary runoff elections.

Offer Translation at Poll-Sites

The BOE currently offers interpretation services in Spanish, Chinese, Bengali and Korean in neighborhoods with large numbers of speakers of these languages. Unfortunately, interpretation services in some of the City's most commonly spoken languages, including Russian, Haitian Creole, Yiddish, and Polish are not offered.

In Fiscal 2019, pursuant to an agreement with the City Council, the Mayor's Office of Immigrant Affairs (MOIA) launched a supplementary program to provide poll-site interpretation services in languages not covered by the Board of Elections. However, the program is not funded in the Fiscal 2020 Preliminary Budget. The Council calls for the Administration to restore $640,000 and add $400,000 for this program in Fiscal 2020 to expand the scope of the program to cover additional poll sites. In addition, the Council calls on the Administration to transfer operation of the poll-site interpreters program to the Voter Assistance Advisory Committee, an independent body that specializes in voter outreach and engagement.

Baseline Community Boards' Fiscal 2019 Budget Increase

In Fiscal 2019, the Council allocated $42,500 to each Community Board, for a total of $2.5 million. Community Boards have utilized this funding for a variety of productive projects, including the modernization of outdated technology, purchasing of new furniture, development of Community Relationship Management software, and community events, among several other uses. The Council calls on the Administration to baseline this funding in Fiscal 2020 and the outyears.

Hire Additional Medicolegal Investigators

The Council calls on the Administration to add $400,000 and four medicolegal investigator positions to OCME's budget. A larger staff would allow OCME to better support death scene investigations and maintain adequate scene arrival times. OCME's Fiscal 2020 Preliminary Budget includes approximately $4.3 million to support 36 medicolegal investigators.

Hire 911 Staff

The City's police communications technicians handle emergency 911 calls and effectively direct response efforts while keeping citizens calm and safe from danger. NYPD's Communications Division has a budget of $131 million and supports more than 1,500 police communications technicians. The rollout of 911 next generation technologies such as support for text, photos, and videos is expected to begin with the addition of text messaging capability in Fiscal 2020. To support this important transformation, the Council calls on the Administration to provide $11.2 million to hire 200 new police communications technicians to serve in emergency call centers.

Civilianize of NYPD Positions

Identifying opportunities to improve efficiency is crucial for an effective government, and the NYPD has had success in the past with civilianization efforts, whereby uniform officers performing a range of non-enforcement functions are replaced with civilian personnel. NYPD should continue these efforts by initiating a new plan to civilianize the 368 positions they have identified as improperly staffed. In Fiscal 2020, the NYPD can onboard 100 civilians at a cost of $5.4 million which would achieve an overall savings on salary expenditures of $4.5 million annually. A multi-year effort to civilianize 368 positions would eventually achieve a savings of $17 million by converting police positions into the appropriate civilian position. Furthermore, in addition to reducing expenses, uniform officers would be freed to support law enforcement and community policing efforts.

Fair Funding for Parks

DPR's budget is small relative to the City's budget as a whole; it has been less than one percent of the City's budget for years. This trend has prevailed despite steady increases in the City's overall spending and population growth. The Council calls on the Administration to increase DPR's Fiscal 2020 Executive Budget by $26.5 million to improve maintenance and operations. The additional funding should be allocated as follows.

- $4 million for care and maintenance of natural forests to ensure that they remain healthy and resilient in our changing climate;
- $8 million to improve the 550 Green Thumb gardens with new soil, new raised beds, and other resources that gardeners need;
- $4 million for the 395 playgrounds to host structured sports and afterschool programs for children in every district;
- $3 million to add 50 new Urban Park Rangers; and
- $7.5 million to hire an additional 100 Parks Enforcement Patrol officers - of which 20 should be deployed to prevent illegal dumping in Parks areas.

Continue the Derelict Boat Removal Program

The Council calls on the Administration to restore DEP's boat removal program with an allocation of $400,000 in the Fiscal 2020 Executive Budget. Derelict boats litter our local waterbodies and threaten our ocean, coasts, and waterways by obstructing navigation channels. These boats also pose harm to the environment and to those using our waterbodies for recreational activities. A comprehensive cleanup program is necessary to ensure our waterbodies are protected both now and in the future.

Promote the Zero Waste Initiative

The Council calls upon DSNY to include an additional $2.25 million in the Fiscal 2020 Executive Budget to improve public participation and support for the Zero Waste initiative, the City's plan to eliminate the need to send waste to out-of-state landfills by 2030. Currently, it is unclear whether the City is on track to meet this aggressive goal as the annual diversion rates hover around 20 percent. The Council believes this funding will bolster diversion rates and better align the City with its goal.

Move Sanitation Vehicles off of City Streets

The Council calls upon the Administration to relocate DSNY operational vehicles that are currently parked in residential neighborhoods, to new, centralized locations within their respective sanitation districts. By centrally locating personnel and vehicle fleet, specifically in areas of Manhattan and Brooklyn, DSNY would improve efficiencies and reduce safety/air quality risks to local residents and small businesses.

Add Staff to Engine Companies

The Council calls upon the Administration to allocate $11.2 million to fund a fifth firefighter at 20 additional engine companies across the City. Currently, there are over 190 engine companies in New York City. In 2011, the fifth firefighter was removed from every engine company. To date, 20 engine companies operate with a five-firefighter crew due to a wage contract reached in 2015. However, these 20 companies are at risk of losing their fifth firefighter. The FDNY's call volume is on the rise along with response times, with some companies doing 6,000 to 7,000 runs a year. The $11.2 million investment in Fiscal 2020 should add staff to more engine companies to protect New York City's public safety.

Enhance Cultural Funding

The Council calls on the Administration to increase the budget for the Department of Cultural Affairs (DCLA) by $10 million. New York includes the most renowned arts and culture institutions in the world. These institutions are integral to the stability and growth of their neighborhoods and their resources are accessed by New York City schoolchildren, teachers, families, as well as international audiences. The cultural organizations of New York have served as the houses of successful pilot programs such as IDNYC and PlaNYC. They contribute to the economy by serving as major employers of New Yorkers and by increasing the traffic at the small businesses in the neighborhoods they are at. In order to ensure that the goals and intentions of the CreateNYC Cultural Plan is met and to ensure that the cultural institutions continue to serve as reliable community hubs that provide needed programs and services to New Yorkers the cultural community needs significant additional funding.

Enhance Library Funding

The Council urges the Administration to add $27 million for the three library systems in Fiscal 2020 so that they can continue to maintain, grow and offer the programs and services they have been providing. Additionally, the Council would like the Administration to baseline the $8 million one-time funding that the Council had allocated to the systems in the Fiscal 2019 Adopted Budget. Libraries have an essential presence in every neighborhood of New York providing indispensable services in a safe and reliable space to the youth, seniors, immigrants, and incarcerated individuals among other New Yorkers. Early literacy, English for Speakers of Other Languages classes and video visitation for incarcerated individuals are just some of the numerous agency partnerships and countless department collaborations the systems do each year.

The library systems have developed new and inventive ways to engage the communities such as senior debates and virtual bowling leagues for senior patrons thereby engaging communities that might otherwise be isolated and overlooked. Technology at the libraries is a lifeline for all the patrons, from teen tech STEM program to building, coding, and programming robots, the libraries have found innovative ways to engage the young adults. The libraries strengthen community engagement and, with $27 million additional funding the systems will be able to increase collections, programming and staff. Along with increase in programing and circulation, the systems have also seen a rise in cost of materials, staff, and operating expenses. Funds are needed to maintain physical spaces and cover repairs and upkeep that are not capitally eligible. The cost of providing six-day services has increased and substantial funding is needed to sustain operation and ensure the libraries continue to provide vital programs to the patrons and the communities.

Adjust How the City Charges Interest

To encourage delinquent taxpayers to resolve outstanding tax debt, the City should consolidate payment agreement plans with the City's main collections agency, DOF, and offer a lower interest rate to property owners who remain current on their payment plans. This will streamline the process for property owners to deal with outstanding debt, as well as provide an incentive to stay current on the payment plans. In addition, the lower interest rate will provide some relief to property owners who fell behind in their tax bills, which often occurs due to financial stress of the homeowner.

The City should also move away from compounding interest daily to applying interest to outstanding debt at monthly intervals. Having specific dates when interest will be applied will draw greater attention to taxpayers to settle outstanding debts, as opposed to the current practice which applies interest gradually and evenly across each day of the month. Addressing a debt becomes more urgent to a taxpayer when they are given a stringent date to abide by. For example, being charged $150 on the 15th of each month creates more urgency to a taxpayer than being charged $5 of interest per day for a month. This step would improve the effectiveness of interest rates as a tool to encourage taxpayers to pay bills in a timely manner.

Maintain Current Programs

While the traditional "budget dance" ended with the conclusion of the Bloomberg Administration, the de Blasio Administration continues a version of this dance with certain vital programs that are funded on a short-term, one-year basis. This strategy is an attempt to have the Council settle for the restoration of programs that the Council knows are so important to its constituents in lieu of the inclusion of other budget priorities. Most of these programs are small cost, high impact programs and should have a stable funding stream. The Fiscal 2019 Adopted Budget included one-year funding totaling $157.9 million to support a variety of several critical programs, such as park maintenance, senior center programming and after-school programs, among others. Given the importance of these initiatives, the Council urges the Administration to baseline funding in the Fiscal 2020 Executive Budget.

It is important to note that the Administration did not comply to the Fiscal 2019 Adopted Budget agreement negotiated with the Council for ACS to self-fund three Foster Care Task Force initiatives - $2.8 million for family time visiting, $3.3 million for kinship navigators, and $1.7 million for ACS workforce employment. It is the Council's expectation that the Administration fully fund these three initiatives for Fiscal 2020 since there was not adherence to the Fiscal 2019 agreement.

Baseline Priorities	Agency	Fiscal 2019 Amount
Youth Health Initiative	ACS	$500,000
Child Care Contracts	ACS	$4,500,000
Foster Care Task Force Initiatives Promised at FY19	ACS	$7,800,000
Offer Translation at Poll Sites	CFB, MOIA	$640,000
Remediation Programs	CUNY	$2,000,000
Cultural Funding	DCLA	$13,750,000
Home Delivered Meals Rate Increase	DFTA	$2,840,000
Naturally Occurring Retirement Communities	DFTA	$1,000,000
Senior Centers	DFTA	$2,800,000
Baseline Bridging the Gap	DOE	$13,900,000
Community School Sustainability	DOE	$2,566,667
LGBTQ Family Outreach	DOE	$200,000
Restorative Justice	DOE	$1,300,000
Urban Advantage	DOE	$3,500,000
Animal Care Centers of NYC	DOHMH	$3,000,000
Beach and Pool Season Extension	DPR	$1,722,596
Parks Maintenance	DPR	$9,553,205
Tree Stump Removal	DPR	$1,000,000
Pick up More Trash	DSNY	$4,200,000
Add 5,000 more SYEP slots	DYCD	$11,900,000
Adult Literacy Initiative	DYCD	$8,000,000
COMPASS	DYCD	$6,200,000
Summer SONYC	DYCD	$15,000,000
Work Learn Grow	DYCD	$19,700,000
Get Alarmed NYC	FDNY	$1,000,000
Transgender Healthcare Training at H+H	H+H	$150,000
Alternative Enforcement Program	HPD	$750,000
Legal Services for Work Place Rights	HRA	$2,000,000
Baseline funding for Low Wage Worker initiative	HRA/OCJ	$2,000,000
Library One-Shot	Libraries	$8,000,000
Crisis Management System	MOCJ	$2,360,000
Post-Arrest Diversion	MOCJ	$1,025,000
Maintain funding for 14 NYCHA managed senior centers	NYCHA	$3,090,304
Total		**$157,947,772**

Ensure Fairness in the Justice System

The past few years have brought tremendous change to the City's criminal justice system and there is more to be done to address issues of mass incarceration and racial disparities. Major reforms include changing the approach to marijuana enforcement, creating supervised release programs, planning to close Rikers and reducing incarceration, and eliminating cash. In Fiscal 2019, the Council included over $21 million for criminal justice programs and public safety initiatives. The Council supported initiatives to fund alternatives to incarceration, support victims of human trafficking, support the crisis management system, and fund charitable bail funds.

Support the District Attorneys and Public Defense Providers

The District Attorneys and public defense providers deliver critical services to New Yorkers involved in the criminal justice system. While the District Attorneys received an increase of over $16.6 million in Fiscal 2019, of which $9.2 million was baselined, both the prosecutors and public defense providers requested funding for core operations and innovative criminal justice related initiatives and programming. The Fiscal 2020 Preliminary Budget includes $415.6 million for the prosecutors and $226.2 million for the seven public defense providers.

The Fiscal 2020 Executive Budget should provide support for both the District Attorneys and public defense providers. The prosecutors requested funding for various programs such as Manhattan HOPE, a part of the City's Healing NYC Initiative to address the opioid crisis and connect substance users to services; Conviction Integrity Review Units; and storage of body worn camera footage. The public defense providers request included funding to operate a criminal justice reform team and increase resources and staff related to immigration related cases since the City has declared itself a sanctuary city.

Upgrade Technology in District Attorney's Offices

The Council calls on the Administration to add $2.8 million in funding to support the Bronx and Richmond County District Attorneys' Offices in upgrading their technology and information systems. The Bronx County District Attorney is currently utilizing a case management system that is over 30 years old, and the budget should include $2 million for the procurement and maintenance of an upgraded system. This would allow the office to have access to a centralized information database that accurately tracks cases and provides real-time reporting. Additionally, the budget should include $800,000 to support technological upgrades for the Richmond County District Attorney which is core to the function of the Investigative Unit's operations.

Renovate and Build Police Precincts

Many police precincts are in need of repair, but the Fiscal 2020 Preliminary Capital Commitment Plan does not include sufficient funding to make the necessary repairs. The Council calls upon the Administration to provide $143.9 million in funding to build and renovate police precincts, with $75 million for new construction costs related to the relocation of Staten Island's 120th Precinct to a new site on Hill Street in Stapleton and $40.9 million for the renovation of the 52nd Precinct in the Bronx on Webster Avenue. The remaining $28 million would fund multiple police facilities for interior and exterior renovations, as well as renovations to meet ADA compliance requirements.

Upgrade the Board of Correction's IT Infrastructure

The Council calls on the Administration to allocate $1.3 million to purchase and operate a new case management system for the Board of Correction (BOC). The request is broken down into two components: 1) $975,000 in capital funds to purchase and install the new case management system; and 2) $325,000 annually to BOC's expense budget to hire staff to main the new case management system. Currently, BOC's system is outdated, vulnerable to hackers, and incapable of storing the data necessary for the oversight and accountability by the BOC. The new system would ensure smooth data transfers between the BOC and DOC, and meet the cybersecurity standards for the City.

Open a Community Justice Center in Far Rockaway

The Administration should fund the creation and operation of a community justice center in Far Rockaway, Queens. This center would allow community members, especially young people, the opportunity to participate in alternatives to incarceration, crime prevention, community-based programming, and clinical and restorative justice services. Community based justice programs are effective crime prevention and restoration solutions. Given the distance of Rockaway from the Queens central courthouse and the relative prevalence of crime, Rockaway is an ideal location for a community court. The Fiscal 2020 Executive Budget should include $1.7 million for a community court in Rockaway.

Expand Post-Arrest Diversion

The Council calls on the Administration to include $3.9 million to fund pre-arraignment diversion programs across the City. Funding would baseline the $1.7 million in Fiscal 2019 and add $2.1 million to provide pre-arraignment diversion programs citywide. Pre-arraignment programs provide restorative services to individuals charged with low-level, non-violent crimes. Participants who successfully complete programming subsequently have their cases dismissed. Funding would support the continuation of programming in the Bronx and expansion of programming to Brooklyn, Queens, and Staten Island. Manhattan currently has an operational program which is funded by the New York County District Attorney's Office.

Support NeONs

The Council calls on the Administration to enhance the budget by $200,000 for the Neighborhood Opportunity Network (NeON) program. Currently, DOP has $2.7 million in the Fiscal 2020 Preliminary Budget to supports its NeON Program. NeON is a network of community organizations, government agencies, local businesses, and community residents focused on connecting probation clients who live in the target neighborhood to opportunities, resources and services. Funding the shortfall would ensure the providers that the City contracts with are adequately paid for their work.

Reset the Civilian Complaint Review Board's Budget

As outlined in the Council's January 2019 recommendations to the Charter Revision Commission, in order to ensure that the Civilian Complaint Review Board (CCRB) maintains the resources it needs to effectuate its Charter mandate to operate independently as a watchdog over the NYPD, the Administration should tie CCRB's budget to the size of the NYPD. This would allow for stronger investigative powers, faster case closures, and potentially an increase in substantiations of allegations. In Fiscal 2020, the budget for CCRB should be increased by $5 million to $23 million. In future financial plans, and in order to provide CCRB with the resources it needs to keep pace with the NYPD, the two agencies' budgets should be kept at the same fixed proportion.

Reset the Board of Correction's Budget

The Council urges the Administration to make the BOC's budget half of one percent of the DOC's budget. BOC provides oversight over the DOC through regulating, monitoring, and inspecting the correctional facilities of the City. BOC aims to support safer, fairer, smaller, and more humane jails across the City. Currently, the BOC's Fiscal 2020 Preliminary Budget is $3.1 million. To fulfill its responsibilities, BOC's budget should be boosted by $3.9 million, for a total of $7 million for Fiscal 2020.

Fully Finance New Jails

DOC's capital budget fails to provide adequate funding for the construction of the borough jails as the Preliminary Capital Commitment Plan includes only $1.1 billion. The Council does not believe this is a realistic estimate for fully constructing the new jails and the projections also do not make mention of constructing the space for Queens County District Attorney's office in the new Queens jail. With the submission of the Uniform Land Use Review Procedure (ULURP) application and the Capital Project Scope Development study being released soon, the Council calls on the Administration to show a more accurate estimate in the Fiscal 2020 Executive Budget.

Additionally, DOC's Ten-Year Capital Strategy has been frontloaded. Sixty-seven percent of DOC's anticipated capital needs is contained within the first year of its Ten-Year Capital Strategy. The Council calls upon the Administration to reconfigure the Ten-Year Strategy allocations for DOC to more accurately reflect the number of projects and the year-to-year cost for the borough jails.

Fund Body Worn Camera Storage and Training

Body worn camera footage is a vital component for improving relations and communication between law enforcement and the communities which they protect. The CCRB receives and stores footage related to its investigations into police misconduct. CCRB's Fiscal 2019 Preliminary Budget included one-time funding of $50,000 for the storage of body-worn camera footage. However, this is not realistic to support the long-term needs of CCRB and the storage requirements associated with the footage. The Council calls on the Administration to baseline this funding to permanently support the storage and server needs that are expected from the body-worn camera program.

Install Security Cameras around Parks, Schools, and Houses of Worship

The Council calls on the Administration to fund the installation of cameras in or near every park, playground, school, and house of worship in New York City. Security cameras improve the ability of law enforcement to solve crimes, and also reduce crime overall by serving as a deterrent. As hate crimes have surged in schools and houses of worship, these cameras would serve as an effective countermeasure and help reduce this troubling trend. NYPD has approximately 3,000 Argus cameras installed across the City, and plans to install approximately 200 more in Fiscal 2020. The City should double the rate of Argus camera installations across the five boroughs, which would cost $7 million in capital funding and $800,000 in maintenance expense costs for Fiscal 2020.

Improve Crash Response

To support the goals of Vision Zero, the Council calls on the Administration to increase the NYPD's Collision Investigation Squad and expand the pilot program for Evidence Collection Teams to investigate serious injury collisions. The Collision Investigation Squad currently has 26 police officers assigned to it, and in order to effectively investigate serious injury incidents, the Collision Investigation Squad should be increased by an additional 15 personnel at a cost of $2.3 million. This would allow for more effective investigations and help find those responsible for fatal and near-fatal accidents.

For serious injury collisions that are not investigated by the Collision Investigation Squad, NYPD has piloted a program in the Manhattan North Patrol Borough to expand the portfolio of the Evidence Collection Team to include collision investigations. Across New York City, only a small proportion, around five percent, of the two to three thousand serious injury crashes that occur every year are fully investigated. However, the Evidence Collection Team has experienced great success in 2018, making 66 arrests. The Council calls on the Administration to expand this program citywide and ensure investigations into collisions are conducted by the highly trained Evidence Collection Teams.

Create a Civilian Witness Assistance Unit

The CCRB has extended its jurisdiction over police misconduct to include sexual misconduct allegations. To meet this challenge, CCRB has divided complaints of sexual misconduct into a two-phase implementation process. CCRB launched Phase One in February 2018 when it began to investigate sexual harassment allegations. The CCRB has not launched Phase Two, which will include the investigation of sexual assault allegations, because it requires the creation of a Civilian Witness Assistance Unit to effectively respond to and manage cases involving victims of sexual and other severe trauma. The Council calls on the Administration to include $340,000 in the Fiscal 2020 Executive Budget for five specially trained professionals to staff the new unit.

Train DHS Peace Officers in Crisis Intervention

The Fiscal 2020 Preliminary Budget includes $5.32 million for Crisis Intervention Training (CIT) to help police officers properly respond to individuals struggling with mental illnesses or substance abuse. This funding will allow NYPD to train over 4,000 additional officers in CIT by the end of 2021. However, even though NYPD oversees and trains the DHS peace officers, they are not scheduled to be among those trained in CIT. There are over 1,000 peace officers and only 150 have received CIT training. The peace officers would benefit greatly from CIT training and should be included.

Build for Tomorrow

The Council and the Administration began addressing long-standing issues with the capital budget and the Capital Commitment Plan last year with the addition of new and more descriptive budget lines, the rescindment of excess appropriations, and the reduction in the amount of frontloading occurring in the Capital Commitment Plan. It is imperative that the Administration and Council build on this work to improve the transparency, tracking, and the overall execution of the City's capital projects. The Council has concerns about the City's capital program as presented in both the Preliminary Budget and Preliminary Ten-Year Capital Strategy. The Council is calling for both broad improvements to the capital planning process to fund known capital needs, anticipate growth, address equity, bring more transparency to the capital program, and for the inclusion of specific capital projects in the Executive Budget to address urgent needs. The Council also makes specific recommendations focused on two of the City's largest areas of capital spending: education and transportation.

Adhering to the Guiding Principles of the Ten-Year Capital Strategy

The Council is disappointed that the Fiscal 2020-2029 Preliminary Ten-Year Capital Strategy presented by the Administration was not comprehensive and failed to live up to its own guiding principles. The Council calls on the Administration to present a Ten-Year Capital Strategy that makes clear connections between the City's planned investments and the guiding principles of the capital program, as well as an appropriate level of planned spending in the second half of the ten-year planning period.

The Ten-Year Strategy devotes its introduction to discussing the efforts made towards having a "forward-looking, holistic capital planning" approach, including utilizing data trends and metrics provided by the Department of City Planning (DCP). While this data is in the Ten-Year Strategy, the extent of its use by individual agencies and OMB in long-term planning is not clear. The Ten-Year Strategy should make explicit connections between the guiding principles and the planned investments in each agency's Ten-Year Strategy.

Many of the Ten-Year Strategy categories have a dramatic decline in planned spending, or no spending, in the second half of the plan. This suggests that OMB and agencies did not thoughtfully engage in planning for their capital needs over the full ten-year period. For example, there is no funding for new schools planned in Fiscal 2025-2029, even though SCA has already acknowledged a need for $600 million over this period to complete school capacity projects that will start before Fiscal 2025, and there will certainly be the need for additional school capacity after Fiscal 2024. Similarly, the Ten-Year Strategy does not reflect the scheduled transfer of the early childhood care system ACS to DOE, with almost $10 million in ACS' Ten-Year Strategy for day care facilities that should be reflected in DOE's plan.

After the Council raised concerns about inadequate planning in the second half of the Ten-Year Strategy, OMB directed agencies to redistribute planned spending from the first five years of the strategy to the second five years. This does not address the Council's concerns. Instead, the Council expects the overall size of the Ten-Year Strategy to increase to reflect realistic spending levels in the second half of the Ten-Year Strategy's plan period. This requires the holistic capital planning discussed in the Ten-Year Strategy's introduction but that is not currently reflected in planned spending.

The Ten-Year Strategy also fails to adequately address capital needs related to climate change, which continues to pose a great risk to New York City. The Financial District-Seaport area in Manhattan is especially vulnerable to future tidal flooding events, and shoreline expansion is necessary to provide effective, long-term protection to both property and the general public. The Administration released the Lower Manhattan Climate Resiliency Study in March 2019 to address this risk. The Council expects to see funding allocated based on the findings of this study in the Ten-Year Capital Strategy. The Administration should also begin a comprehensive assessment and prioritization of other capital needs related to climate change.

Overall, the Ten-Year Strategy is not a comprehensive infrastructure planning document that anticipates expected needs, growth in communities, or addresses inequity. OMB and DCP must take the planning process for all ten years of the Strategy seriously, and ensure that each agency's Ten-Year Strategy is living up to the guiding principles.

Make the Capital Budget and Commitment Plan Transparent

While improvements were made to the Capital Commitment Plan at the Council's urging last year, the Preliminary Fiscal 2019-2023 Capital Commitment Plan continues to lack the transparency required for the Council to fulfill its Charter-mandated oversight responsibilities.

The Council calls on the Administration to include a significant number of new and more descriptive budget lines in the Fiscal 2020 Executive and Adopted Budgets. The Council votes on a capital budget that is aggregated at the budget line level. It is commonplace for individual budget lines to represent many similar projects and, as a result, have generic descriptions. In fact, in the Fiscal 2020 Preliminary Budget there were 1,969 budget lines which contained funding for approximately 12,082 projects. Currently, the only information provided by the Administration to the Council about those projects when the Council votes at adoption is the general description contained in the budget lines, but not specifically which or how many projects will be included within them. Additional budget lines are necessary to ensure the Council knows which projects are being funded in the capital program and the funding levels tied to them.

In addition, the Council calls on the Administration to implement a comprehensive capital project tracking system. Through recent Council hearings it has become clear that the Administration's current methods for tracking the progress of capital projects is inadequate. A comprehensive capital tracking system will provide basic information regarding the current status of capital projects which the Capital Commitment Plan lacks. Improved tracking will allow the Administration to better manage and budget for capital projects. It will also help identify areas for improvement, potential economies of scale and persistent bottlenecks in the capital process.

Finally, the Council calls on the Administration to significantly reduce excess appropriations in the capital budget. Appropriations continue to far exceed planned spending in the Commitment Plan: total appropriations for Fiscal 2019 are approximately $37.8 billion, but there are only $19.3 billion in planned commitments. With large available balances, the Administration can raise, lower, or create new capital projects midyear without coming to the Council for approval. Excess appropriations should be greatly reduced at budget adoption.

Moreover, the Council calls on the Administration to create management controls that ensure all construction projects are fully compliant with the ADA and maximize opportunities to improve accessibility within the capital program. DOE is currently in the process of surveying the accessibility of all school buildings constructed since the passage of the ADA to determine what needs to be fixed to make these buildings fully accessible. The Department of Transportation's (DOT) curb cut program is another example of City capital construction failing to fully comply with the ADA, requiring the City to invest billions to assess and fix accessibility compliance issues. Capital construction should get accessibility right the first time, not only to prevent a misuse of City resources, but also to ensure all City residents have equal access to and within the City's sidewalks, schools, and other community facilities. Accessibility in the City must be improved and the Administration should adjust capital construction management processes to address past issues and plan more appropriately for the future.

Fund Major Capital Needs

Both the Ten-Year Strategy and the Capital Commitment Plan are missing key projects that the Administration knows will require investment over the next ten years. While the clearest example of a missing capital project is the lack of funding for the new borough-based jails, the Council here provides a list of projects it expects to see funded in the Fiscal 2020 Executive Capital Commitment Plan alongside changes to address specific deficiencies in the Final Ten-Year Capital Strategy.

Prioritize Permanent Housing under Housing New York

As the City's spending on shelter continues its sharp rise, the Council has continuously pushed the Administration to prioritize permanent housing solutions over homeless shelter spending. Of the 300,000 housing units the Administration is aiming to create or preserve under Housing New York by 2026, just five percent, or 15,000 units, of the overall goal will be made available for homeless households. Currently, 60,500 men, women, and children sleep in a homeless shelter each night. The shelter population has hovered at unprecedented levels for the past several years due to a chronic shortage of affordable housing, rising rents, stagnant wage growth, and other economic factors and market forces. Since 2008, spending on homeless shelters has more than doubled, from annual expenditures of $735 million in Fiscal 2008 to current expenditures of $2.1 billion in Fiscal 2019. Since the start of Housing New York, between 2014 and 2018, the City financed the creation or preservation of 121,919 affordable housing units across New York City, including 38,793 newly constructed units and the preservation of 83,125 units. The total development costs for all units financed over this time period was $28.1 billion, including $5.1 billion in City subsidies, $2.1 billion in other public subsidies and about $21 billion in private sources. During that same time frame, the City financed the preservation and creation of only 5,623 non-supportive homeless units, including the construction of 1,904 non-supportive homeless units and the preservation of 3,719 units. Of these financed units, to date the City has placed 2,391 homeless households in housing, including homeless set asides and 421-a homeless preference units. The City should dedicate more funding to support move-outs from the shelter system, rather than increasing the City's shelter budget. Redirecting a portion of the funding for new and hotel-based shelters towards housing development would provide a long-term solution for placing the homeless in permanent housing, rather than temporary shelter housing, thereby reducing the shelter census.

Address NYCHA's Long-term Capital Needs

According to the results of a 2017 Physical Needs Assessment (PNA) , the total projected cost to bring all buildings, systems and grounds to a state of good repair across the NYCHA portfolio is $31.8 billion over a five-year period, or about $180,000 per unit, with an additional $13.4 billion in needs projected in years six through 20. The projected capital need reflects NYCHA's aging infrastructure, where approximately 50 percent of its developments are 50 years or older and require increasingly more maintenance and repairs. In December 2018, the City announced "NYCHA 2.0," a comprehensive, ten-year plan to renovate and preserve NYCHA developments and resolve $23.8 billion in capital needs across NYCHA's portfolio. It is estimated that these programs, along with $8 billion in existing and expected City, State, and federal capital funds, will address nearly $24 billion in capital needs over the next decade, or up to 75 percent of NYCHA's $31.8 billion overall capital need. While this plan moves in the right direction, it leaves a budget gap of $8 billion which should be closed. Lastly, more funding should be allocated to NYCHA to support the hiring of property maintenance staff to expedite work order repairs.

As a component of the $31.8 billion, five-year capital need, NYCHA estimates that the total capital need across all community facilities in the portfolio, including 255 senior centers and community centers, is approximately $500 million. As a result, various CBOs that run programming in community facilities at NYCHA developments currently use their own operating staff and funds to respond to maintenance requests. This capital need not only affects residents, but the larger community as well and should be fully funded.

Additional lighting for NYCHA Developments

NYCHA is first and foremost a landlord and it must provide better property management services and safety enhancements for its residents. While NYCHA has installed permanent exterior lighting at 15 developments as part of a larger citywide, crime-reduction initiative and temporary lights at 40 developments as part of a light study, additional lighting is needed across NYCHA developments. The City should provide additional funding to NYCHA so that all developments are equipped with exterior lighting.

Repair NYCHA Sidewalks

Sidewalks on NYCHA property are often in subpar condition, which is especially hazardous for seniors and people with disabilities. Cracks and uneven pavement can cause people to trip, fall, and sustain injuries. Therefore, the Council calls on the Administration to provide additional funding to DOT in the Fiscal 2020 Executive Budget for unmet sidewalk needs at NYCHA's developments.

Budget for Cluster Site Acquisition and Renovation

Last year, the Administration announced that it would negotiate and finance the acquisition of 17 cluster buildings by local not-for-profit developers, who will work with HPD to rehabilitate the buildings and preserve them as affordable housing. The Fiscal 2020 Preliminary Budget does not reflect the acquisition costs and renovation costs required to buy these 17 buildings currently used as cluster apartments for the homeless and rehabilitate the units for transition into permanent housing. While the Council has serious reservations about the purchase price of these buildings, to the extent that the purchase is occurring, funding should be included in the budget for the acquisition. In lieu of a more reasonable number, the Council calls on the Administration to include $173.8 million in capital funding in the Fiscal 2020 Executive Budget for the acquisition of these buildings and additional funding for the necessary rehabilitation of these buildings.

Create Protected Bus Lanes

True protected bike lanes are proven to reduce cyclist injuries and death, reduce car trips, strain on the subway system, and improve health disparities and public health outcomes even for those who do not ride. Yet, the City's progress on installing protected bike lanes has been slow-moving and piecemeal, at best, resulting in a disjointed, disconnected system. Further, a lack of bike infrastructure informed by new design standards for true protected lanes in low-income communities of color has left these neighborhoods without critical and lifesaving infrastructure, potentially exacerbating transportation and health disparities overall. The Council calls on the Administration to significantly increase the installation of this critical, life-saving infrastructure to at least 50-miles per year, by including $40 million annually in the City's capital budget for protected bike lane installation. In addition, the Council urges the Administration to complete a fully connected bike network by the 2026-2031 Capital Commitment Plan.

Improve Street Accessibility

DOT should install Vision Zero safety and accessibility features, including pedestrian islands, signal-protected crossings, wider sidewalks, accessible pedestrian signals, detectable warnings, curb ramps, and bus and bike lanes, to improve intersection design and make every single intersection with a pedestrian signal accessible to seniors and people with disabilities by 2030.

Investing in accessible pedestrian signals, in particular, is critical for the City's 200,000 residents with vision disabilities. Currently, only 2.4 percent of the City's 7,500 intersections with pedestrian signals are accessible. The recent class action lawsuit against the City filed by the Disability Rights Advocates on behalf of the American Council of the Blind of New York points out that, while New York City has replaced all of its pedestrian signals at least once since 2000, including the installation of countdown clocks in at least 7,500 intersections since 2006, it has only installed accessible pedestrian signals at 75 intersections per year. The Council calls on the Administration to include $457 million in the Fiscal 2020 Executive Budget for accessible pedestrian signals at every signal intersection and continue funding the $1.5 billion in already in the capital budget for the Pedestrian Ramp Program.

Double the Plaza Program

The City's Pedestrian Plaza program has seen remarkable success in increasing pedestrian safety and creating high-quality public spaces in underutilized roadways throughout the City. However, the citywide program, spearheaded by DOT, is limited to underutilized roadways and does not consider other publicly owned properties throughout the City. Organizations and communities interested in activating a publicly owned parcel just adjacent to a busy roadway that happens to be owned by the DPR, for example, have no clear path to pursue these low-cost, high-impact partnerships with the City.

The scope of the program should therefore be expanded to consider and include underutilized properties that are owned or leased by government agencies other than DOT, beginning with the creation of one central portal to collect proposals from a broader set of communities. A streamlined selection and contracting process should then be created to cut across multiple agencies. Through the expansion of this public space stewardship program and inter-agency coordination, the City should aim to double the acreage activated by the program by 2022.

Additionally, expanding the program to consider all publicly owned land, has the potential to dramatically expand the amount of safe, pedestrian-only public spaces throughout the City, foster and cultivate interest in public space investments, and create opportunities for the installation of green infrastructure to improve air quality and public health outcomes, among other benefits. Currently, DOT's capital budget includes $11.9 million in Fiscal 2020 for the Pedestrian Plaza program. The Council calls on the Administration to double the program's budget, to $23.8 million in Fiscal 2020.

Quadruple the Number of Shared Streets

Critical pedestrianization efforts in the City have taken a backseat to small-scale and incremental Vision Zero interventions. Members of the Council have begun to identify streets in their districts ripe for pedestrianization, many of which have already tested the elimination of vehicular traffic on a temporary basis. The Council calls on the Administration to prioritize and dramatically expand the City's Shared Streets program to increase the number of pedestrianized streets that restrict vehicle access to at least a dozen corridors by 2025. The process should start with public engagement and carefully coordinate commercial deliveries, residential vehicle access, waste hauling, and street cleaning to ensure the durability and long-term success of the expansion.

Add Bus Lanes

As one of the most efficient, cost-effective, and adaptive forms of public transit that the City can pursue, the City must at least double the rate at which its bus infrastructure is built out, starting with bus lanes. Bus lanes are proven to increase bus speeds and reliability of service for the City's 2.4 million bus riders.

The Council calls on the Administration to ensure that every new bus lane should be camera enforced and physically separated from traffic along appropriate corridors where camera enforcement proves ineffective. In addition to the physical separation of bus lanes, the plan should also prioritize the implantation of two-way separated bus lanes in the median along key corridors, to keep buses free from conflicts with deliveries, turning vehicles, and double-parked cars wherever possible. The Council urges the Administration to install protected bus lanes on all bus routes where such improvements can be installed by the end of the 2026-2031 Capital Commitment Plan.

Redesign Bus Routes and Upgrade Bus Stops

The City must double the pace at which DOT and New York City Transit (NYCT) are currently running the redesign process to fully complete and implement new routes and upgrades by 2025. This would allow for more efficient bus service and more responsiveness to change in the City's population and the needs of residents. The City must engage communities on route redesign proposals and stop consolidations, taking into account job centers, institutions like hospitals and schools, public housing, and accessibility gaps in the City's subway system.

Any redesign process should collect input from bus riders on where stop amenities including shelters, benches, and real-time passenger information (RTPI) display are needed most. The City should then create and make public its criteria for prioritizations of amenities and rollout upgrades including shelters, benches, and RTPI along with the redesign by 2025 to optimize the system. The Council urges the Administration to work closely with the NYCT to ensure that route redesigns and bus stop upgrades happen quickly.

Install Transit Signal Priority Systems

Transit signal priority is a system that coordinates buses and traffic signals to reduce the number of times buses stopped at traffic lights. These upgrades do not require any significant capital infrastructure investment. Transit Signal Priority takes advantage of the Transnet Wireless Network, signal controllers, and the MTA's existing Bus Time vehicle location system. The City must speed up the activation of transit signal priority across the entire bus system, wherever feasible. As such, the Council urges the Administration to add $6.3 million baseline funding in the Fiscal 2020 Executive Budget to enable DOT install transit signal priority in at least 1,000 locations annually.

Resurface Streets

Over the last three years, DOT has met or exceeded its goal of repaving 1,300 lane miles of streets annually. However, the Fiscal 2020 Preliminary Plan only includes $135 million in Fiscal 2020 compared to $298 million in the current fiscal year for in-house street repaving and resurfacing. Therefore, it is unlikely DOT would achieve the goal of repaving 1,300 lane miles in Fiscal 2020 unless additional funding is provided in the Executive Budget. As such, the Council calls on the Administration to increase and baseline funding for street resurfacing by $163 million in the Fiscal 2020 Executive Budget. In addition, the Council calls on the Administration to include adequate funding in the capital budget to ensure that DOT is able to mitigate street ponding conditions upon verification of such condition, as required by Local Law 1251-A.

Replace Fading Street Signs

New York drivers frequently encounter cumbersome and dangerous to navigate City streets because of faded streets signs on our roads. Moreover, faded parking signs lead to confusion and unnecessary ticketing to drivers. The Council urges the Administration to provide $390,000 in expense funds In the Fiscal 2020 Executive Budget to purchase and replace 2,500 fading street signs, citywide.

Count Pedestrians and Cyclists

Bike counters publicly disclose how many bike riders and pedestrians have crossed in a given amount of time. They offer a layer of immediate transparency and allow residents to directly see the impact and results of the Agency's investment in cycling. DOT currently has a viewable bike counter display on the Manhattan Bridge only. The Council urges the Administration to include additional $80,000 in the Fiscal 2020 Executive Budget to allow DOT install publically viewable bike counter displays on all remaining East River Bridges and on the Hudson River Greenway.

Test Smart Traffic Signals

The Council calls on the Administration to introduce a pilot program designed to use artificial intelligence technology to improve traffic flow. The pilot program should be implemented along a 2.5 mile vehicle-congested corridor (i.e. Queens Boulevard/Northern Boulevard/Flatbush Avenue/Atlantic Avenue), in which signalized intersections are connected through vehicle sensors, thermal cameras, and other high-tech sensors, at a total cost of $3 million. Using adaptive signals technology, the sensors will combine artificial intelligence technology with vehicular traffic information to respond in real-time to these mobility types, through advanced video detection systems that identify vehicles types, speeds, volumes and queues. As such, adaptive signals technology will be able to change traffic signals based on traffic flow, which has the ability to reduce traffic congestion and reduce vehicle collisions. It should be noted that in 2017, the City of Atlanta, Georgia implemented a similar pilot program on 18 signalized intersections along its North Avenue – an east-west arterial avenue. According to Georgia Tech, the corridor has seen improved travel times and a 25 percent reduction in vehicle collisions.

Build Hutchinson Parkway Ramp

In order for residents of South-Eastern Bronx to reach the medical facilities at the Hutch Metro Center safely and efficiently, the Council calls on the Administration to fund construction of a ramp to directly connect the Hutch Metro Center to Hutchinson Parkway.

Increase Towing Capacity

Across the five boroughs, large trucks and vehicles are left illegally parked for long periods of time or even abandoned entirely. In order to remove these vehicles and keep streets clear and safe for residents, specialized tow trucks are needed to meet the demands of towing heavy-duty vehicles. The NYPD currently has six in-use heavy-duty tow trucks but additional resources are necessary to meet operational demands. The Council calls upon the Administration to increase its fleet by three additional heavy-duty tow trucks for a total cost of $1.3 million.

Gotham Urgent Care in Gouvernor Hospital

The Council calls on the Administration to include $27 million to support the construction of a Gotham Urgent Care in Gouvernor Hospital. Health and Hospitals (H+H) pledged to spend $82 million to open three similar health centers in Brooklyn, Queens, and the Bronx. There is a high need in the Lower East Side for an urgent care facility. This need should be addressed by including $27 million in capital funding to renovate an area in Gouvernor Hospital into a new Gotham Urgent Care.

Renovate Woodhull Hospital

The Council calls on the Administration to include $10 million to support the capital needs of Woodhull Hospital. Woodhull Hospital has been awarded $5 million for the renovation of the emergency department, however, this funding does not completely cover the cost of creating a state of the art emergency department. In addition, the facilities at Woodhull Hospital are in dire need of renovations and moderation.

Build a New EMS Station on Staten Island

The Council calls on the Administration to allocate $17 million in capital funding for a third EMS station on Staten Island. Currently, FDNY has 35 EMS stations across the City, including two on Staten Island.

According to FDNY, as of the Fiscal 2020 Preliminary Plan, there are 804 EMS tours daily, with 574 for basic life support and 230 for advanced life support services. From 2017 to 2018, Staten Island saw an increase of 57,836 EMS incidents and 69,129 ambulance runs. The Administration should allocate capital funding for the construction of a third EMS Station to provide all the necessary public safety resources in Staten Island.

Establish a Hudson Yards Firehouse

The Council urges the Administration to include $35.8 million to support a new firehouse in Hudson Yards. This includes a $32 million capital investment for the construction of a new facility and a $3.8 million PS expenditure to support 45 firefighters. The massive Hudson Yards development on Manhattan's Far West Side is anticipated to bring over 125,000 new residents. In the 1970s, the Fire Department’s Engine 2 disbanded on West 43rd Street because of a lack of a high population in the surrounding area, but the thousands of additional New Yorkers expected to live, work, and visit Hudson Yards make the need for a new fire company. According to FDNY, given all the congestion and geographic problems of current firehouses, Hudson Yards is in at risk of not having the fire protection needed. The nearest firehouse locations are already stretched thin, with an increased activity up to 30 percent.

Expedite Construction of the Staten Island 1 and 3 Garage

The Fiscal 2020 Preliminary Capital Commitment Plan includes $144 million for the Staten Island 1 and 3 garage, however, the garage is not scheduled to be complete until Fiscal 2023. The Council calls upon Administration to accelerate the pace of construction, to ensure both vehicle fleet and sanitation personnel are located in a garage that is suitable for DSNY operations.

Support Cultural Institutions

New York City is the cultural capital of the world. New York’s arts and culture are integral to furthering the aspirations of our City’s youth and it is crucial that the youth get an art-rich education. Not only do the cultural institutions and organizations draw and inspire millions of people, they are also a driver of economic development for the City. The Council calls on the Administration to increase the capital funding by $19.8 million for some of the renowned cultural institutions in the world. This includes $6 million for the New York Shakespeare Festival - Delacourte Theatre, $4.8 million for the Metropolitan Museum of Art, $8.5 million for New York Historical Society, $250,000 for the Vivian Beaumont Theater, and $300,000 for the New York City Center.

Rightsize the Libraries Capital Strategy

New York City’s three library systems, like many of the City’s agencies, experience a serious drop in outyear funding in the Preliminary Ten-Year Strategy. Along with Strategy-wide additions the Council advocates for a true ten-year capital plan for the libraries. Long-term funding in the ten-year plan is essential for effective planning. Library buildings should be categorized as City infrastructure. Without that, the systems cannot plan or efficiently manage their physical plant which is almost entirely comprised of City-owned buildings. Without proper funding, the systems are not able to perform necessary preventative maintenance and ensure that projects continue to move forward when they incur a shortfall. OMB’s Ten-Year Strategy currently reflects $778.3 million for the library systems. However, the $778.3 million is existing capital funding already earmarked for other projects from previous years. OMB has asked the systems to spread out this existing capital over the ten-year period. As this type of planning offers no additional funding, the three library systems are in need of approximately $963 million in additional dollars in the last five years of the Ten-Year Strategy to keep up with the ever increasing costs and to maintain and renovate aging infrastructure.

Preserve Natural Forests

To help mitigate the future adverse impact of natural disaster on our City, the Council calls on the Administration to allocate capital funding of $3.74 million in the Fiscal 2020 Executive Budget to implement the first year of a 25-year investment plan as laid out in the Forest Management Plan for New York City. In addition, the Council urges the Administration to include full funding in the Ten-Year Capital Plan for the full implementation of the Forest Management Plan. The City's Forest Management Plan includes guidelines for projecting costs, adapting best practices, encouraging local stewardships and continued monitoring and research on the City's natural areas. The plan expands over 25 years with a projected investment of $385 million to restore and manage DPR's 7,300 acres of forested natural areas.

Restore Orchard Beach

Orchard Beach, the Bronx's sole public beach, was proclaimed "The Riviera of New York" when it was created in the 1930s. The 115-acre, 1.1-mile-long beach contains a hexagonal-block promenade, a central pavilion, snack bars, food and souvenir carts, two playgrounds, two picnic areas, a large parking lot, and 26 courts for basketball, volleyball, and handball. It also includes changing areas and showers. Unfortunately, with beach season around the corner, much work needs to be done on the project. To date, the Administration and the Council have put in $40 million for much needed upgrades to the pavilion and beach access. The State has also added $10 million and the Bronx Borough President has added funding, as well. However, more funding is needed to fully complete the project. The Council calls on the Administration to include additional funding in the Fiscal 2020 Executive Budget to help complete the reconstruction of Orchard Beach in the Bronx.

Reconstruct and Repair Waterfront Parks, Paths, Piers and Esplanades

DPR has studied the structural integrity of the East River Esplanade, and has determined that additional $94 million must be allocated in the capital budget in order to repair the seawall and prevent the park from crumbling into the East River and $26 million for the repair of Pier 107. This investment follows the first phase of funding for the East River Esplanade project, which included $35 million for the three-year period that began in Fiscal 2015, $60 million in Fiscal 2019, and $15 million from the East Harlem Rezoning Plan. The Council calls on the Administration to allocate an additional $120 million in the Fiscal 2020 Executive Budget for the full reconstruction of the East River Esplanade and Pier 107 in Manhattan. The DPR should also improve its maintenance and repair of waterfront recreation areas paths, and parks around the City. The Shore Road Parkway in Brooklyn as well as the Coney Island Boardwalk are in need of reconstruction and maintenance.

Provide Alternative Green Spaces

In September 2018, the Administration announced that it would pursue an alternative design to East Side Coastal Resiliency project. The proposed changes raised a number of concerns by stakeholders, policy makers and community residents. The new design will require that the East River Park be closed for three years while the project's construction is underway, prompting concerns that the neighborhood will be without access to open space for too long. While the East River Park is an excellent example of necessary park closings there are other vulnerable areas throughout the City such as Coney Island that will also need additional green space alternatives. The Council calls on the Administration to provide capital funding in the Fiscal 2020 Executive Budget and invest in recreation areas, green space, and east side biking to mitigate closing of East River Park as well as any other areas parks that will be closed due to resiliency projects.

Build a Cromwell Recreation Center

The Cromwell Recreation Center, opened in the 1950s. It was once the largest public recreation center on Staten Island, and served an average of 750 people daily. Unfortunately, Super Storm Sandy damaged the Cromwell Recreation Center beyond repair. Subsequently, the Cromwell Recreation Center and its associated support structure were demolished through a Federal Emergency Management Agency (FEMA) funded contract with Department of Design and Construction (DDC). Following the demolition, through OMB's pre-scoping program, DPR commenced a feasibility study to find an alternate site that would accommodate the programming space lost by the removal of the Cromwell Recreation Center. The study is now complete, but, funding has yet to be allocated for the reconstruction. The Council calls on the Administration to include $90 million in capital funding in the Fiscal 2020 Executive Budget for the replacement of the Cromwell Recreation Center in Staten Island.

Complete the Calvert Vaux Park Reconstruction

To date, reconstruction of Calvert Vaux Park in Southern Brooklyn remains an unfulfilled part of the City's 2009 Coney Island Comprehensive Rezoning Plan. The Council calls on the Administration to allocate $80 million in capital funding in the Fiscal 2020 Executive Budget to fully reconstruct Calvert Vaux Park as called for in the 2009 rezoning agreement.

Expedite the Construction of East 81st Street Promenade

The East River Esplanade is a vital part of New York City's vast greenway system. The park forms the edge of Manhattan as it meets the East River and there are plans to construct a promenade over the FDR Drive between East 81st Street and 90th Street to connect the park space to local residents. Currently, funding for this project totaling $313 million exists in the capital budget, however, the majority of the funding is scheduled to be committed in Fiscal Year 2023. The Council urges the Administration to advance $276.4 million in scheduled in Fiscal 2023 funding to Fiscal 2020 to ensure the immediate commencement of the project.

Appendix A – Units of Appropriation

#	Agency	Proposal	Issue
1	MOCJ	Create office to Prevent Gun Violence U/A pair	Currently under the Mayor's office of Criminal Justice Services, but the Office to Prevent Gun Violence should have its own U/A.
2	Mayoralty	Create Office of Special Enforcement U/A pair	Currently under Law Department and Mayoralty, but the Office of Special Enforcement should be housed solely in Mayoralty and have its own U/A.
3	Mayoralty	Create Office to End Gender-Based Violence U/A Pair	All resources for this office should be housed under Mayoralty and have its own U/A.
4	Law	U/A pair for Tort Division	Law Department has 20 divisions but only 2 U/A's, PS and OTPS. We request that the Tort Division (the agency's largest) be separated from the rest of the Agency, and a PS and OTPS U/A be created for the Tort Division on its own. We have asked the Law Department to break out its budget further in previous years, and they are vehemently against this due to the issue of them regularly transferring resources across divisions (many of which are very small). We believe that pulling out the Tort Division on its own, which is by far the Department's largest division, would be a reasonable compromise
5	DOI	Restructure U/A Pair for Administration Program.	DOI currently has one U/A pair for Administration Program (AP), which includes funding for Inspector General (IG) program offices. Funding for IG should be removed from AP and shifted to IG (003 and 004), which would increase transparency into agency operations and more accurately capture spending.
6	DOI	Restructure U/A Pair for Inspector General Program.	DOI currently has one U/A pair for the Inspector General Program, which captures intra-city funding only. DOI should restructure the IG U/A pair to include specialized units, policy and outreach, which would increase transparency into agency operations and more accurately capture spending.
7	DOE	Eliminate	This UA pair co-mingles several distinct programs, shift spending to programmatic area
8	CUNY	Borough of Manhattan Community College - U/A Pair	The Fiscal 2019 Preliminary Budget for Borough of Manhattan Community College is $175.9 million, but all of its funding is consolidated within two units of appropriation that capture spending for all community colleges as well as CUNY's Central Administration.
9	CUNY	Bronx Community College - U/A Pair	The Fiscal 2019 Preliminary Budget for Bronx Community College is $91.5 million, but all of its funding is consolidated within two units of appropriation that capture spending for all community colleges as well as CUNY's Central Administration.
10	CUNY	Guttman Community College - U/A Pair	The Fiscal 2019 Preliminary Budget for Guttman Community College is $23.2 million, but all of its funding is consolidated within two units of appropriation that capture spending for all community colleges as well as CUNY's Central Administration.
11	CUNY	Hostos Community College - U/A Pair	The Fiscal 2019 Preliminary Budget for Hostos Community College is $65.3 million, but all of its funding is consolidated within two units of appropriation that capture spending for all community colleges as well as CUNY's Central Administration.

#	Agency	Proposal	Issue
12	CUNY	Kingsborough Community College - U/A Pair	The Fiscal 2019 Preliminary Budget for Kingsborough Community College is $96 million, but all of its funding is consolidated within two units of appropriation that capture spending for all community colleges as well as CUNY's Central Administration.
13	CUNY	LaGuardia Community College - U/A Pair	The Fiscal 2019 Preliminary Budget for LaGuardia Community College is $130.6 million, but all of its funding is consolidated within two units of appropriation that capture spending for all community colleges as well as CUNY's Central Administration.
14	CUNY	Queensborough Community College - U/A Pair	The Fiscal 2019 Preliminary Budget for Queensborough Community College is $109.1 million, but all of its funding is consolidated within two units of appropriation that capture spending for all community colleges as well as CUNY's Central Administration.
15	NYPD	Administration - U/A Pair	create U/As to match Program Areas in the BFA
16	NYPD	Chief of Department - U/A Pair	create U/As to match Program Areas in the BFA
17	NYPD	Citywide Operations - U/A Pair	create U/As to match Program Areas in the BFA
18	NYPD	Communications - U/A Pair	create U/As to match Program Areas in the BFA
19	NYPD	Community Affairs - U/A Pair	create U/As to match Program Areas in the BFA
20	NYPD	Criminal Justice Bureau - U/A Pair	create U/As to match Program Areas in the BFA
21	NYPD	Detective Bureau - U/A Pair	create U/As to match Program Areas in the BFA
22	NYPD	Housing Bureau - U/A Pair	create U/As to match Program Areas in the BFA
23	NYPD	Intelligence and Counterterrorism - U/A Pair	create U/As to match Program Areas in the BFA
24	NYPD	Internal Affairs - U/A Pair	create U/As to match Program Areas in the BFA
25	NYPD	Patrol - U/A Pair	create U/As to match Program Areas in the BFA
26	NYPD	Reimbursable Overtime - U/A Pair	create U/As to match Program Areas in the BFA
27	NYPD	School Safety - U/A Pair	create U/As to match Program Areas in the BFA
28	NYPD	Security/Counter-Terrorism Grants - U/A Pair	create U/As to match Program Areas in the BFA
29	NYPD	Support Services - U/A Pair	create U/As to match Program Areas in the BFA
30	NYPD	Training - U/A Pair	create U/As to match Program Areas in the BFA

#	Agency	Proposal	Issue
31	NYPD	Transit - U/A Pair	create U/As to match Program Areas in the BFA
32	NYPD	Transportation - U/A Pair	create U/As to match Program Areas in the BFA
33	ACS	Juvenile Justice - OTPS U/A	The program areas fall under Juvenile Justice are split between two large U/As, both are for OTPS. For transparency, each of these program areas should have their own U/A
34	ACS	Non-Secure Detention - OTPS U/A	The program areas fall under Juvenile Justice are split between two large U/As, both are for OTPS. For transparency, each of these program areas should have their own U/A
35	ACS	OCFS Residential - OTPS U/A	The program areas fall under Juvenile Justice are split between two large U/As, both are for OTPS. For transparency, each of these program areas should have their own U/A
36	ACS	Preventive Services - U/A Pair	These program areas are split between two large U/As - one that is PS and the other that is OTPS, each of these program areas should have their own U/A (PS and OTPS) to better track funding
37	ACS	Adoption Services	These program areas are split between two large U/As - one that is PS and the other that is OTPS, each of these program areas should have their own U/A (PS and OTPS) to better track funding
38	ACS	Foster Care Support	These program areas are split between two large U/As - one that is PS and the other that is OTPS, each of these program areas should have their own U/A (PS and OTPS) to better track funding
39	ACS	Foster Care Service	These program areas are split between two large U/As - one that is PS and the other that is OTPS, each of these program areas should have their own U/A (PS and OTPS) to better track funding
40	HRA	U/A for Legal Services PS	Associated headcount not reflected in the program
41	HRA	Create program area in HRA Budget Function Analysis for Homeless Prevention Administration with a U/A pair for this newly created program area	Consists of Homeless prevention programs and headcount but cannot be separated out by a U/A
42	HRA	Create a program area in HRA Budget Function Analysis for Rental Assistance and an UA pair for this newly created program area	There are 12 different budget codes reflecting the different rental assistance programs however upon the Administration's own admission the budget codes do not accurately reflect the allocation for each program because the funding is flexible between the different programs. Need more clarity on how much funding is going into each rental assistance programs though its own U/A. We are also requesting that the Budget Function Analysis have a rental assistance program area which includes all the LINC programs, FEPS, SFEPS, FHEPS, SEPS, and the TBRA program
43	HRA	Adult Protective Services - U/A Pair	Programs are split into PS and OTPS U/As that are shared among other programs. Better transparency is needed on each program area budget so that spending can be more accurately tracked.

#	Agency	Proposal	Issue
44	HRA	CEO Evaluation - U/A Pair	Programs are split into PS and OTPS U/As that are shared among other programs. Better transparency is needed on each program area budget so that spending can be more accurately tracked.
45	HRA	Domestic Violence Services - U/A Pair	Programs are split into PS and OTPS U/As that are shared among other programs. Better transparency is needed on each program area budget so that spending can be more accurately tracked.
46	HRA	Employment Services Administration - U/A Pair	Programs are split into PS and OTPS U/As that are shared among other programs. Better transparency is needed on each program area budget so that spending can be more accurately tracked.
47	HRA	Employment Services Contracts - OTPS U/A	Programs are split into PS and OTPS U/As that are shared among other programs. Better transparency is needed on each program area budget so that spending can be more accurately tracked.
48	HRA	Food Assistance Programs - U/A Pair	Programs are split into PS and OTPS U/As that are shared among other programs. Better transparency is needed on each program area budget so that spending can be more accurately tracked.
49	HRA	Food Stamp Operations - U/A Pair	Programs are split into PS and OTPS U/As that are shared among other programs. Better transparency is needed on each program area budget so that spending can be more accurately tracked.
50	HRA	General Administration - U/A Pair	Programs are split into PS and OTPS U/As that are shared among other programs. Better transparency is needed on each program area budget so that spending can be more accurately tracked.
51	HRA	HIV and AIDS Services - U/A Pair	Programs are split into PS and OTPS U/As that are shared among other programs. Better transparency is needed on each program area budget so that spending can be more accurately tracked.
52	HRA	Home Energy Assistance - U/A Pair	Programs are split into PS and OTPS U/As that are shared among other programs. Better transparency is needed on each program area budget so that spending can be more accurately tracked.
53	HRA	Information Technology Services - U/A Pair	Programs are split into PS and OTPS U/As that are shared among other programs. Better transparency is needed on each program area budget so that spending can be more accurately tracked.
54	HRA	Investigations and Revenue Admin - U/A Pair	Programs are split into PS and OTPS U/As that are shared among other programs. Better transparency is needed on each program area budget so that spending can be more accurately tracked.
55	HRA	Medicaid Eligibility and Admin - U/A Pair	Programs are split into PS and OTPS U/As that are shared among other programs. Better transparency is needed on each program area budget so that spending can be more accurately tracked.
56	HRA	Office of Child Support Enforcement - U/A Pair	Programs are split into PS and OTPS U/As that are shared among other programs. Better transparency is needed on each program area budget so that spending can be more accurately tracked.
57	HRA	Public Assistance and Employment Admin - U/A Pair	Programs are split into PS and OTPS U/As that are shared among other programs. Better transparency is needed on each program area budget so that spending can be more accurately tracked.
58	HRA	Public Assistance Grants - OTPS U/A	Programs are split into PS and OTPS U/As that are shared among other programs. Better transparency is needed on each program area budget so that spending can be more accurately tracked.

#	Agency	Proposal	Issue
59	HRA	Public Assistance Support Grants - OTPS U/A	Programs are split into PS and OTPS U/As that are shared among other programs. Better transparency is needed on each program area budget so that spending can be more accurately tracked.
60	HRA	Subsidized Employment and Job-Related Training - OTPS U/A	Programs are split into PS and OTPS U/As that are shared among other programs. Better transparency is needed on each program area budget so that spending can be more accurately tracked.
61	HRA	Substance Abuse Services - OTPS U/A	Programs are split into PS and OTPS U/As that are shared among other programs. Better transparency is needed on each program area budget so that spending can be more accurately tracked.
62	HRA	Separate Program Area for Medcaid with U/A Pair	Medcaid accounts for about 60 percent of HRA's budget, but there is no transparency for the Medicaid budget because it is lumped together with home care and Medicaid PS and OTPS U/A are shared with other program areas
63	HRA	Separate Program Area for Homecare with U/A Pair	Medcaid accounts for about 60 percent of HRA's budget, but there is no transparency for the Medicaid budget because it is lumped together with home care and Medicaid PS and OTPS U/A are shared with other program areas
64	HRA	Remove holding codes from HRA's budget and transfer funding to the appropriate program area(s)	Excessive use of holding codes
65	DHS	Adult Shelter Administration and Support - U/A Pair	DHS budget is split between two U/A, which provides no transparency into the agency's budget and spending
66	DHS	Adult Shelter Intake and Placement - PS U/A	DHS budget is split between two U/A, which provides no transparency into the agency's budget and spending
67	DHS	Adult Shelter Operations - U/A Pair	DHS budget is split between two U/A, which provides no transparency into the agency's budget and spending
68	DHS	Family Shelter Administration and Support - U/A Pair	DHS budget is split between two U/A, which provides no transparency into the agency's budget and spending
69	DHS	Family Shelter Intake and Placement - U/A Pair	DHS budget is split between two U/A, which provides no transparency into the agency's budget and spending
70	DHS	Family Shelter Operations - U/A Pair	DHS budget is split between two U/A, which provides no transparency into the agency's budget and spending
71	DHS	General Administration - U/A Pair	DHS budget is split between two U/A, which provides no transparency into the agency's budget and spending

#	Agency	Proposal	Issue
72	DHS	Outreach, Drop-in, and Reception Services - U/A Pair	DHS budget is split between two U/A, which provides no transparency into the agency's budget and spending
73	DHS	Prevention and Aftercare - U/A Pair	DHS budget is split between two U/A, which provides no transparency into the agency's budget and spending
74	DHS	Rental Assistance and Housing Placement - U/A Pair	DHS budget is split between two U/A, which provides no transparency into the agency's budget and spending
75	DHS	Create budget code for contracted hotels Create budget code for cluster site	The budget codes needs to breakdown shelter spending between temporary hotels, currently lumped together in family and adult shelter operations budget.
76	DHS	Remove holding codes from DHS' budget and transfer funding to the appropriate program area(s)	Excessive use of holding codes
77	DOC	Jail Operations - U/A Pair	create U/As to match Program Areas in the BFA
78	DOC	Admin-Management & Administration - U/A Pair	create U/As to match Program Areas in the BFA
79	DOC	Health and Programs - U/A Pair	create U/As to match Program Areas in the BFA
80	DOC	Operations-Infrastructure & Environmental Health - U/A Pair	create U/As to match Program Areas in the BFA
81	DOC	Admin-Academy and Training - U/A Pair	create U/As to match Program Areas in the BFA
82	DOC	Operations-Rikers Security & Operations - U/A Pair	create U/As to match Program Areas in the BFA
83	DFTA	Administration and Contract Agency Support - U/A Pair	This program area is split between all four DFTA's U/As
84	DFTA	Case Management - U/A Pair	This program area is split between two large U/As
85	DFTA	Senior Centers and Meals - U/A Pair	This program area is split between two large U/As

#	Agency	Proposal	Issue
86	DFTA	Senior Employment and Benefits - U/A Pair	This program area is split between three large U/As
87	DFTA	Senior Services - U/A Pair	This program area is split between three large U/As
88	CCHR	Create U/A Pair for Law Enforcement Bureau.	Create U/A pairs for Law Enforcement Bureau that will accurately reflect the operations of the agency and capture spending.
89	CCHR	Create U/A Pair for Community Relations Bureau.	Create U/A pairs for Community Relations Bureau that will accurately reflect the operations of the agency and capture spending.
90	DYCD	Adult Literacy Services - U/A Pair	create U/As to match Program Areas in the BFA
91	DYCD	Beacon Community Centers - U/A Pair	create U/As to match Program Areas in the BFA
92	DYCD	Community Development - U/A Pair	create U/As to match Program Areas in the BFA
93	DYCD	General Administration - U/A Pair	create U/As to match Program Areas in the BFA
94	DYCD	In-School Youth - U/A Pair	create U/As to match Program Areas in the BFA
95	DYCD	Other Youth Programs - U/A Pair	create U/As to match Program Areas in the BFA
96	DYCD	Out-of-School Time - U/A Pair	create U/As to match Program Areas in the BFA
97	DYCD	Out-of-School Youth - U/A Pair	create U/As to match Program Areas in the BFA
98	DYCD	Runaway and Homeless Youth - U/A Pair	create U/As to match Program Areas in the BFA
99	DYCD	Summer Youth Employment Program - U/A Pair	create U/As to match Program Areas in the BFA
100	DOP	Probation Services - Adult Supervision - U/A Pair	Break up into Adult and Juvenile to reflect different programs
101	DOP	Probation Services - Juvenile Supervision - U/A Pair	Break up into Adult and Juvenile to reflect different programs

#	Agency	Proposal	Issue
102	DOITT	Technology Services	This program area is split between two large U/As - one that is PS and the other that is OTPS (001 & 002).
103	DOITT	Emergency Communications Transformation Program (ECTP) - U/A Pair	This program area is split between two large U/As - one that is PS and the other that is OTPS (001 & 002).
104	DOITT	Mayor's Office of Data Analytics (MODA) – U/A Pair	This program area is split between two large U/As - one that is PS and the other that is OTPS (001 & 002).
105	DOITT	311/NYC.gov Operations - U/A Pair	This program area is split between two large U/As - one that is PS and the other that is OTPS (001 & 002).
106	DOITT	General Administration/Operations - U/A Pair	This program area is split between two large U/As - one that is PS and the other that is OTPS (001 & 002).
107	DANY	Executive Management 001 and 002 Operations 003 and 004	Break out line staff from executive and administrative staff and associated OTPS
108	DABX	Executive Management 001 and 002 Operations 003 and 004	Break out line staff from executive and administrative staff and associated OTPS
109	CKDA	Executive Management 001 and 002 Operations 003 and 004	Break out line staff from executive and administrative staff and associated OTPS
110	QCDA	Executive Management 001 and 002 Operations 003 and 004	Break out line staff from executive and administrative staff and associated OTPS
111	RCDA	Executive Management 001 and 002 Operations 003 and 004	Break out line staff from executive and administrative staff and associated OTPS
112	OSNP	Executive Management 001 and 002 Operations 003 and 004	Break out line staff from executive and administrative staff and associated OTPS
113	HPD	Administration - U/A Pair	create U/As to match Program Areas in the BFA
114	HPD	Administration Program- U/A Pair	create U/As to match Program Areas in the BFA
115	HPD	Development- U/A Pair	create U/As to match Program Areas in the BFA
116	HPD	Housing Operations - Section 8 Programs- U/A Pair	create U/As to match Program Areas in the BFA

#	Agency	Proposal	Issue
117	HPD	Housing Operations- Emergency Housing- U/A Pair	create U/As to match Program Areas in the BFA
118	HPD	Housing Operations- Mgmt & Disposition- U/A Pair	create U/As to match Program Areas in the BFA
119	HPD	Preservation - Anti-Abandonment- U/A Pair	create U/As to match Program Areas in the BFA
120	HPD	Preservation - Code Enforcement- U/A Pair	create U/As to match Program Areas in the BFA
121	HPD	Preservation - Emergency Repair- U/A Pair	create U/As to match Program Areas in the BFA
122	HPD	Preservation - Lead Paint- U/A Pair	create U/As to match Program Areas in the BFA
123	HPD	Preservation - Other Agency Services- U/A Pair	create U/As to match Program Areas in the BFA
124	DOB	Personal Services (001)	Create a U/A for the Office of the Tenant Advocate
125	DOB	Personal Services (001)	The Department of Buildings only has two U/As, Personal Services (PS) and Other Than Personal Services (OTPS). About 81 percent of the agency's budget, $148.7 million out of a total expense budget of $183 million in Fiscal 2019, is reflected in its PS U/A. The recommendation is that the agency's PS U/A be divided to reflect its two main functions as an agency, including enforcement and inspections.