

REPORT OF THE COMMITTEE ON FINANCE

FINANCE DIVISION LATONIA MCKINNEY, DIRECTOR

RESOLUTION TO PROVIDE THE AMOUNTS NECESSARY FOR THE SUPPORT OF THE GOVERNMENT OF THE CITY OF NEW YORK AND THE COUNTIES THEREIN AND FOR THE PAYMENT OF INDEBTEDNESS THEREOF, FOR THE FISCAL YEAR BEGINNING ON JULY 1, 2015 AND ENDING ON JUNE 30, 2016 BY THE LEVY OF TAXES ON THE REAL PROPERTY IN THE CITY OF NEW YORK, IN ACCORDANCE WITH THE PROVISIONS OF THE CONSTITUTION OF THE STATE OF NEW YORK, THE REAL PROPERTY TAX LAW AND THE CHARTER OF THE CITY OF NEW YORK

<u>Introduction</u>. This Resolution, dated June 26, 2015, provides the amounts necessary for the support of the government of the City of New York and the counties therein and for the payment of indebtedness thereof, for the fiscal year beginning on July 1, 2015 and ending on June 30, 2016 by the levy of taxes on the real property in the city of New York, in accordance with the provisions of the Constitution of the State of New York, the Real Property Tax law and the Charter of the City of New York.

On May 7, 2015, the Mayor submitted the executive budget for Fiscal 2016 to the Council pursuant to Section 249 of the Charter. On the date hereof, the Council adopted the budget for Fiscal 2016 pursuant to Section 254 of the Charter (the "Fiscal 2016 Budget"). Pursuant to Section 1516 of the Charter, the Council must fix the annual real property tax rates immediately upon such approval of the Fiscal 2016 Budget. In the resolution, captioned above, fixing the real property tax rates for Fiscal 2016 (the "Tax Fixing Resolution"), the Council fixes the annual real property tax rates, as described in greater detail below, and authorizes the levy of real property taxes for Fiscal 2016.

Determining the Amount of the Real Property Tax Levy. In the Tax Fixing Resolution, the Council determines the amount of the real property tax levy for Fiscal 2016, pursuant to the provisions of Section 1516 of the Charter, in the following manner. (1) First, the Council acknowledges the amount of the Fiscal 2016 Budget to be \$78,528,034,085 as set forth in the communication from the Mayor pursuant to Section 1515(a) of the Charter (the "Fiscal 2015 Budget Amount"). (2) The Council then acknowledges the estimate of the probable amount of all non-property tax revenues to be \$56,143,842,085, as set forth in the communication from the Mayor pursuant to Section 1515(a) of the Charter (the "Fiscal 2016 Revenue Estimate"). (Attached hereto as Exhibit A is a description of the Fiscal 2016 Revenue Estimate, detailing all sources of revenues exclusive of real property taxes.) (3) Pursuant to Section 1516 of the Charter, the Council finally determines the net amount required to be raised by tax on real property to be \$22,384,192,000, by subtracting the amount of the Fiscal 2016 Revenue Estimate from the Fiscal 2016 Budget Amount.

In order to achieve a real property tax yield of \$22,384,192,000, however, due to provision for uncollectible taxes and refunds and collection of levies from prior years equal in the aggregate to \$1,760,806,063, the Council determines that a real property tax levy of \$24,144,998,063 is required. Such amount, levied at rates on the classes of real property as further described below will produce a balanced budget within generally accepted accounting principles for municipalities.

The Council also provides for the application of the real property tax levy (net of provision for

uncollectible taxes and refunds and collection of levies from prior years) to (1) debt service not subject to the constitutional operating limit, (2) debt service subject to the constitutional operating limit and (3) the Fiscal 2016 Budget in excess of the amount of the Fiscal 2016 Revenue Estimate.

Authorizing and Fixing the Real Property Tax Rates. After having determined the amount of the real property tax levy, the Council authorizes and fixes the real property tax rates. On May 26, 2015, the Commissioner of the Department of Finance (the "Commissioner") delivered the certified assessment rolls for all real property assessable for taxation in the City in each borough thereof for Fiscal 2016 to the Council, pursuant to Section 1514 of the Charter (the "Fiscal 2016 Assessment Rolls"). On June 26, 2015, the Council adopted a resolution in which the Council computed and certified the current base proportion, the current percentage and the base percentage of each class of real property in the City for Fiscal 2016 (the "Current Base Proportion Resolution"), pursuant to Section 1803-a (1) of the Real Property Tax Law. On June 26, 2015, pursuant to Section 1803-a of the Real Property Tax Law, the Council adopted a resolution in which the Council adopted a resolution in which the Council adopted a resolution Resolution in which the Council adopted a resolution Resolution in which the Council adopted a resolution Resolution"), pursuant to Section 1803-a (1) of the Real Property Tax Law. On June 26, 2015, pursuant to Section 1803-a of the Real Property Tax Law, the Council adopted a resolution in which the Council adjusted the current base proportions of each class of real property in the City for Fiscal 2016, to reflect the additions to, and full or partial removal from, the Fiscal 2016 Assessment Rolls (the "Adjusted Base Proportion Resolution").

The following sections describe the determinations the Council must make before it fixes the real property tax rates and the process by which the Council fixes the real property tax rates.

Assessed Valuation Calculations. In the Tax Fixing Resolution, the Council sets out the assessed valuation calculations of taxable real property in the City by class within each borough of the City. Next, the Council sets out the assessed valuation (1) by class of real property for the purpose of taxation (exclusive of the assessed valuation of veterans' real property exempt under state law from tax for general purposes but subject to tax for school purposes) in each borough of the City and (2) by class of veterans' real property subject to tax for school purposes in each borough of the City.

Compliance with Constitutional Operating Limit Provisions. In the Tax Fixing Resolution, the Council also provides evidence of compliance with constitutional operating limit provisions. The Council determines that the amount to be levied by tax on real property for the Fiscal 2016 Budget does not exceed the limit imposed by Section 10, Article VIII of the Constitution of the State of New York, as amended, and Article 12-A of the Real Property Tax Law (the "Operating Limit Provisions"). The Operating Limit Provisions require that the City not levy taxes on real property in any fiscal year in excess of an amount equal to a combined total of two and one-half percent (2 ½%) of the average full valuation of taxable real property in the City, determined by taking the assessed valuations of taxable real property on the last completed assessment roll and the four (4) preceding assessment rolls of the City and applying thereto the special equalization ratio which such assessed valuations of each such roll bear to the full valuations as fixed and determined by the State Office of Real Property Services ("ORPS"), minus (i) the amount to be raised by tax on real property in such year for the payment of the interest on and the redemption of certificates of other evidence of indebtedness described in the Constitution and (ii) the aggregate amount of business improvement district charges exclusive of debt service. (Attached hereto as Exhibit B is a description of net reductions of the amounts to be raised by the Fiscal 2016 tax levy as authorized by New York State law for purposes of the Operating Limit determination.)

Adjusted Base Proportions. The Tax Fixing Resolution sets forth the adjusted base proportions for Fiscal 2016, pursuant to the Adjusted Base Proportion Resolution, to be used in determining the Fiscal 2016 tax rates for the four classes of properties.

Tax Rates on Adjusted Base Proportions. Finally, in the Tax Fixing Resolution, the Council authorizes and fixes, pursuant to Section 1516 of the Charter, the rates of tax for Fiscal 2016 by class upon: (1) each dollar of assessed valuation of real property subject to taxation for all purposes of, and within, the City, as fixed in cents and thousandths of a cent per dollar of assessed valuation, as follows:

All One-, Two- and Three-Family Residential Real Property	0.19554
All Other Residential Real Property	0.12883
Utility Real Property	0.10813
All Other Real Property	0.10656

and (2) each dollar of assessed valuation of veterans' real property exempt under state law from tax for general purposes but subject to tax for school purposes of, and within, the City, as fixed in cents and thousandths of a cent per dollar of assessed valuation, as follows:

All One-, Two- and Three-Family Residential Real Property	0.11506
All Other Residential Real Property	0.07603
Utility Real Property	0.00000
All Other Real Property	0.06294

Authorization of the Levy of Property Taxes for Fiscal 2016. The Council authorizes and directs the Commissioner, pursuant to Section 1517 of the Charter, to set down in the Fiscal 2016 Assessment Rolls, opposite to the several sums set down as the valuation of real property, the respective sums to be paid as a tax thereon and add and set down the aggregate valuations of real property in the boroughs of the City and send a certificate of such aggregate valuation in each such borough to the State Comptroller. The Tax Fixing Resolution then requires the City Clerk to procure the proper warrants, in the form attached thereto, such warrants to be signed by the Public Advocate and countersigned by the City Clerk.

The Tax Fixing Resolution would take effect as of the date of adoption of the Fiscal 2016 Budget.

Accordingly, the Committee on Finance recommends adoption of the Tax Fixing Resolution.

EXHIBIT A

ESTIMATED FISCAL YEAR 2016 REVENUE OTHER THAN REAL PROPERTY TAXES Summarizing by Source of Revenue

Personal Income (Excluding Transitional Finance Authority Debt)10,594,000,000General Corporation4,023,000,000Commercial Rent398,000,000Utility398,000,000Mortgage Recording915,5000,000Unincorporated Business2,034,000,000Real Property Transfer2,034,000,000Cigarette48,000,000Mortgage Recording48,000,000Hotel Occupancy539,000,000Other:Penalty and InterestPenalty and Interest52,000,000Off-Track Betting Surtax1,250,000Oger and Liquor246,200,000Autoro Vehicle50,000,000Commercial Motor Vehicle50,000,000State Tax Relief Program ("STAR") for Personal Income and Real Property Taxes.765,000,000Viscellaneous Revenue:641,137,294Licenses, Franchises, etc.641,137,294Licenses, Franchises, etc.641,137,294State Tax Relief Program ("STAR") for Personal Income and Real Property Taxes.765,000,00020,123,470,00029,400,000Charges for Services.947,759,993Water and Sewer Charges.1,516,466,600Retal Income1,516,466,600Retal Income516,	Source of Revenue	Estimate of Revenue
General Sales (1) \$7,026,000,000 Personal Income (Excluding Transitional Finance Authority Debt) 10,594,000,000 General Corporation 770,000,000 Commercial Rent 770,000,000 Uility 398,000,000 Banking Corporation 770,000,000 Mortgage Recording 915,000,000 Unincorporated Business 2,034,000,000 Real Property Transfer 2,034,000,000 Gigarette 48,000,000 Hotel Occupancy 539,000,000 Off-Track Betting Surtax 52,000,000 Penalty and Interest 52,000,000 Off-Track Betting Surtax 1250,000 Payments in Lieu of Tax 246,200,000 Section 1127 (Waiver) 240,000,000 Beer and Liquor 24,000,000 Autous Use 29,000,000 Commercial Motor Vehicle 20,000,000 Taxicab License Transfer 46,000,000 License Surcharge 50,000,000 Other Refunds 26,000,000 State Tax Relief Program ("STAR") for Personal Income and Real Property Taxes 765,000,000	Taxes (excluding Real Estate Taxes):	
General Corporation 4,023,000,000 Commercial Rent 770,000,000 Dutility 398,000,000 Banking Corporation 915,000,000 Mortgage Recording 915,000,000 Unincorporated Business 2,034,000,000 Real Property Transfer 2,034,000,000 Cigarette 48,000,000 Hotel Occupancy 539,000,000 Other: 52,000,000 Penalty and Interest 00 Off-Track Betting 1,250,000 Payments in Lieu of Tax 246,200,000 Section 1127 (Waiver) 246,200,000 Payments in Lieu of Tax 24,000,000 Outouse 24,000,000 Outouse 20,000,000 Soution 1127 (Waiver) 24,000,000 Betting Surfax 76,000,000 Outouse 50,000,000 State Tax Relief Program ("STAR") for Personal Income and Real Property Taxes 765,000,000 Miscellaneous Revenue: 641,137,294 Licenses, Franchises, etc. 641,137,294 Interest Income. 29,400,000 <t< td=""><td></td><td>\$7,026,000,000</td></t<>		\$7,026,000,000
General Corporation 4,023,000,000 Commercial Rent 770,000,000 Dutility 398,000,000 Banking Corporation 915,000,000 Mortgage Recording 915,000,000 Unincorporated Business 2,034,000,000 Real Property Transfer 2,034,000,000 Cigarette 48,000,000 Hotel Occupancy 539,000,000 Other: 52,000,000 Penalty and Interest 00 Off-Track Betting 1,250,000 Payments in Lieu of Tax 246,200,000 Section 1127 (Waiver) 246,200,000 Payments in Lieu of Tax 24,000,000 Outouse 24,000,000 Outouse 20,000,000 Soution 1127 (Waiver) 24,000,000 Betting Surfax 76,000,000 Outouse 50,000,000 State Tax Relief Program ("STAR") for Personal Income and Real Property Taxes 765,000,000 Miscellaneous Revenue: 641,137,294 Licenses, Franchises, etc. 641,137,294 Interest Income. 29,400,000 <t< td=""><td></td><td></td></t<>		
Commercial Rent 770,000,000 Utility 398,000,000 Banking Corporation 398,000,000 Mortgage Recording 915,000,000 Unincorporated Business 2,034,000,000 Real Property Transfer 1,418,000,000 Cigarette 48,000,000 Hotel Occupancy 539,000,000 Other: Penalty and Interest 52,000,000 Penalty and Interest 52,000,000 1,250,000 Off-Track Betting Surtax 2,26,000,000 246,200,000 Payments in Lieu of Tax 246,200,000 246,200,000 Section 1127 (Waiver) 29,000,000 29,000,000 Others: Penalty and Interest 29,000,000 Others: Section 1127 (Waiver) 246,200,000 Decer and Liquor 29,000,000 29,000,000 Commercial Motor Vehicle 50,000,000 29,000,000 Taxicab License Fransfer 20,000,000 20,000 Licenses Surcharge 40,000,000 29,123,470,000 Horese Race Admissions 20,21,23,470,000 29,123,470,000	-	
Utility 398,000,000 Banking Corporation 77,000,000 Mortgage Recording 915,000,000 Unincorporated Business 2,034,000,000 Real Property Transfer 1,418,000,000 Other: 48,000,000 Penalty and Interest 52,000,000 Off-Track Betting 52,000,000 Off-Track Betting 52,000,000 Payments in Lieu of Tax 246,200,000 Payments in Lieu of Tax 246,200,000 Section 1127 (Waiver) 130,000,000 Beer and Liquor 24,000,000 Auto Use 29,000,000 Commercial Motor Vehicle 50,000,000 Taxicab License Transfer 50,000,000 Liquor License Surcharge 50,000,000 Horse Race Admissions 02,000,000 State Tax Relief Program ("STAR") for Personal Income and Real Property Taxes. 765,000,000 Miscellaneous Revenue: 12,137,294 Licenses, Franchises, etc. 641,137,294 Interest Income. 29,400,000 Charges for Services. 947,759,993 Water and Sever Charges. 1,516,466,600 Rental Income.<	*	770,000,000
Mortgage Recording 915,000,000 Unincorporated Business 2,034,000,000 Real Property Transfer 1,418,000,000 Cigarette 48,000,000 Hotel Occupancy 539,000,000 Other: 52,000,000 Penalty and Interest 52,000,000 Off-Track Betting Surtax 1,250,000 Payments in Lieu of Tax 246,200,000 Section 1127 (Waiver) 246,200,000 Payments in Lieu of Tax 246,000,000 Auto Use 29,000,000 Commercial Motor Vehicle 29,000,000 Taxicab License Transfer 8,000,000 Liquor License Surcharge 5,000,000 Unior E Race Admissions 02,000,000 State Tax Relief Program ("STAR") for Personal Income and Real Property Taxes 765,000,000 State Tax Relief Program ("STAR") for Personal Income and Real Property Taxes 765,000,000 Miscellaneous Revenue: 29,400,000 Licenses, Franchises, etc. 641,137,294 Interest Income 29,400,000 Charges for Services. 947,759,993 Water and Sewer Charges.		398,000,000
Unicorporated Business2.034,000,000Real Property Transfer1.418,000,000Gigarette48,000,000Hotel Occupancy539,000,000Other:52,000,000Penalty and Interest52,000,000Off-Track Betting1,250,000Off-Track Betting Surtax1,250,000Payments in Lieu of Tax246,200,000Section 1127 (Waiver)246,000,000Beer and Liquor24,000,000Auto Use29,000,000Commercial Motor Vehicle50,000,000Taxicab License Transfer50,000,000Liquor License Surcharge5,000,000Horse Race Admissions20,000Other Refunds29,000,000State Tax Relief Program ("STAR") for Personal Income and Real Property Taxes765,000,000Miscellaneous Revenue:641,137,294Licenses Franchises, etc.641,137,294Interest Income29,400,000Charges for Services.947,759,993Water and Sewer Charges1,516,466,600Rental Income27,1070,000Sincellaneous554,225,466	Banking Corporation	77,000,000
Real Property Transfer 1,418,000,000 Cigarette 48,000,000 Hotel Occupancy 539,000,000 Other: 9 Penalty and Interest 52,000,000 Off-Track Betting 52,000,000 Off-Track Betting Surtax 1,250,000 Payments in Lieu of Tax 246,200,000 Section 1127 (Waiver) 130,000,000 Beer and Liquor 24,000,000 Auto Use 29,000,000 Commercial Motor Vehicle 50,000,000 Traixiab License Transfer 8,000,000 Liquor License Surcharge 5,000,000 Hores Race Admissions 20,000 Other Refunds 765,000,000 State Tax Relief Program ("STAR") for Personal Income and Real Property Taxes 765,000,000 Miscellaneous Revenue: 641,137,294 Licenses, Franchises, etc. 641,137,294 Interest Income 947,759,993 Water and Sewer Charges 1,516,466,600 Rental Income 27,1070,000 State Tax Relief Porgram (STAR") Second 27,1070,000 Miscellaneous 54,225,466	Mortgage Recording	915,000,000
Cigarette 48,000,000 Hotel Occupancy 539,000,000 Other: 52,000,000 Penalty and Interest 52,000,000 Off-Track Betting 000 Payments in Lieu of Tax 1,250,000 Section 1127 (Waiver) 130,000,000 Beer and Liquor 246,200,000 Auto Use 29,000,000 Commercial Motor Vehicle 50,000,000 Taxicab License Transfer 8,000,000 Liquor License Surcharge 5,000,000 Horse Race Admissions 20,000 Other Refunds 20,000,000 State Tax Relief Program ("STAR") for Personal Income and Real Property Taxes 765,000,000 Miscellaneous Revenue: 121,023,000,000 Licenses, Franchises, etc. 641,137,294 Interest Income 29,400,000 Charges for Services. 947,759,993 Water and Sewer Charges. 1,516,466,600 Rental Income 271,070,000 State Tax Relief Program 2516,400,000 Charges for Services. 947,759,993 Water and Sewer Charges. 1,516,466,600 Rental Income 271,070,	Unincorporated Business	2,034,000,000
Hotel Occupancy 539,000,000 Other: 9 Penalty and Interest 52,000,000 Off-Track Betting 0 Off-Track Betting Surtax 1,250,000 Payments in Lieu of Tax 246,200,000 Section 1127 (Waiver) 130,000,000 Beer and Liquor 24,000,000 Auto Use 29,000,000 Commercial Motor Vehicle 50,000,000 Taxicab License Transfer 8,000,000 Liquor License Surcharge 5,000,000 Horse Race Admissions 20,000 Other Refunds 22,000,000 State Tax Relief Program ("STAR") for Personal Income and Real Property Taxes 765,000,000 State Tax Relief Program ("STAR") for Personal Income and Real Property Taxes 29,400,000 Charges for Services 947,759,993 Water and Sewer Charges 1,516,466,600 Rental Income 271,070,000 Fines and Forfeitures. 809,816,000 Miscellaneous 554,225,466	Real Property Transfer	1,418,000,000
Other: Penalty and Interest 52,000,000 Off-Track Betting 0.000 Off-Track Betting Surtax 1,250,000 Payments in Lieu of Tax 246,200,000 Section 1127 (Waiver) 130,000,000 Beer and Liquor 24,000,000 Auto Use 29,000,000 Commercial Motor Vehicle 50,000,000 Taxicab License Transfer 8,000,000 Liquor License Surcharge 5,000,000 Horse Race Admissions 20,000 Other Refunds 229,000,000 State Tax Relief Program ("STAR") for Personal Income and Real Property Taxes 765,000,000 State Tax Relief Program ("STAR") for Personal Income and Real Property Taxes 765,000,000 Miscellaneous Revenue: 1 Licenses, Franchises, etc. 641,137,294 Interest Income 29,400,000 Charges for Services 947,759,993 Water and Sewer Charges 1,516,466,600 Rental Income 271,070,000 Fines and Forfeitures. 809,816,000 Miscellaneous 554,225,466	Cigarette	48,000,000
Penalty and Interest52,000,000Off-Track Betting1,250,000Off-Track Betting Surtax1,250,000Payments in Lieu of Tax246,200,000Section 1127 (Waiver)130,000,000Beer and Liquor24,000,000Auto Use29,000,000Commercial Motor Vehicle50,000,000Taxicab License Transfer8,000,000Liquor License Surcharge5,000,000Other Refunds20,000,000State Tax Relief Program ("STAR") for Personal Income and Real Property Taxes765,000,000Miscellaneous Revenue:29,000,000Licenses, Franchises, etc.641,137,294Interest Income.29,400,000Charges for Services947,759,993Water and Sewer Charges.1,516,466,600Rental Income.271,070,000Fines and Forfeitures.271,070,000Miscellaneous554,225,466	Hotel Occupancy	539,000,000
Off-Track Betting 0 Off-Track Betting Surtax 1,250,000 Payments in Lieu of Tax 246,200,000 Section 1127 (Waiver) 130,000,000 Beer and Liquor 24,000,000 Auto Use 29,000,000 Commercial Motor Vehicle 50,000,000 Taxicab License Transfer 8,000,000 Liquor License Surcharge 5,000,000 Horse Race Admissions 20,000 Other Refunds 20,000,000 State Tax Relief Program ("STAR") for Personal Income and Real Property Taxes 765,000,000 Vater and Sewer Charges. 641,137,294 Interest Income. 947,759,993 Water and Sewer Charges. 947,759,993 Water and Sewer Charges. 271,070,000 Fines and Forfeitures. 809,816,000 Miscellaneous 554,225,466	Other:	
Off-Track Betting Surtax 1,250,000 Payments in Lieu of Tax 246,200,000 Section 1127 (Waiver) 130,000,000 Beer and Liquor 24,000,000 Auto Use 29,000,000 Commercial Motor Vehicle 50,000,000 Taxicab License Transfer 8,000,000 Liquor License Surcharge 5,000,000 Horse Race Admissions 20,000,000 Other Refunds 22,000,000 State Tax Relief Program ("STAR") for Personal Income and Real Property Taxes. 765,000,000 Miscellaneous Revenue: 641,137,294 Licenses, Franchises, etc. 641,137,294 Interest Income. 29,400,000 Charges for Services. 947,759,993 Water and Sewer Charges. 1,516,4466,600 Rental Income. 271,070,000 Fines and Forfeitures. 809,816,000 Miscellaneous 554,225,466	Penalty and Interest	52,000,000
Payments in Lieu of Tax 246,200,000 Section 1127 (Waiver) 130,000,000 Beer and Liquor 24,000,000 Auto Use 29,000,000 Commercial Motor Vehicle 50,000,000 Taxicab License Transfer 8,000,000 Liquor License Surcharge 5,000,000 Horse Race Admissions 20,000 Other Refunds 20,000 State Tax Relief Program ("STAR") for Personal Income and Real Property Taxes 765,000,000 Miscellaneous Revenue: 121,23,470,000 Licenses, Franchises, etc. 641,137,294 Interest Income. 29,400,000 Charges for Services. 947,759,993 Water and Sewer Charges. 1,516,466,600 Rental Income. 271,070,000 Fines and Forfeitures. 809,816,000 Miscellaneous 554,225,466	Off-Track Betting	0
Section 1127 (Waiver)130,000,000Beer and Liquor24,000,000Auto Use29,000,000Commercial Motor Vehicle50,000,000Taxicab License Transfer8,000,000Liquor License Surcharge5,000,000Horse Race Admissions20,000Other Refunds29,000,000State Tax Relief Program ("STAR") for Personal Income and Real Property Taxes765,000,000Miscellaneous Revenue:29,123,470,000Licenses, Franchises, etc.641,137,294Interest Income29,400,000Charges for Services947,759,993Water and Sewer Charges1,516,466,600Rental Income271,070,000Fines and Forfeitures809,816,000Miscellaneous554,225,466	Off-Track Betting Surtax	1,250,000
Beer and Liquor24,000,000Auto Use29,000,000Commercial Motor Vehicle50,000,000Taxicab License Transfer8,000,000Liquor License Surcharge5,000,000Horse Race Admissions20,000Other Refunds29,000,000State Tax Relief Program ("STAR") for Personal Income and Real Property Taxes765,000,000Miscellaneous Revenue:29,123,470,000Licenses, Franchises, etc.641,137,294Interest Income.29,400,000Charges for Services.947,759,993Water and Sewer Charges.1,516,466,600Rental Income.271,070,000Fines and Forfeitures.809,816,000Miscellaneous.554,225,466	Payments in Lieu of Tax	246,200,000
Auto Use29,000,000Commercial Motor Vehicle50,000,000Taxicab License Transfer8,000,000Liquor License Surcharge5,000,000Horse Race Admissions20,000Other Refunds(29,000,000State Tax Relief Program ("STAR") for Personal Income and Real Property Taxes765,000,000Miscellaneous Revenue:641,137,294Licenses, Franchises, etc.641,137,294Interest Income29,400,000Charges for Services947,759,993Water and Sewer Charges1,516,466,600Rental Income271,070,000Fines and Forfeitures809,816,000Miscellaneous554,225,466	Section 1127 (Waiver)	130,000,000
Commercial Motor Vehicle50,000,000Taxicab License Transfer8,000,000Liquor License Surcharge5,000,000Horse Race Admissions20,000Other Refunds(29,000,000State Tax Relief Program ("STAR") for Personal Income and Real Property Taxes765,000,000Miscellaneous Revenue:(29,000,000Licenses, Franchises, etc.641,137,294Interest Income947,759,993Water and Sewer Charges1,516,466,600Rental Income271,070,000Fines and Forfeitures809,816,000Miscellaneous554,225,466	Beer and Liquor	24,000,000
Taxicab License Transfer8,000,000Liquor License Surcharge5,000,000Horse Race Admissions20,000Other Refunds(29,000,000State Tax Relief Program ("STAR") for Personal Income and Real Property Taxes.765,000,000Miscellaneous Revenue:29,123,470,000Licenses, Franchises, etc.641,137,294Interest Income.29,400,000Charges for Services.947,759,993Water and Sewer Charges.1,516,466,600Rental Income.271,070,000Fines and Forfeitures.809,816,000Miscellaneous.554,225,466	Auto Use	29,000,000
Liquor License Surcharge5,000,000Horse Race Admissions20,000Other Refunds(29,000,000State Tax Relief Program ("STAR") for Personal Income and Real Property Taxes765,000,000Miscellaneous Revenue:29,123,470,000Licenses, Franchises, etc.641,137,294Interest Income.29,400,000Charges for Services.947,759,993Water and Sewer Charges.1,516,466,600Rental Income.271,070,000Fines and Forfeitures.809,816,000Miscellaneous.554,225,466	Commercial Motor Vehicle	50,000,000
Horse Race Admissions20,000Other Refunds(29,000,000State Tax Relief Program ("STAR") for Personal Income and Real Property Taxes765,000,000Miscellaneous Revenue:1000Licenses, Franchises, etc.641,137,294Interest Income.29,400,000Charges for Services.947,759,993Water and Sewer Charges.1,516,466,6000Rental Income.271,070,000Fines and Forfeitures.809,816,000Miscellaneous.554,225,466	Taxicab License Transfer	8,000,000
Other Refunds(29,000,000)State Tax Relief Program ("STAR") for Personal Income and Real Property Taxes.765,000,000Miscellaneous Revenue:29,123,470,000Licenses, Franchises, etc.641,137,294Interest Income.29,400,000Charges for Services.947,759,993Water and Sewer Charges.1,516,466,600Rental Income.271,070,000Fines and Forfeitures.809,816,000Miscellaneous.554,225,466	Liquor License Surcharge	5,000,000
State Tax Relief Program ("STAR") for Personal Income and Real Property Taxes.765.000.000 (29.123.470.000)Miscellaneous Revenue: Licenses, Franchises, etc.641,137,294 (29,400,000)Interest Income.641,137,294 	Horse Race Admissions	20,000
29,123,470,000 Miscellaneous Revenue: Licenses, Franchises, etc	Other Refunds	<u>(29,000,000)</u>
Miscellaneous Revenue:641,137,294Licenses, Franchises, etc.641,137,294Interest Income.29,400,000Charges for Services.947,759,993Water and Sewer Charges.1,516,466,600Rental Income.271,070,000Fines and Forfeitures.809,816,000Miscellaneous.554,225,466	State Tax Relief Program ("STAR") for Personal Income and Real Property Taxes	765,000,000
Licenses, Franchises, etc.641,137,294Interest Income.29,400,000Charges for Services.947,759,993Water and Sewer Charges.1,516,466,600Rental Income.271,070,000Fines and Forfeitures.809,816,000Miscellaneous.554,225,466	Miscellaneous Revenue	29,123,470,000
Interest Income.29,400,000Charges for Services.947,759,993Water and Sewer Charges.1,516,466,600Rental Income.271,070,000Fines and Forfeitures.809,816,000Miscellaneous.554,225,466		641 137 204
Charges for Services. 947,759,993 Water and Sewer Charges. 1,516,466,600 Rental Income. 271,070,000 Fines and Forfeitures. 809,816,000 Miscellaneous. 554,225,466		
Water and Sewer Charges. 1,516,466,600 Rental Income. 271,070,000 Fines and Forfeitures. 809,816,000 Miscellaneous. 554,225,466		
Rental Income		
Fines and Forfeitures	5	
Miscellaneous		
4 769 X75 353		4,769,875,353

EXHIBIT A

ESTIMATED FISCAL YEAR 2016 REVENUE OTHER THAN REAL PROPERTY TAXES Summarizing by Source of Revenue

	Estimate of
Source of Revenue	Revenue
Grants: Federal State Provision for Disallowances	7,145,594,491 12,977,567,860 <u>(15,000,000)</u> 20,108,162,351
Unrestricted State and Federal Aid: N.Y. State Revenue Sharing Other Unrestricted Aid	0 <u>0</u> <u>0</u>
Transfer from Capital Funds	575,637,498
Tax Audit Revenue and Other Initiatives	<u>711,113,519</u>
Tax Program	<u>0</u>
Other Categorical Grants	855,583,364
Amount of Estimated Revenue other than Real Estate Taxes	<u>\$56,143,842,085</u>

FOOTNOTES

(1) Fiscal 2016 administrative expenses of the New York State Financial Control Board ("FCB") and the Office of the State Deputy Comptroller ("OSDC"), the "State Oversight Retention Requirements", have been treated only for accounting and financial reporting purposes of the City as if they were City expenditures. Consequently, the above estimates of General Fund receipts for Fiscal 2016 do not reflect anticipated reductions in amounts to be received by the City from the 4.5 percent sales tax levied in the City (the "City Sales Tax") pursuant to State Oversight Retention Requirements. In fact, the State Oversight Retention Requirements are to be retained by the State from the City Sales Tax and will therefore reduce the funds which are paid to the City from the City Sales Tax. This presentation of State Oversight Retention Requirements (instead of being shown as a reduction in City Sales Tax) has no bearing on the statutory relationship between the City, on the one hand, and the FCB and OSDC, on the other hand.

Exhibit B

PROPERTY TAX ITEMS IN THE RESERVE CONSIDERED OFFSETS TO LEVY FOR PURPOSES OF CONSTITUTIONAL OPERATING LIMIT PROVISIONS

Reserve Item	Estimate
	(in millions)
Property Tax Reductions (Tax Expenditures) Authorized by State Law	
Coop/Condo Abatement	(\$437.0)
STAR Exemption*	(205.0)
J-51	(110.0)
SCRIE/DRIE	(194.9)
Commercial Revitalization Program & Borough Development	(63.1)
Section 626	(22.0)
ICAP Abatement	(10.0)
Solar/Green Roof Abatement	(2.5)
Property Tax Additions (Tax Programs) Authorized by State Law	
Exempt Property Restored	35.2
TOTAL	(\$1,000,3)

FISCAL 2016 RESERVE ESTIMATES

* Although the STAR exemption is authorized by State law and treated as an abatement and included in the property tax reserve, the State reimburses the City for the exact amount of the abatement. However, this is an Expense item and accounted for as a separate allocation of funds.

Source: NY City Office of Management and Budget, FY 2016 Adopted Budget