

THE COUNCIL OF THE CITY OF NEW YORK

Hon. Melissa Mark-Viverito
Speaker of the Council

Hon. Julissa Ferreras-Copeland
Chair, Finance Committee

Hon. Benjamin Kallos
Chair, Governmental Operations Committee



Report on the Fiscal 2017 Executive Budget New York City Board of Elections May 13, 2016

James Subudhi, Legislative Financial Analyst
John Russell, Unit Head

Finance Division

Latonia McKinney, Director
Regina Poreda Ryan, Deputy Director
Nathan Toth, Deputy Director
Paul Scimone, Deputy Director
Emre Edev, Assistant Director

Executive Budget Summary

- **Expense Budget Overview.** The New York City Board of Election's (BOE or the Board) proposed Fiscal 2017 Expense Budget totals \$123.7 million, including \$52 million in personal services funding to support 475 full-time positions and over 30,000 poll workers.
- **Executive Budget Changes**
 - **New in the Executive Budget.** The Fiscal 2017 Executive Budget includes \$23.5 million in new needs and \$12 million in other adjustments, of which \$9 million is anticipated to be rolled into the Fiscal 2017.
 - **BOE Contract Budget.** The BOE's contract budget for Fiscal 2017 totals \$37.8 million to support 49 contracts. As the BOE is responsible for printing all ballots for elections held in the City, printing contracts total \$17.1 million and represent 45 percent of BOE's contract budget.
 - **Capital Budget:** The BOE's planned capital commitments for Fiscal 2017 total \$2.9 million. BOE capital projects include IT upgrades, call center upgrades, and relocation of offices and additional warehouse space.

BOE Reform Proposal.

During the Presidential Primary held on Tuesday, April 19, 2016, voters in the City reported several problems, including unknowingly being removed from voter rolls, having their party affiliation changed, poll sites opening late, and malfunctioning voting machines. It is estimated that BOE removed close to 120,000 registered voters in Brooklyn from the voter registration rolls. As a result the BOE suspended two employees without pay. The New York City Comptroller and the State Attorney General have both launched audits of the BOE.

On April 25, Mayor de Blasio announced he would make \$20 million available to the BOE for reforms, under the condition that they sign a binding agreement by June 1, 2016. The funding for the Mayor's proposed reforms were not included in the 2017 Executive Plan. The reforms fall into three categories: 1) identifying and rectifying systemic challenges by hiring an outside consultant and posting all job vacancies; 2) enhancing poll worker training and increasing salaries; and 3) improving communication with voters. The last category includes legislation recently passed by the Council. They include Int. 463-A (Vacca) that requires email and text message notifications to voters; Int.659-A (Kallos) which creates a voter information portal that can track absentee ballots; and Int. 62-A (Garodnick) which requires notices on former poll sites.

BOE Overview

This report provides an overview of the Board of Elections Fiscal 2017 Budget, a review of the significant initiatives included in the Executive Budget, and a summary of the Department's Capital Budget for Fiscal 2016-2017. Appendix 1 reports the changes made to the Fiscal 2016 and Fiscal 2017 Budget since adoption of the Fiscal 2016 Budget. For additional information on the BOE's Budget and its various programs, please refer to the "Fiscal 2017 Preliminary Report" available on the Council's website.

| BOE Financial Summary | | | | | | |
|-------------------------------------|------------------|------------------|------------------|-----------------------|------------------|--------------------|
| | 2014 | 2015 | 2016 | Executive Plan | | *Difference |
| <i>Dollars in Thousands</i> | Actual | Actual | Adopted | 2016 | 2017 | 2016 - 2017 |
| Spending | | | | | | |
| Personal Services | | | | | | |
| Full-Time Salaried - Civilian | \$16,325 | \$17,676 | \$20,413 | \$25,234 | \$22,097 | \$1,683 |
| Other Salaried and Unsalariated | 33,987 | 26,581 | 37,759 | 32,939 | 23,603 | (14,155) |
| Additional Gross Pay | 285 | 1,358 | 89 | 89 | 221 | 132 |
| Overtime - Civilian | 6,450 | 4,869 | 2,292 | 2,292 | 4,874 | 2,582 |
| P.S. Other | (1) | (3) | 0 | 0 | 0 | 0 |
| Fringe Benefits | 364 | 326 | 24 | 282 | 414 | 390 |
| Amounts to be Scheduled | 0 | 0 | 1,146 | 1,146 | 1,146 | 0 |
| Subtotal | \$57,410 | \$50,807 | \$61,724 | \$61,982 | \$52,356 | (\$9,368) |
| Other Than Personal Services | | | | | | |
| Supplies & Materials | \$3,824 | \$3,903 | \$4,281 | \$4,676 | \$6,000 | \$1,719 |
| Fixed & Misc. Charges | 9 | 35 | 0 | 0 | 10 | 10 |
| Property & Equipment | 587 | 3,569 | 2,550 | 4,156 | 1,958 | (592) |
| Other Services & Charges | 25,764 | 26,232 | 24,039 | 24,693 | 25,601 | 1,562 |
| Contractual Services | 28,569 | 21,626 | 47,659 | 36,919 | 37,822 | (9,837) |
| Subtotal | \$58,753 | \$55,364 | \$78,529 | \$70,444 | \$71,391 | (\$7,138) |
| TOTAL | \$116,163 | \$106,170 | \$140,252 | \$132,426 | \$123,746 | (\$16,506) |
| Funding | | | | | | |
| City Funds | | | \$140,252 | \$132,311 | \$121,716 | (\$18,536) |
| State | | | 0 | 30 | 1974 | 1974 |
| Federal - Other | | | 0 | 84 | 56 | 56 |
| TOTAL | \$116,163 | \$106,170 | \$140,252 | \$132,426 | \$123,746 | (\$16,506) |
| Budgeted Headcount | | | | | | |
| Full-Time Positions - Civilian | 367 | 367 | 335 | 455 | 450 | 115 |
| Amounts to be Scheduled | 0 | 0 | 25 | 25 | 25 | 0 |
| TOTAL | 367 | 367 | 360 | 480 | 475 | 115 |

**The difference of Fiscal 2016 Adopted Budget compared to Fiscal 2017 Executive Budget.*

The BOE's Fiscal 2017 Executive Budget totals \$123.7 million, \$14.2 million less than the BOE's Fiscal 2016 Adopted Budget of \$140.3 million. Of the total, 98 percent of the BOE's Fiscal 2017 budget is City funding. Because of the nature of elections, the BOE's budget varies significantly from year-to-year based on several variables, including the type of election (local, statewide, congressional or presidential), implementation of new voter laws, and special elections and other changes in election scheduling, many of which occur mid-year. While BOE routinely identifies budget shortfalls, funding for any deficits are added to the Board's budget by the fiscal year's end.

The BOE's total headcount for Fiscal 2017 is 475 positions, for a net increase of 115 positions when compared to the Fiscal 2016 Adopted Budget. This increase is the result of the BOE converting temporary positions to full-time positions.

Executive Budget Actions

The Fiscal 2017 Executive Budget includes \$23.5 million in new needs and \$12 million in other adjustments. The following new needs are included in the plan:

- \$10 million for general other than personal services costs for the State Legislative Primaries on September 13, 2016 and the General Presidential Election on November 8, 2016;
- \$8.1 million for poll workers for the next two elections; and
- \$3.7 million for voting machine support service contracts.

Actual Expenditures

| BOE Actuals <i>Dollars in Thousands</i> | Fiscal Year | | | | | |
|--|-----------------|------------------|------------------|------------------|------------------|------------------|
| | 2010 | 2011 | 2012 | 2013 | 2014 | 2015 |
| PS | \$26,951 | \$48,487 | \$57,651 | \$52,682 | \$57,410 | \$50,807 |
| OTPS | 68,755 | 54,387 | 52,187 | 54,791 | 58,753 | 55,364 |
| Agency Total | \$95,706 | \$102,874 | \$109,839 | \$107,473 | \$116,163 | \$106,170 |

From Fiscal 2010 through 2015, the Board's total expenditures averaged \$106.4 million per year, peaking at \$116.2 million in Fiscal 2014. Funding for poll workers shifted from Other Than Personnel Services to Personnel Services beginning in Fiscal 2011 due to an Internal Revenue Service ruling that said they should be considered New York City employees and not consultants.

During Fiscal 2015, the Board conducted several notable local elections, including the 2014 gubernatorial election, thus creating the need for additional funds. In Fiscal 2015, expenses were budgeted at \$110 million and the Board ended the year with a \$6 million budget surplus.

Preliminary Budget Highlight

Funding for Tablets. The Fiscal 2017 Preliminary Plan for the BOE included additional funding of \$726,000 in Fiscal 2017 for electronic tablets on Election Day. The BOE uses the tablets for reporting election results, checking in with poll workers, and helping voters find their election district and poll site.

Appendix 1: BOE Fiscal 2017 Budget Actions since Fiscal 2016 Adoption

| <i>Dollars in Thousands</i> | FY 2016 | | | FY 2017 | | |
|--|------------------|------------------|-------------------|------------------|----------------|------------------|
| | City | Non-City | Total | City | Non-City | Total |
| BOE Budget as of the Adopted 2016 Budget | \$140,253 | \$0 | \$140,253 | \$87,650 | \$0 | \$87,650 |
| New Needs - Prelim. 2017 | | | | | | |
| Election Day Tablet Support | \$0 | \$0 | \$0 | \$414 | \$0 | \$414 |
| Election Event Tablet Deployments | 0 | 0 | 0 | 312 | 0 | 312 |
| Subtotal, New Needs | \$0 | \$0 | \$0 | \$726 | \$0 | \$726 |
| Other Adjustments - Prelim. 2017 | | | | | | |
| Budget Modification | \$0 | \$0 | \$0 | \$0 | \$0 | \$0 |
| FY16 NYS Voting Access | 0 | 942 | 942 | 0 | 0 | 0 |
| FY16 Voter Ed Grant | 0 | 1,062 | 1,062 | 0 | 0 | 0 |
| Polling Place Access | 0 | 140 | 140 | 0 | 0 | 0 |
| Subtotal, Other Adjustments | \$0 | \$2,145 | \$2,145 | \$0 | \$0 | \$0 |
| TOTAL, All Changes Prelim. 2017 | \$0 | \$2,145 | \$2,145 | \$726 | \$0 | \$726 |
| BOE Budget as of the Preliminary 2017 Budget | \$140,253 | \$2,145 | \$142,398 | \$88,376 | \$0 | \$88,376 |
| New Needs - Exec. 2017 | | | | | | |
| Consultant Costs | \$1,500 | \$0 | \$1,500 | \$0 | \$0 | \$0 |
| Intra-city Vehicle Maintenance | 0 | 0 | 0 | 4 | 0 | 4 |
| One Time Lease Costs for 42 Broadway | 0 | 0 | 0 | 820 | 0 | 820 |
| OTPS for Two Elections | 0 | 0 | 0 | 10,019 | 0 | 10,019 |
| Poll Workers for 2 Elections | 0 | 0 | 0 | 8,189 | 0 | 8,189 |
| Voting Machine Support Services Contract | 0 | 0 | 0 | 3,700 | 0 | 3,700 |
| Voting Results Transmission and Internal Communications | 0 | 0 | 0 | 840 | 0 | 840 |
| Subtotal, New Needs | \$1,500 | \$0 | \$1,500 | \$23,572 | \$0 | \$23,572 |
| Other Adjustments - Exec. 2017 | | | | | | |
| City Rollover | (\$9,300) | \$0 | (\$9,300) | \$9,300 | \$0 | \$9,300 |
| Heat, Light and Power | (141) | 0 | (141) | (86) | 0 | (86) |
| Help America Vote Act New York State Rollover | 0 | (1,032) | (1,032) | 0 | 1,032 | 1,032 |
| Help America Vote Act New York State Rollover - Intra-city Funding | 0 | (942) | (942) | 0 | 942 | 942 |
| Help America Vote Act Rollover | 0 | (56) | (56) | 0 | 56 | 56 |
| Lease Adjustment. | 0 | 0 | 0 | 553 | 0 | 553 |
| Subtotal, Other Adjustments | (\$9,442) | (\$2,030) | (\$11,471) | \$9,768 | \$2,030 | \$11,798 |
| TOTAL, All Changes - Exec. 2017 | (\$7,942) | (\$2,030) | (\$9,971) | \$33,340 | \$2,030 | \$35,370 |
| BOE Budget as of the Fiscal 2017 Executive Plan | \$132,311 | \$115 | \$132,426 | \$121,716 | \$2,030 | \$123,746 |