

# THE COUNCIL OF THE CITY OF NEW YORK

Hon. Melissa Mark-Viverito  
Speaker of the Council

Hon. Darlene Mealy  
Chair, Committee on Civil Rights



Report of the Finance Division on the  
Fiscal 2018 Preliminary Budget

**Commission on Human Rights**

March 22, 2017

## **Finance Division**

---

Latonia McKinney, Director  
Regina Poreda Ryan, Deputy Director  
Nathan Toth, Deputy Director

Paul Scimone, Deputy Director  
Eisha Wright, Unit Head

**Table of Contents**

Commission on Human Rights Overview .....1

Fiscal 2018 Preliminary Budget Highlights .....1

Financial Plan Changes .....2

Financial Summary.....2

PS and OTPS – Administration .....6

Appendix A: Budget Actions in the November and the Preliminary Plans.....11

Appendix B: Contractual Spending .....12

## Commission on Human Rights Overview

The New York City Commission on Human Rights (CCHR or the Commission) is charged with enforcing the New York City Human Rights Law (NYCHRL). NYCHRL is one of the most comprehensive anti-discrimination laws in the country. It includes protections in public accommodations, housing, employment based on race, religion or creed, color, age, national origin, alienage or citizenship status, gender, gender identity, sexual orientation, pregnancy, disability and marital or partnership status. Other protections covered under NYCHRL are employment matters based on arrest or conviction record; status as a victim of domestic violence, stalking, sex offenses; unemployment status; credit history; housing based on lawful occupation, lawful source of income; and the presence of children. Additionally, beginning on May 4, 2016, caregiver status is covered under NYCHRL.

The Commission has three primary divisions – the Law Enforcement Bureau (LEB), the Community Relations Bureau (CRB) and the Office of the Chairperson. LEB is responsible for the intake, investigation, and prosecution of NYCHRL violations, including those that raise systemic violations. CRB, through borough-based Community Service Centers, helps cultivate understanding and respect among the City's many diverse communities through pre-complaint interventions, conferences, workshops, and training sessions among other initiatives. The Office of the Chairperson houses the legislative, policy and adjudicatory functions of the Commission and convenes meetings with the agency's commissioners.

This report provides a review of CCHR's Fiscal 2018 Preliminary Budget and the Fiscal 2017 Preliminary Mayor's Management Report (PMMR). In the section below, the Fiscal 2018 Budget is presented in a table, which details CCHR's spending by Personal Services (PS) and Other Than Personal Services (OTPS). The second section shows the Financial Plan Summary chart, which provides an overview of the CCHR's budget by unit of appropriation, funding source, headcount, and then review of the Fiscal 2017 PMMR. Finally, the appendices highlight budget actions in the November and Preliminary Financial Plans and CCHR's Fiscal 2018 Contract Budget.

## Fiscal 2018 Preliminary Budget Highlights

Commission on Human Rights Expense Budget						
	2015	2016	2017	Preliminary Plan		*Difference
<i>Dollars in Thousands</i>	Actual	Actual	Adopted	2017	2018	2017 - 2018
Personal Services	\$4,898	\$6,108	\$8,007	\$8,398	\$9,192	\$1,185
Other Than Personal Services	897	2,734	3,551	3,726	2,251	(1,300)
<b>TOTAL</b>	<b>\$5,795</b>	<b>\$8,842</b>	<b>\$11,557</b>	<b>\$12,124</b>	<b>\$11,443</b>	<b>(\$114)</b>

*\*The difference of Fiscal 2017 Adopted Budget compared to Fiscal 2018 Preliminary Budget.*

The Fiscal 2018 Preliminary Budget for CCHR totals \$11.4 million, a decrease of \$114,000 from its Fiscal 2017 Adopted Budget of \$11.5 million. The \$114,000 decrease is due to a decrease in the Other Than Personal Services (OTPS) budget of \$1.3 million, offset by an increase in the Personal Services (PS) budget of \$1.2 million.

The Fiscal 2017 budget for CCHR as presented in the Preliminary Plan shows growth of \$567,000 or five percent since adoption due to new needs and other adjustments. (See

Appendix A for a list of all the changes to the Fiscal 2017 and Fiscal 2018 Budgets since adoption).

## Financial Plan Changes

### New Needs

- **Deputy Commissioner for Strategic Initiatives.** The November Plan included \$127,034 in Fiscal 2017 increasing to \$190,550 in the outyears to support the position Deputy Commissioner for Strategic Initiatives.
- **Immigration and Human Rights Hotline Call Takers.** The Fiscal 2018 Preliminary Plan includes funding to support eight new positions for Immigration and Human Rights Hotline Call Takers. Specifically, \$350,000 in Fiscal 2017 and \$400,000 in the outyears.

## Financial Summary

The table below provides an overview of CCHR's actual expenditures for Fiscal 2015 and Fiscal 2016, the Adopted Budget for Fiscal 2017, and planned expenditures for Fiscal 2017 and Fiscal 2018 as proposed in the Preliminary Plan.

<b>CCHR Financial Summary</b>						
<i>Dollars in Thousands</i>						
	2015	2016	2017	Preliminary Plan		*Difference
	Actual	Actual	Adopted	2017	2018	2017 - 2018
<b>Budget by Unit of Appropriation</b>						
001 - Personal Services	\$1,185	\$2,254	\$3,114	\$3,441	\$3,716	\$602
002 - Other Than Personal Services	400	1,421	1,272	1,447	1,272	0
003 - Community Development - PS	3,713	3,854	4,892	4,957	5,476	584
004 - Community Development - OTPS	497	1,313	2,279	2,279	979	(1,300)
<b>TOTAL</b>	<b>\$5,795</b>	<b>\$8,842</b>	<b>\$11,557</b>	<b>\$12,124</b>	<b>\$11,443</b>	<b>(\$114)</b>
<b>Funding</b>						
City Funds			\$11,557	\$12,099	\$11,443	(\$114)
State			0	25	0	0
<b>TOTAL</b>	<b>\$5,795</b>	<b>\$8,842</b>	<b>\$11,557</b>	<b>\$12,124</b>	<b>\$11,443</b>	<b>(\$114)</b>
<b>Budgeted Headcount</b>						
Community Development - Full-Time Positions	52	62	81	81	81	0
PS/OTPS - Administration - Full-Time Positions	13	26	40	49	49	9
<b>TOTAL</b>	<b>65</b>	<b>88</b>	<b>121</b>	<b>130</b>	<b>130</b>	<b>9</b>

*\*The difference of Fiscal 2017 Adopted Budget compared to Fiscal 2018 Preliminary Budget.*

The Commission's Fiscal 2018 Preliminary Budget of \$11.4 million is \$114,000 less than its Fiscal 2017 Adopted Budget of \$11.5 million. In June, the projected budget for Fiscal 2018 was already \$706,000 less than the Fiscal 2017 Adopted Budget. The year-over-year change of \$1.3 million in the Community Development OTPS U/A is due to funding for advertising (\$1 million) and data processing equipment (\$300,000) that was included in the Fiscal 2017 budget only. Since the adoption of the Fiscal 2017 budget, the Financial Plan updates include several changes to CCHR's Fiscal 2017 and 2018 budgets. For Fiscal 2017 and Fiscal 2018, these include new needs and other adjustments of \$567,000 and \$591,000, respectively, as discussed on the previous page. The Fiscal 2018 Preliminary Budget supports a workforce

of 130 full-time positions. According to the Commissions, it has actual headcount is 106 positions, 24 positions below the budgeted headcount.

### **Agency Operations and Infrastructure Changes**

With support from the Council and the Administration, CCHR received additional funding beginning in Fiscal 2016 which enabled it to grow in both size and scope. Additional funding and headcount supported the Commission's efforts to proactively initiate investigations, decrease attorney caseloads, and increase the availability of staff in its borough-based Community Relations Bureau offices. For the first time in more than two decades, the budget for the Commission included a substantial increase in Fiscal 2016, adding \$3.4 million and 62 new positions (54 full-time and eight full-time equivalent positions.) In total, the Fiscal 2016 Budget included \$10.3 million and 128 positions (120 full-time positions and eight full time equivalent positons.) This change represented a 55 percent increase in funding and an 82 percent increase in headcount from Fiscal 2015. Actual headcount for Fiscal 2016 totaled 88 positions, an increase of 35.4 percent above the Fiscal 2015 actual headcount of 65 positions.

Over the last two years, the Commission has worked diligently to build its internal infrastructure and revamp the way the agency operates so that it is more inclusive of the needs of New Yorkers with respect to interpreting the City Human Rights Law more broadly and enforcing more protections. With the additional funding, the CCHR has created a new organizational structure focused on improved supervision, training and staff development. The CCHR has added staff in all areas of the Commission, including the Law Enforcement Bureau and Community Relations Bureau. In addition, as part of the Commissioner's 2015 Strategic Plan, the Commission also added new departments, including the Office of Communications and Marketing, the Office of the Chair, the General Counsel's Office, Operations and the Human Resources Department.

The Fiscal 2018 Preliminary Budget includes \$11.4 million with a budgeted headcount of 130 positions, an increase of nine positions above the 121 positions in the Fiscal 2017 Budget. The budgeted headcount of 130 include 49 positions for the executive staff and administrative support, 35 attorneys and 46 Human Rights Specialists. The Commission has been actively hiring and in calendar year 2016, the Commission hired 47 new staff, including one supervising attorney, seven attorneys, four attorney interns, six Human Rights Specialists and three Associate Human Rights Specialists. The table below provides details on all of the new hires and the assigned offices.

<b>CCHR New Hires in Calendar Year 2016</b>	
<b>Law Enforcement Bureau</b>	<b>Headcount</b>
Attorneys	7
Attorney Interns	4
Assistant Commissioner	1
Supervising Attorney	1
Human Rights Specialists	3
Infoline Director	1
Testing Coordinator	1
Part-Time Testers	2
Administrative Support Staff	3
<b>Sub-total</b>	<b>23</b>
<b>Community Relations Bureau</b>	<b>Headcount</b>
Managing Director (BX, Man, SI)	3
Lead Advisor on Muslim, Arab, and South Asian Communities	1
Community Service Center Directors	2
Human Rights Specialists	3
Associate Human Rights Specialists	3
<b>Sub-total</b>	<b>12</b>
<b>The Office of the Chairperson</b>	<b>Headcount</b>
Associate Policy Counsel	1
Policy Analyst	1
<b>Sub-total</b>	<b>2</b>
<b>General Counsel</b>	<b>Headcount</b>
Director of Mediation and Conflict Resolution	1
Assistant General Counsel	2
Budget Analyst	1
Chief of Information Technology	1
Information Technology Support Staff	3
<b>Sub-total</b>	<b>8</b>
<b>Communications and Marketing</b>	<b>Headcount</b>
Communications and Marketing Coordinator	1
Deputy Press Secretary	1
<b>Sub-total</b>	<b>2</b>
<b>TOTAL</b>	<b>47</b>

Source: CCHR 2016 Annual Report

### Units of Appropriation

The following two tables provide an overview of CCHR's Fiscal 2018 Preliminary Plan by unit of appropriation (U/A) with actual expenditures for Fiscal 2015 and Fiscal 2016, the Adopted Budget for Fiscal 2017 and planned expenditures for Fiscal 2017 and Fiscal 2018. Each shows spending, funding summaries and budgeted headcount.

## Community Development

Funding in the Community Development units of appropriation (U/A 003-PS and U/A 004-OTPS) support CCHR's efforts to eliminate and prevent unlawful discrimination, and foster mutual understanding and respect among all racial, religious, and ethnic groups in the City. The PS funding is for staff within the Law Enforcement and Community Relations Bureau. The Law enforcement and community relations programs are designed to promote equal opportunity through the investigation, prosecution, and adjudication of individual discrimination complaints, and to eliminate patterns of discrimination through enforcement, crisis intervention-resolution, and education efforts. The OTPS funding is for the purchase of supplies, materials and other services required to support the community development operations.

<b>Community Development</b>						
<i>Dollars in Thousands</i>						
	<b>2015</b>	<b>2016</b>	<b>2017</b>	<b>Preliminary Plan</b>		<b>*Difference</b>
	<b>Actual</b>	<b>Actual</b>	<b>Adopted</b>	<b>2017</b>	<b>2018</b>	<b>2017 - 2018</b>
<b>Spending</b>						
<b>Personal Services</b>						
Full-Time Salaried - Civilian	\$3,162	\$3,669	\$4,638	\$4,703	\$5,222	\$584
Overtime - Civilian	7	0	11	11	11	0
Additional Gross Pay	511	175	205	205	205	0
PS Other	32	9	39	39	39	0
<b>Subtotal</b>	<b>\$3,713</b>	<b>\$3,854</b>	<b>\$4,892</b>	<b>\$4,957</b>	<b>\$5,476</b>	<b>\$584</b>
<b>Other Than Personal Services</b>						
Contractual Services	\$47	\$92	\$26	\$181	\$26	\$0
Contractual Services - Professional Services	21	29	174	248	99	(75)
Other Services & Charges	339	1,005	1,689	1,615	774	(916)
Property & Equipment	51	131	363	199	60	(303)
Social Services	0	0	0	2	0	0
Supplies & Materials	40	56	26	34	20	(6)
<b>Subtotal</b>	<b>\$497</b>	<b>\$1,313</b>	<b>\$2,279</b>	<b>\$2,279</b>	<b>\$979</b>	<b>(\$1,300)</b>
<b>TOTAL</b>	<b>\$4,210</b>	<b>\$5,167</b>	<b>\$7,171</b>	<b>\$7,236</b>	<b>\$6,455</b>	<b>(\$716)</b>
<b>Funding</b>						
City Funds			\$7,171	\$7,236	\$6,455	(\$716)
<b>TOTAL</b>	<b>\$4,210</b>	<b>\$5,167</b>	<b>\$7,171</b>	<b>\$7,236</b>	<b>\$6,455</b>	<b>(\$716)</b>
<b>Budgeted Headcount</b>						
Full-Time Positions - Civilian	52	62	81	81	81	0
<b>TOTAL</b>	<b>52</b>	<b>62</b>	<b>81</b>	<b>81</b>	<b>81</b>	<b>0</b>

\*The difference of Fiscal 2017 Adopted Budget compared to Fiscal 2018 Preliminary Budget.

The Fiscal 2018 Preliminary Budget for the Community Development program areas totals \$6.4 million. This is a decrease of \$716,000, or ten percent, when compared to the Commission's Fiscal 2017 Adopted Budget of \$7.2 million. The decrease is due to a reduction in the OTPS budget of \$1.3 million, offset by an increase in the PS budget of \$584,000. The year-over-year change of \$716,000 is due to adjustments that were scheduled in a prior financial plan. The change in the OTPS budget is primarily due to a reduction of \$916,000 in other services and charges for advertising and \$303,000 in property and equipment for the purchase of data processing equipment that is not included in the Fiscal 2018 Budget. The increase of \$584,000 is due to adjustments to support the CCHR's expansion that were

included in previous financial plans. The headcount for the Community Development program area in Fiscal 2018 totals 81 and remains unchanged since adoption.

Changes to the Community Development program area include the following:

- **Hiring Plan Adjustment.** The November Plan included a technical adjustment that added one-time funding of \$64,776 in Fiscal 2017 to supplement the salary of new staff hired between July and September 2016.

## PS and OTPS – Administration

Funding in the PS and OTPS - Administration units of appropriation (U/A 001-PS and U/A 002-OTPS) support CCHR's administrative staff in managing the administration of the Commission in addressing citywide issues of discrimination in employment, housing, and public accommodations based on race, color, gender, sexual orientation, religion, national origin and ancestry, age, marital status, handicap, lawful occupation, people with children in housing, conviction records in private-sector employment, alienage and citizenship status, and unemployment status. These units of appropriation include, but are not limited to, operations, public affairs, and information services. The OTPS funds are used for the purchase of supplies, materials and other services required to support executive and administrative operations.

<b>PS and OTPS - Administration</b>						
<i>Dollars in Thousands</i>						
	<b>2015</b>	<b>2016</b>	<b>2017</b>	<b>Preliminary Plan</b>		<b>*Difference</b>
	<b>Actual</b>	<b>Actual</b>	<b>Adopted</b>	<b>2017</b>	<b>2018</b>	<b>2017 - 2018</b>
<b>Spending</b>						
<b>Personal Services</b>						
Full-Time Salaried - Civilian	\$1,021	\$2,089	\$3,062	\$3,389	\$3,664	\$602
Overtime - Civilian	2	6	0	0	0	0
Additional Gross Pay	162	158	49	49	49	0
P.S. Other	0	0	3	3	3	0
<b>Subtotal</b>	<b>\$1,185</b>	<b>\$2,254</b>	<b>\$3,114</b>	<b>\$3,441</b>	<b>\$3,716</b>	<b>\$602</b>
<b>Other Than Personal Services</b>						
Contractual Services	\$17	\$115	\$12	\$3	\$12	\$0
Contractual Services - Professional Services	27	20	7	26	7	0
Fixed & Misc. Charges	0	0	0	0	0	0
Other Services & Charges	131	1,078	1,187	1,309	1,187	0
Property & Equipment	127	214	11	57	11	0
Supplies & Materials	99	(5)	55	52	55	0
<b>Subtotal</b>	<b>\$400</b>	<b>\$1,421</b>	<b>\$1,272</b>	<b>\$1,447</b>	<b>\$1,272</b>	<b>\$0</b>
<b>TOTAL</b>	<b>\$1,586</b>	<b>\$3,675</b>	<b>\$4,386</b>	<b>\$4,888</b>	<b>\$4,988</b>	<b>\$602</b>
<b>Funding</b>						
City Funds			\$4,386	\$4,863	\$4,988	\$602
State			0	25	0	0
<b>TOTAL</b>	<b>\$1,586</b>	<b>\$3,675</b>	<b>\$4,386</b>	<b>\$4,888</b>	<b>\$4,988</b>	<b>\$602</b>
<b>Budgeted Headcount</b>						
Full-Time Positions - Civilian	13	26	40	49	49	9
<b>TOTAL</b>	<b>13</b>	<b>26</b>	<b>40</b>	<b>49</b>	<b>49</b>	<b>9</b>

\*The difference of Fiscal 2017 Adopted Budget compared to Fiscal 2018 Preliminary Budget.



The Fiscal 2018 Preliminary Budget for PS and OTPS - Administration totals approximately \$5 million, an increase of \$602,000, or 13.7 percent above, the Fiscal 2017 Adopted Budget of \$4.4 million. The increase is due to funding of \$590,000 to support nine additional staff that have been added in the November and Preliminary Financial Plans.

The Fiscal 2017 budget as presented in the Preliminary Plan increases by approximately \$502,000 to support a portion of the new positions and the associated OTPS costs. Additionally, the Fiscal 2017 Budget includes one-time funding of \$25,000 in State aid.

Changes to the PS and OTPS - Administration program area include the following:

### **New Needs**

- **Deputy Commissioner for Strategic Initiatives.** The November Plan included \$127,034 in Fiscal 2017 increasing to \$190,550 in the outyears to support the position Deputy Commissioner for Strategic Initiatives. According to the Commission, the Deputy Commissioner will be in charge of strategic partnerships and managing certain projects and processes within the Commission across key City agencies and external local and national partners. In this capacity, the Deputy Commissioner will also work with City agencies to address their internal NYCHRL-related policy issues.
- **Immigration and Human Rights Hotline Call Takers.** The Fiscal 2018 Preliminary Plan includes baseline funding to expand the CCHR's Infoline to include additional Human Rights Call Takers. Funding in the amount of \$350,000 in Fiscal 2017 and \$400,000 in Fiscal 2018 and in the outyears is included in the budget for eight new positions. Following the Presidential post-election, CCHR received an increase in calls regarding discrimination, harassment, and bias incidents, and therefore recognized the need to increase its staff. CCHR staff received cross-training by other agencies to allow it to provide additional referrals, including referrals to ActionNYC for immigration legal support. Currently the Infoline has five budgeted positions and this action will bring it up to 13 budgeted positions. According to CCHR, it anticipates hiring the eight positions by April 2017. Currently, the hotline hours are 9am to 5pm with a callback system for calls received after hours. CCHR is working with the Department of Information Technology and Telecommunications (DOITT) to have live call takers and voicemail on the weekend.

### **Other Financial Plan Changes**

- **Local Government Records Management State Grant.** The November Plan includes \$24,996 in Fiscal 2017 from a State grant for local government records management.

### **Fiscal 2017 PMMR Performance Measures**

The PMMR outlines the major services provided by the Commission and the goals associated with each. CCHR investigates allegations of discrimination in employment, housing and public accommodations, as well as bias-related harassment per year. In addition, the Commission initiates investigations and prosecutions of systemic Human Rights Law violations. The Commission provides pre-complaint intervention and promotes positive

intergroup relations through conferences, workshops and training sessions conducted by its Community Relations Bureau.

CCHR's 2016 Annual Report indicates that the Commission saw race, religion, alienage and citizenship status claims rise 46 percent in 2016. Increases were also seen with pregnancy discrimination investigations, disability discrimination, source of income discrimination and gender identity. The Commission maintained its average monetary recovery of over \$21,000 per case, which doubled from the year before.

CCHR has two service goals, which are 1) enforce the City's Human Rights Law and 2) educate the community on the Human Rights Law. CCHR collects data on its caseload and community awareness efforts and reports the data in the PMMR. The following chart provides actual performance statistics for Fiscal 2014-2016, target data where applicable for Fiscal 2017 and 2018 and 4-month actual data, which compares Fiscal 2016 and 2017.

**Law Enforcement Bureau Performance Measures.** LEB investigates, prosecutes and resolves complaints of discrimination and bias-related harassment. The Department uses a case tracking system to generate reports on the types of cases handled. According to CCHR's 2016 Annual Report, the Commission hired seven attorneys, four attorney interns, one Assistant Commissioner, one Supervising Attorney, three Human Rights Specialists, one Infoline Director, one Testing Coordinator, two part-time testers and three administrative support staff. The Fiscal 2018 Budget supports 35 attorney positions.

Law enforcement Bureau Performance Indicators	Actual			Target		4-Month Actual	
	FY14	FY15	FY16	FY17	FY18	FY16	FY17
Cases successfully mediated	21	0	0	*	*	0	0
Pre-complaint resolutions	189	165	200	*	*	56	91
Cases filed	497	697	908	*	*	310	291
Cases closed	602	608	336	*	*	78	170
- Cases closed (%) - no probable cause determination	45%	43%	5%	*	*	3%	6%
- Cases closed (%) - probable cause determination	8%	15%	6%	*	*	6%	2%
- Cases closed (%) - administrative cause	21%	20%	62%	*	*	58%	67%
- Cases closed (%) - settlement	26%	22%	27%	23%	23%	33%	25%
Cases referred to the Office of Administrative Trials and Hearings	47	89	21	*	*	5	4
Average value of cash settlement for complainant (\$)	\$15,250	\$10,755	\$34,775	*	*	\$50,212	\$18,960
Modifications for accessibility for disabled	185	155	191	*	*	51	87
Average age of complaint caseload (days)	297	250	340	300	300	312	375
Caseload	567	667	1,318	474	474	952	1,457
Cases pending by age - less than one year	496	505	837	414	414	645	818

In the first four months of Fiscal 2017, 291 new complaints were filed with LEB, including 75 Commission-initiated complaints and total caseload increased to 1,457 complaints under investigation.

- LEB increased case closures to 170 cases from Fiscal 2016 to Fiscal 2017 with 25 percent resolved through settlement.

- In four-month actuals, average cash settlement for complainants in Fiscal 2017 were \$18,960, compared to \$50,212 in Fiscal 2016. In the last three fiscal years, cash settlements for complaints have averaged \$37,596, with the highest amount of \$34,775 in Fiscal 2016, ever reported by the Commission.
- In the first four months of Fiscal 2017, the number of cases that were pending for less than one year increased to 818 as compared to 645 in Fiscal 2016.
- In Fiscal 2016, CCHR filed 908 cases, 30 percent more than the 697 cases filed in Fiscal 2015. In the first four months of Fiscal 2017, CCHR filed only 291 as cases compared to 310 during the same time last year. According to the PMMR, LEB has maintained the use of a provision in the NYCHRL authorizing the Commission to dismiss complaints when prosecution of the complaint will not serve the public interest.
- According to the PMMR, LEB revamped its testing program to cover additional areas of discrimination. LEB implemented a testing strategy referred to as “paired” tests, where two testers who are matched according to all but the demographic being tested, perform the same test and compare the results. In the first four months of Fiscal 2017, LEB performed 216 tests in housing (107 were paired tests), 12 tests in public accommodations, 76 tests in employment, and 48 tests in facilities that are both public accommodations and housing providers. The areas of discrimination tested included gender identity, gender, criminal background, credit history, pregnancy, disability accommodation and source of income.
- In the first four months of Fiscal 2017, CCHR negotiated 87 building modifications for the disabled, compared to 51 in Fiscal 2016.

**Community Relations Bureau Performance Measures.** CRB educates the community on the Human Rights Law and seeks to increase community awareness. CRB’s research division tracks the different workshops and training sessions conducted by the Commission, including the number of instances where service was provided. According to CCHR’s 2016 Annual Report, CRB added a Managing Director for the Bronx, Manhattan and Staten Island; a Lead Advisor on Muslim, Arab and South Asian Communities; two Community Service Center Directors; three Human Rights Specialists; and three Associate Human Rights Specialists. The Fiscal 2018 Budget supports 46 Human Rights Specialists positions.

Community Relations Bureau Performance Indicators	Actual			Target		4-Month Actual	
	FY14	FY15	FY16	FY17	FY18	FY16	FY17
Conferences, workshops and training sessions	1,288	1,394	2,397	1,000	1,000	749	964
Community-based technical assistance	53,426	56,016	37,896	40,000	40,000	19,267	16,545
School-based training sessions conducted	272	326	79	250	250	13	20

- In the first four months of Fiscal 2017, the number of CRB conferences, workshops and training sessions rose 29 percent to 964 from 749 in Fiscal 2016.
- CRB provided 16,545 individuals with technical assistance, which includes answering specific questions on discrimination in housing, employment, public accommodations, completing preliminary intake of potential claims and making

referrals to the Commission's LEB or other resources. The PMMR does not indicate why technical assistance sessions offered is 2,722 fewer than during the same reporting time last year.

- The number of school-based training sessions offered increased from 13 to 20 sessions.

## Appendix A: Budget Actions in the November and the Preliminary Plans

<i>Dollars in Thousands</i>	FY 2017			FY 2018		
	City	Non-City	Total	City	Non-City	Total
<b>CCHR Budget as of the Adopted 2017 Budget</b>	<b>\$11,558</b>	<b>\$0</b>	<b>\$11,558</b>	<b>\$10,852</b>	<b>\$0</b>	<b>\$10,852</b>
<b>New Needs</b>						
Deputy Commissioner for Strategic Initiatives	\$127	\$0	\$127	\$191	\$0	\$191
Immigration and Human Rights Hotline Call Takers	350	0	350	400	0	400
<b>Subtotal, New Needs</b>	<b>\$477</b>	<b>\$0</b>	<b>\$477</b>	<b>\$591</b>	<b>\$0</b>	<b>\$591</b>
<b>Other Adjustments</b>						
Hiring Plan Adjustment	\$65	\$0	\$65	\$0	\$0	\$0
Local Government Records Management State Grant	0	25	25	0	0	0
<b>Subtotal, Other Adjustments</b>	<b>\$65</b>	<b>\$25</b>	<b>\$90</b>	<b>\$0</b>	<b>\$0</b>	<b>\$0</b>
<b>TOTAL, All Changes</b>	<b>\$542</b>	<b>\$25</b>	<b>\$567</b>	<b>\$591</b>	<b>\$0</b>	<b>\$591</b>
<b>CCHR Budget as of the Preliminary 2018 Budget</b>	<b>\$12,099</b>	<b>\$25</b>	<b>\$12,124</b>	<b>\$11,443</b>	<b>\$0</b>	<b>\$11,443</b>

## Appendix B: Contractual Spending

<b>Commission on Human Rights Fiscal 2018 Preliminary Contract Budget</b>				
<i>Dollars in Thousands</i>				
<b>Category</b>	<b>Fiscal 2017 Adopted</b>	<b>Number of Contracts</b>	<b>Fiscal 2018 Preliminary</b>	<b>Number of Contracts</b>
Maintenance. & Rep. General	\$5	6	\$5	6
Office Equipment Maintenance	5	2	5	2
Data Processing Equipment	6	1	6	1
Cleaning Services	22	2	22	2
Professional Services - Computer Services	106	3	106	3
Professional Services Other	75	1	0	0
<b>TOTAL</b>	<b>\$219</b>	<b>15</b>	<b>\$144</b>	<b>14</b>